



STEINERHØYSKOLEN
Rudolf Steiner University College

Master Thesis

The long forgotten topic – the education of the will

Experienced Waldorf class teachers' perceptions, experiences and reflections

By Kristine Upite

November 2020

Master Programme in Waldorf Education

Rudolf Steiner University College, Oslo, Norway

Abstract

“The long forgotten topic – the education of the will: Experienced Waldorf class teachers’ perceptions, experiences and reflections” is a study that has been done in order to explore how the characteristics and expressions of the will have been perceived and understood by experienced Waldorf class teachers. A basic qualitative study methodology, inspired by the hermeneutic-phenomenological approach to the world, was employed to conduct this research. Semi – structured interviews were the overall data collection method used, and the research sample consisted of four experienced Waldorf class teachers representing three countries and four different institutions in order to represent a variety school cultures.

The theoretical perspectives of this research builds on Rudolf Steiner’s lectures to teachers and different scholars and educationalists’ articles, books and research on Waldorf education. In addition, the research brings in the voices of Gert Biesta, Hannah Arendt and other 19th to 21st century educationalists and philosophers in order to build a bridge to the ongoing educational discussion about the development of the will in educational settings.

The main findings of the research highlight the teachers’ own work on themselves and the part they play as role models for their students. They are seen as active co – creators in a child’s ethical relationship to the world. Additionally, teachers see a need for difficulty and resistance in a child’s education and value these aspects as meaningful for the will development. The conceptual framework of this study consist of *three-foldness, rhythms, habits, striving, resistance* and *action*.

For further research the findings suggest to approach the phenomenon of the will through observation in addition to interviews with teachers so an in – depth exploration of what will is and how it manifests in educational settings can take place. I suggest it would also be interesting to do a further research on Waldorf graduates’ perception and understanding of the will and their reflections on their experiences at school regarding the development of the will.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank you, Morten, for being my advisor and your support. Without your help, I would not be able to make meaning out of this work. I truly appreciate your help and you definitely made me dig deeper and grow in the process of writing. Your knowledge and focus brought my ideas down to earth.

I am grateful to my dearest Agnis who always believed that I would do it, even when I was so sure I would not. His smile, calmness, and confidence in me somehow made me feel that I could do it. I want to thank to my mother and my sister, who were always supportive and never got upset that I was not going for a lunch with them. I think they did not hear anything else for quite a long time, but “sorry, I cannot go, I am writing”. They always kept their fingers crossed and I appreciate that.

I would also like to thank my colleague and friend Inga who always asks difficult questions and provokes interesting discussions. She asks such questions that stir up one’s mind and make it busy for a very long time. She calls me in the evening and ask questions that start with “but how is it, really” and these questions would not let me sleep.

I appreciate the opportunity to work in our Waldorf school and I thank to my class pupils and parents with whom I have been together for seven years. You were the main inspiration for this study and I have been learning a lot together with you and from you. I truly appreciate.

I gratefully acknowledge my friend Ida for her valuable suggestions and discussions and Justine for help with proofreading.

Contents

Abstract.....	2
Acknowledgements	3
1. Introduction	6
1.1 Background and context	6
1.2 Personal motivation.....	7
1.3 Purpose statement and research questions	8
1.4 Research approach.....	9
1.5 Contribution of the study	11
1.6 Organization of the thesis	11
2. Literature review.....	13
2.1 Introduction.....	13
2.2 Waldorf pedagogy	13
2.2.1 Historical background of Waldorf education.....	13
2.2.2 Three-foldness of the human soul	15
2.2.3 Unfolding of thinking, feeling and willing during the first three seven year periods of life.....	16
2.2.4 Ways for facilitating the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context 19	
2.2.5 Students as active participants in the learning process.....	22
2.2.6 Teacher's role in facilitating the development of students' will in Waldorf pedagogy	24
2.3 Education of the will in the scholarly debate.....	26
2.3.1 Introduction.....	26
2.3.2 School's duty to resist and school as a place between	27
2.3.3 Experience of resistance in the education of the will.....	30
2.3.4 Hannah Arendt and the Will	33
2.3.5 Agency.....	36
2.4 Conceptual framework	40
2.5 Summary of the literature review	41
3. Methodology	43
3.1 Introduction.....	43
3.2 Rationale for applying the tradition of a basic qualitative study	43
3.3 Research sample and data sources	44
3.3.1 Ethical considerations.....	45
3.4 Data collection methods	45
3.5 Data analysis methods	46
3.6 Issues of trustworthiness.....	47
3.7 Limitations and delimitations	48
3.8 Summary.....	48

