Critically Evaluating Sources

Areas to consider

- Authority of the author
- *Objectivity* of the author
- Quality of the work
- Background of the publisher
- Currency of the work
- Relevancy of the work

To evaluate authority

Who is the author?

- Common places to find the name of the author:
 - Title page (Books and reports)
 - Top of the first page (articles and book chapters)
 - End of the article (encyclopedias)

What are the author's credentials?

- What to look for:
 - Relevant university degree
 - Do they have a degree in the discipline you are researching?
 - Institutional affiliation
 - Where does he or she work?
 - Relevant field or employment experience
 - Past writings

- Where can you find this information?
 - Examine the item for information about the author
 - Search the web for the author's homepage
 - Search the databases or library's catalog for other sources by the author

What is the author's reputation among his/her peers?

- What to look for:
 - Have they been cited by other works?
 - Were they mentioned in your textbook or by your professor?

- Where to look:
 - Search <u>Google Scholar</u> and use the "cited by…"link.
 - If you find an article in JSTOR you can see other articles that are in JSTOR that cite the article in the "Summary" section

Who is the publisher?

- Questions to ask:
 - Commercial, trade, institutional, other?
 - Basic values or goals?
 - Specialization?

- Where to look:
 - Examine the publisher's website

To evaluate objectivity

Does the author state the goals of the publication?

- Questions to ask:
 - Is the goal to inform, explain, or advocate?
 - Are they selling a service?
 - Does the publication serve as a soapbox?

- Where to look:
 - Skim the foreword, preface, abstract and/or introduction of the work

Does the author exhibit a bias?

- Questions to ask:
 - Does the author acknowledge their bias?
 - Are both sides of a controversial issue presented?

- Where to look:
 - Skim the abstract or introduction, and conclusion
 - Examine the work for
 - Inflammatory language
 - Images or graphics to persuade you to the author's point of view
 - Arguments or supporting facts
 - A bibliography that does or does not include multiple points of view

Does the information appear to be valid and well researched?

- Questions to ask:
 - Are arguments supported by evidence?
 - Are opposing view points addressed?
 - Are authoritative sources cited?

- Where to look:
 - Verify facts
 - Examine cited sources for authority and objectivity

Triangulation-If three sources, that don't cite each other, say the same thing, it is probably correct

To evaluate quality

Is the information well organized?

- What to look for:
 - Logical structure
 - Main points clearly presented
 - Text flows well
 - Argument is not repetitive

- Where to look:
 - Skim the text
 - Look through the table of contents

Did the author use proper grammar?

Check for spelling and grammar errors

To evaluate for currency

When was it published?

- Look at the copyright date
- Usually look for sources from within the last 10 years
- Does the topic require more current information?
 - Science, medicine, current events
 - For these topics only use sources from the last 1-3 years, unless you are looking at a historical perspective
- Has the source been updated? (books)
 - Search the library catalog for the book and click on the "other editions" link

To evaluate relevance

Is the content appropriate for your research topic?

- Is the source scholarly or popular?
- Can you identify the format (e.g., book, article, website, etc.)
- Is the content primary, secondary, or bibliographic?