4.	Findings.....	50
4.1	Introduction.....	50
4.2	Will and its qualities as perceived by the teachers and their ways for relating to it in an educational context	51
4.3	Educator's role in facilitating the development of the will as perceived by the teachers	53
4.3.1	Being a worthwhile example	53
4.3.2	Establishing good relationship with students.....	55
4.3.3	Helping acquiring healthy habits, rhythm and work ethics	57
4.3.4	Giving more responsibility to students.....	59
4.3.5	Working with pupils in a threefold way	61
4.4	Ways for facilitating the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context	63
4.5	Challenges in the education of the will as perceived by the teachers	66
4.5.1	Modern technology, media and gaming	66
4.5.2	Adults around and the system.....	67
4.5.3	Childhood and rhythms at home	68
4.6	Summary.....	69
5.	Discussion	71
5.1	Introduction.....	71
5.2	Characteristics and expressions of the will.....	71
5.3	Teachers' role in facilitating the development of the will	75
5.3.1	Teacher as a role model and guide through difficulty.....	75
5.3.2	Helping to develop healthy rhythms, habits and work ethics	78
5.3.3	Giving students more responsibility.....	80
5.3.4	Facilitating students' active participation.....	83
5.3.5	Staging encounters with what resists.....	84
5.4	Ways and possibilities for facilitating the development of the will in educational settings	86
5.5	Challenges in the education of the will.....	90
6.	Conclusions	93
7.	Sources	98

1. Introduction

The purpose of this study is to explore how the characteristics and expressions of the will have been understood in a Waldorf educational context and how experienced Waldorf class teachers view the possibilities for facilitating the development of the adolescents' will in Waldorf educational settings. It was anticipated that the knowledge generated in this study would offer possibilities to deepen and develop Waldorf educational practice regarding facilitating the development of adolescents' will and build a bridge to the ongoing educational discussion about the development of the will in educational settings (sometimes called as the education of the will). The research employed a basic qualitative study methodology to obtain a deep understanding of how the will is viewed from the perspective of experienced Waldorf class teachers. Participants of this study included a purposefully selected group of four experienced Waldorf class teachers who have a minimum of ten-year experience of teaching in a Waldorf school.

This chapter consists of an overview of the background and context that frames the study. Then, I explain my choice of topic and proceed with the statement of purpose and the research questions of the study. Also included in this chapter is an insight into the research approach and possible limitations of the study. Lastly, the contribution of this study is briefly discussed.

1.1 Background and context

According to Arendt, the will is a phenomenon that cannot be explained by theoretical descriptions, which have lost the sight of "experiences". In other words, she is critical about philosophers subordinating the will to reason, for willing is an autonomous mental capacity, rooted in the experience in the world. It has an autonomous and active nature (Jacobitti, 1988). As Arendt (1998) explains, the will is connected to the ability to act, and acting is social, for it is always done by someone and influences the surrounding environment. The will, in Arendt's (1998) view, means to begin something, to take initiative and to do it. She further explains that the will is what enables free action. Therefore, human beings' freedom to choose their projects and to initiate change in the world stems from the will, with reference to Arendt (1971).

Biesta (2012b) states that the education of the will is a rather forgotten educational theme that should be brought back to the educational discussion. Biesta (2012b), like Arendt (1971),

points to how the will is as we as human beings come into contact with the world. In an educational setting, Biesta (2012b) also emphasizes that what is at stake is the development of a healthy relationship between the child and the world. The concept of the will was in the educational discussion at the end of the 19th and at the beginning of the 20th century but it has gradually disappeared (Biesta, 2012b). Sockett (1988), who is among the most recent researchers to investigate the will in relation to education, is concerned that schools do not pay enough attention to the development of the qualities of the will. According to Sockett (1998), the notion of effort and striving are at heart of the qualities of the will and they manifest as “habits or character traits or virtues” that “provide students with a major resource for the achievement of goals in socially acceptable ways” (p. 207). Sockett (1998) emphasizes the importance of facilitating the development of qualities of the will in educational settings, for they equip children with abilities to face difficulties in life and achieve their goals in socially acceptable ways. Biesta (2012b) points that nowadays Waldorf education is among few school concepts that still discusses and gives attention to the education of the will.

The Waldorf curriculum established by Rudolf Steiner in 1918 invites teachers and parents to foster a three-fold development of the human being; the development of thinking, willing and feeling (Mathisen, 2015). The development of the will, according to Steiner, is an inseparable and significant part of children’s holistic development that can be fostered by pedagogical and methodological approaches (Dahlin, 2017). Steiner saw the task of education as the development of the will and the feeling, for they help to gradually awaken the intellectual capacities. In other words, education of the will and of the feeling life is the salient point of the Waldorf curriculum in order to awaken the thinking capacities of children (Dahlin, 2017; Wiechert, 2009). The will in Waldorf education is always seen in relationship with thinking and feeling, which are regarded as the qualities of the soul (Dahlin, 2017; Staley, 2009). Therefore, this three-foldness of feeling, thinking and willing has become the central concept and idea of this study.

1.2 Personal motivation

Rudolf Steiner has pointed that “the thing we can accomplish best in our teaching is the education of the will, and part of the education of the feeling life” (Steiner, in Wiechert, 2009). As a class teacher, I have been curious about what the education of the will entails and how the development of children’s will can be facilitated in a Waldorf educational context.

I started my journey in Waldorf education 8 years ago. Parallel to my studies in the University of Latvia (to become an English as a Foreign Language teacher), I got the opportunity to do an internship in a Waldorf school. At the same as I was visiting the school and observing lessons, I became acquainted with Rudolf Steiner's lectures to teachers. Since then, the will has been a phenomenon that I am curious about and my interest has gradually grown into a research project. As a researcher, I am interested in how teachers understand the will and how they relate to it in their educational settings. How do they perceive it? How do they experience it in their students? How do they work with it? What meaning do they attribute to their experiences?

The research focuses on adolescents, as I am currently the class teacher for the 11th grade in our school. I have been with this class since they were in the 5th grade so this is the 7th year I am together with them. Being with them and observing how they grow up and enter the adolescence has been a great inspiration to do my research project.

1.3 Purpose statement and research questions

Socket (1998) states that there is still a lot of research needed with regards to will and personal capability. He raises the question of how we as educators "can assist children to develop a fabric of personal capability, a strength of will, to deploy as they face up to difficulties in life?" (p. 213). The Waldorf curriculum takes this question seriously (Dahlin, 2017; Wember, 2015).

Embedded in the Waldorf ethos is the understanding of the child as a whole, and the aim of the pedagogy is to facilitate for a healthy development of the feeling life, thinking, and the will (Mathisen, 2015). There seems little doubt that development of thinking is taken very seriously in any educational institution. The development of a child's feeling life can seem more difficult to grasp, yet most educational settings facilitate for some kind of art- in the form of poetry, plays or music (Wember, 2015). How to consciously work on the will however, is not easily understood, or readily discussed (Sokkett, 1998; Biesta, 2012b). Yet, in Waldorf schools around the world teachers' will recognize and nod approvingly when the topic of how to engage the will comes up. The aim of this study therefore, will be to explore how the characteristics and expressions of the will have been understood in a Waldorf educational context. Secondly, I wish to investigate how experienced Waldorf class teachers

view the possibilities for facilitating the development of the adolescents' will in Waldorf educational settings. In order to reach the aim, I designed the following research questions:

- i. How can experienced Waldorf class teachers' reflections on the development of the will in adolescents in classes 9 to 12 be described, interpreted, and understood?
- ii. How do experienced Waldorf class teachers perceive and understand the will in their educational settings?
- iii. How do experienced Waldorf class teachers perceive and understand the educator's role in facilitating the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context?
- iv. What challenges regarding the development of the will in adolescents do practised Waldorf class teachers' experience?

1.4 Research approach

In order to shed light on my research questions, I chose to conduct a basic qualitative study. According to Merriam (2009), in a basic qualitative study meaning is constructed, not discovered and researchers who choose this approach are interested "in (1) how people interpret their experiences, (2) how they construct their worlds, and (3) what meaning they attribute to their experiences" (p. 22). With reference to Savin – Baden and Major (2013), in qualitative studies, researchers "acknowledge multiple constructed realities", and it is often believed that "individuals have different perceptions of reality and that at least to some degree they construct realities" (p. 13). Researchers seek to understand the meanings that individuals attribute to events, concepts and situations. This basic qualitative study seeks to understand how teachers perceive a Waldorf educational concept - the will - and how they relate to it in their educational settings.

The theoretical perspectives of this research builds on Rudolf Steiner's lectures to teachers and different scholars and educationalists' articles, books and research on Waldorf education (e.g. Dahlin, 2017; Mathisen, 2015; Schieren, 2012). As mentioned earlier, the will in Waldorf education is regarded as one of the three functions of the soul – thinking, willing and feeling –, which are interconnected and intertwine continuously. Rudolf Steiner believed that education should primarily work with the development of the will and the feeling life, which then would gradually help to develop thinking capacities (Steiner, 1996b). This study seeks to

build a bridge to the ongoing educational discussion about the development of the will in educational settings and therefore looks at the development of the will in the views of different 19th to 21st century educationalists and philosophers. Arendt's (1998) concept of action, Sockett's (1998) concept of striving and Dewey's (2012) concept of habits, and Biesta's (2012b, 2015a) concept of resistance have become important parts of the conceptual framework of this study. Additionally, the three-foldness and rhythms are Waldorf educational concepts that help to frame this study; they are described in detail in the section *Conceptual framework* following the literature chapter.

Main limitation of the thesis

Dahlin (2017) explains the difficulties in carrying out an empirical research on Waldorf education. He states that “results such as ‘individuality’ and ‘freedom’ are hard to measure in a reliable way” (p. 125). This is also the case of my study. The phenomenon I seek to explore within this study is the will, which, according to Steiner (1997) is one of the soul functions. Because it is always seen in connection to thinking and feeling, the main limitation is that it is not possible to separate and measure the development of the will in a reliable way regarding curricular activities. Additionally, it is a complex concept that has no clear “final” definition and it has different characteristics and expressions (Dahlin, 2017). Therefore, the will in this is going to be highlighted as a phenomenon inspired by the hermeneutic-phenomenological approach to the world. In other words, the goal of research is not to capture and define the will, but to open it up by describing and interpreting it, and trying to understand “what is the nature of this phenomenon as an essentially human experience” (van Manen, 2016a, p. 62).

In order to study the will in this thesis, it has been conceptualized as a phenomenon that is always in connection to the thinking and the feeling (Steiner, 1996b). It is central to free action and ability to act, as suggested by Arendt (1998). Effort and striving are seen as qualities of the will and they, with reference to Sockett (1988), are believed to manifest as “habits or character traits or virtues” that “provide students with a major resource for the achievement of goals in socially acceptable ways”. The will is seen in relation to action and social relationship as it has been operationalized in this thesis.

1.5 Contribution of the study

I anticipate that the knowledge generated in this study will shed light on new insights and nuances regarding the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context and will be exciting and inspiring for practising Waldorf teachers and Waldorf community in general. Meanwhile, the study aims to contribute in building a bridge to the ongoing educational discussion about the development of the will in educational settings, as suggested by Biesta (2012b) and Sockett (1988) and invite for further research on the will in a Waldorf educational context.

1.6 Organization of the thesis

The literature review of this study is divided in two parts. First, I look at the development of adolescents' will in relation to Waldorf education. Three-foldness becomes the central concept in this part. Second, I explore how different scholars and philosophers, such as Hannah Arendt, John Dewey, Hugh Sockett and Gert Biesta reflect on the will in educational context.

The conceptual framework of this study follows the literature review. It introduces the key concepts that origin in the literature reviewed.

Further, the research methodology applied to this study is discussed. In the methodology chapter, I introduce the rationale for choosing a basic qualitative study. The chapter reflects on research setting and context, explains the research sample and pays attention to semi-structured interview as the overall research method. Then, it discusses the data analysis methods used. Lastly, it deals with issues of trustworthiness, limitations and delimitations of my study.

The findings chapter introduces the data gathered during my interviews with four experienced Waldorf class teachers who represent different school cultures, for they come from three different countries and four different institutions.

The discussion chapter creates a dialogue between the literature reviewed and findings and is scaffold by the conceptual framework. It aims to answer the research questions and to bring the discussion about the development of the will in educational contexts further.

Within the conclusion chapter, I wrap up my findings and offer my interpretation to answer the research questions. I acknowledge the limitations of my study and suggest aspects for further research regarding the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context.

2. Literature review

2.1 Introduction

Rudolf Steiner, the founder of anthroposophy and Waldorf pedagogy, called for education that empowers a person in three ways: developed thinking, deepened feeling and the greatest possible energy and capacity of will (Steiner, 1997). As Wember (2015) explains, Rudolf Steiner designed a curriculum that addresses knowledge in a balanced way. He reached that in two ways. First, he divided the schedule giving cognitive subjects, artistic subjects and subjects involving movement equal importance. Second, the teaching method takes into account pupils' feeling system and will. With reference to Schieren (2012), the development of children's will is of paramount importance in Waldorf education.

With my thesis, I aim to explore how the characteristics and expressions of the will have been understood in a Waldorf educational context and how experienced Waldorf class teachers view the possibilities for facilitating the development of the adolescents' will in Waldorf educational settings. Therefore, the first part of the literature chapter looks at the development of the will from the perspective of Waldorf education. The ideas presented in this part origin in Steiner's lectures to teachers and different scholars and educationalists' articles and research on Waldorf education. The three functions of the soul – thinking, willing and feeling – are the focus.

Within the second chapter of the literature review, I explore how different scholars, such as Gert Biesta, Hugh Sockett, Hannah Arendt and John Dewey reflect on the education of the will. Arendt, Dewey and Steiner were contemporaries in whose work on education the will has a central role. As both a teacher and a researcher, I have been interested in building a bridge to the ongoing educational discussion about the development of the will in educational settings and looking for possibilities to deepen and develop Waldorf educational practice regarding facilitating the development of adolescents' will.

2.2 Waldorf pedagogy

2.2.1 Historical background of Waldorf education

Waldorf education was founded during the time of great despair for many nations. Economic, political and social chaos was threatening the German nation after it was defeated at war.

Rudolf Steiner (1861-1925), an Austrian scientist and thinker, introduced the need for social renewal, for a new way of organizing society and its political and cultural life (“Association of Waldorf Schools of North America”, 2020). Rudolf Steiner saw education as a force for social change (Dahlin, 2017; Mathisen, 2014).

Steiner’s idea was that the society changes so education should not adjust students to the society of a particular time or train for a specific profession. In other words, what pupils need to achieve is the ability to face different challenges in their life, be courageous, independent and innovative. Meanwhile, a person should base his or her decisions and actions on a deeply rooted ethical foundation. Pupils can contribute to the development of the society by bringing something new and fresh, if they are not asked to repeat everything that is present already (Mathisen, 2014).

The Waldorf curriculum established by Rudolf Steiner in 1918 invites teachers and parents to foster a three-fold development of a human being; the development of thinking, willing and feeling. In other words, not only Waldorf education aims to nurture the intellectual capacities of a child, but also pays attention to a child’s feeling life and willing forces. One might see similarities with the ideas of the Swiss pedagogue Johan Heinrich Pestalozzi whom the world knows for “learning by head, hand and heart” (Mathisen, 2015, p. 1).

Rudolf Steiner might be considered a “progressivist” because he also supported that education should bring social change. What was a characteristic to progressivism in the USA and Europe (*Reformpädagogik* in Germany) was the view that mainstream education is too one sided and focuses on the development of pupils’ head only as well as does not understand development of the child and does not take into account the child’s needs and interests (Dahlin, 2017). According to Thomas (2013), there have been controversies about the aim of education already since the time of Aristotle. The question has always remained – should education be about the development of intellect and learning facts or encouragement of thinking.

Thomas (2013) explains that formal education is about transmission of knowledge and information that have to be “handed on to new generations” (Thomas, 2013, p. 25). Thus, education becomes the process of transmission and teaching is at the heart of this process. While formal education achieves its goals by instruction, learning facts, ideas, traditions and rules, progressive education invites children to learn by problem solving through activity,

discovery and play. Formal education aims to equip the child with skills and knowledge necessary for life, but progressive education aims to teach the pupil to think and to be independent. Children's need freedom is what progressivists take into account while formalists believe they need structure (Thomas, 2013).

With reference to Ensign (1996), John Dewey and Rudolf Steiner begun profound worldwide educational approaches: Progressive education and Waldorf education. What is in common for the two authors, according to Ensign (1996), is that they both aimed for an integrated view of education that would recognize the whole child. Dahlin (2017) points to another similarity in their educational thought -learning through active participation, both, physical (outward action) and intellectual (the activities of thinking and reflection).

As Dahlin (2017) explains, Steiner agreed to the ideas of progressive education on the surface level. For Steiner education was not imaginable without the understanding of spiritual educational anthropology, and he was critical to most forms of *Reformpädagogik*, because they, for Steiner, seemed to lack a deeper understanding of the nature of children's development (Dahlin, 2017). Ensign (1996) may add to this discussion that Steiner saw the individual and society as a part of the larger spiritual world, and he viewed the development of the child as a gradual spiritual unfolding. Although spiritual realities were not primarily a part of Dewey's educational ideas, with reference to Dahlin (2017), he definitely did not deny their presence as he refers to soul and spirit in his writings.

The source for Rudolf Steiner's pedagogical ideas is anthroposophy, which, according to Dahlin (2017), can be described as "a philosophical anthropology based on the reality of the spiritual world. It is a wisdom (sophia) of the human being (anthropos)" (p. 50). Bringing the intellect in harmony with spiritual knowledge for Steiner was the natural task of present-day humanity. This chapter proceeds with providing an insight of how the development of the child is seen from the perspective of Waldorf education, which has its roots in anthroposophy. Education of the will, according to Steiner, is an inseparable and significant part of children's holistic development that can be fostered by pedagogical and methodological approaches (Dahlin, 2017).

2.2.2 Three-foldness of the human soul

According to Steiner (1995), a human being connects to the world in a threefold way – through body, spirit and soul. Thus, the world appears to us in a threefold manner. The body

relates to the physical existence of something that we can observe it in the environment, for example, wildflowers. The soul relates to how we connect these experiences to our existence and what emotions we experience, be it joy, pleasure, sorrow or dislike. The spirit world is a higher world that reveals itself to the human being. One can understand the true nature of a human being only when looking at these three sides (Steiner, 1995).

Further, the human soul has a threefold function - thinking, willing and feeling (Steiner, 1995). One receives information from the world that works outside of oneself and, in addition to that, one creates one's feelings, one's inner world. As a result, one's will comes into play. Steiner maintains about the will:

Our will, through which we work back upon the outside world, leaving the imprint of our own inner being on it. In will activity, the soul flows outward, in a sense. The fact that our actions bear the stamp of our inner life distinguishes them from natural events taking place in the outer world. In this way, the soul sets itself up as something personal and private in contrast to the world outside. It receives stimuli from the outer world, but constructs an inner private world in accordance with them. Bodily existence becomes the basis for soul existence. (Steiner, 1995, p. 29)

To sum up, because of the interplay between one's bodily world and soul world, the human will reveals its presence. One might understand the will as an answer to the outside world, which comes from our inner being and feelings. A feeling and will are closely related. Steiner (1996b) explains: "Will is only feeling made active and feeling is repressed will. That part of will that we do not completely express and that remains in the soul is feeling; feeling is blunted will" (p. 84). In other words, the soul world receives an impulse from the outer world, and, in accordance, creates an intimate inner world – feelings, which transform into the will and, therefore, work back upon the outside world. According to Steiner, thinking, feeling and willing intertwine continuously. Further, this chapter explores how the three soul functions unfold in the human being from birth to adolescence and serves as an introduction for understanding how Waldorf education addresses the concept of the will.

2.2.3 Unfolding of thinking, feeling and willing during the first three seven year periods of life

In Waldorf education, teachers view the child's development until the age of twenty-one in three seven-year cycles and each cycle focuses on a different soul function (Steiner, 1996b). In order to understand the central function of the first, second and third period of seven years, it is important to note that thinking, willing and feeling are each connected to a different

aspect of the physical body. Thinking is connected to the brain and the nervous system; feeling to the heart and the lungs (the rhythmic system); and will to the limbs and digestion. As Dahlin (2017) explains, education of the will starts as soon as the child enters this world and is of primary importance.

During the first period of seven years – until the time of change of teeth – children learn the world through physical and sensory activity. They try to imitate everything they see, they absorb everything and digest it through play. The primary focus of the first seven years is developing the will and maturing the constitution of the body (Mathisen, 2014). The little child's devotedness to imitation reflects the life of the will. Steiner (as cited in Dahlin, 2017, p. 64) calls it even a "religious devotedness". When children enter the second cycle, when they are seven years old, their limb-man is finely developed. They exhibit natural joy in movement and it may result with a great capacity of will and energy. On the contrary, it may result with the proneness on distraction and increased restlessness (Roh, 2009).

The focus shifts towards the development of the feeling life during the second period of seven years. At this point, the child's feelings are the primary way of experiencing the world (Steiner, 1996a). Learning takes place through good and trusting relationships between pupils and teachers (Mathisen, 2014). Feelings are addressed through practice and artistic experiences. Children are not ready to form their own judgement yet. Meanwhile, they long for the safe environment, which an authority (teacher) can provide. One can say, perhaps, that while the intelligence of the pre-school child first awakens in the physical life of the child, the intelligence of the child in primary school now awakens mainly in the life of feelings (Steiner, 1996a).

After puberty, children are ready to begin to communicate to the world through their own judgement (Steiner, 1966c). Pupils' own judgement becomes the focus of teaching. It is the work with the life of the will and feeling that has awakened their cognitive abilities. A more analytical thinking is present and the adolescent questions the world, discusses causes, effects, and does not accept everything the teacher offers in the same way as earlier. Teaching is oriented towards developing a sustainable and loving relationship between the child and the world (Dahlin, 2017; Mathisen, 2014).

One may ask why the cognitive abilities come so late in the curriculum, but everything has its own time. Wiechert (2009) explains that there is a strong conviction in the society that

learning primarily concerns the head, and that the rest of children's abilities develop in accordance. He points out that it is a top – down approach, meanwhile, Steiner looks at the development of a human being from the opposite direction. During the first two seven year periods of life Waldorf education is primarily concerned with the development of the will and the feeling, from which the capacities of the head can awaken during the third period of seven years.

Waldorf education takes care that pupils are not asked to develop their analytical skills when they are not ready yet (before the third period of seven years). In his lectures, Steiner draws teachers' attention to the harmful effects of asking children to form their own judgement too early. From Steiner's point of view, it may result with adults that will not base their judgements on impartiality and objective observation, but other factors that are linked with their body, for example, their temperament (Dahlin, 2017).

Accordingly, Wember (2015) stresses that our actions often stem from our feeling life. Furthermore, there are cases in life when our feelings play a bigger role than our intelligence. Often problems between people occur not because there is a lack of intelligence but due to emotional blockades or deficiencies. He gives a simple example of a mathematics teacher who has difficulties to explain the material to his students. "Not uncommonly he is too smart. The problem arises through him not being able to feel how students tick (p. 31)," Wember (2015) explains. Probably, there is a lack of empathy, and, unless the teacher is able to step into the students' shoes with his feelings, he will not be able to share his knowledge and use his intelligence. To sum up, Wember (2015) states that feeling life must not be underestimated during pupils' years of education in order to enable them to solve both social and technical issues when they grow up. Feeling life influences people's ability to act, and our feelings transform into the will.

Mathisen (2015) explains the idea of the balance of thinking, feeling and willing further:

It can be said that the foundation for learning and development lies in act of will related to emotional experience, which subsequently is connected to intellectual learning. The way in which teaching engages the will and the emotions forms a basis for the later development of independent judgement and the acquisition of theoretical knowledge. (p. 2)

What Mathisen (2015) clarifies is that the development of thinking, forming judgement and acquiring theoretical knowledge bases on the engagement of will and feeling life during the

learning process. Working with students' will and relating to their feeling life results with intellectual learning. The three qualities must be looked upon as a whole: "Adolescents need an ability, rooted in their own minds, to think: that is a thinking ability connected to their own emotions and powers to act" (Mathisen, p. 15).

In conclusion, this sub – chapter has provided an insight of how each of the three soul functions relate to different parts of the physical body and how they unfold during the course of first three periods of seven years. Education of the will and of the feeling is the salient point of the curriculum in order to awaken the thinking capacities of children. The child's early exposure to tasks for the head and request to form a personal judgement before they are ready has a harmful effect on their ability to judge objectively in their adult life. Although the education of the will is the focus during the first period of seven years, it does not lose its importance during puberty and adolescence. The following part of the chapter *Ways for facilitating the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context* explores pedagogical and methodological approaches that Waldorf education applies regarding the development of the will. Regarding my research question, the focus is on adolescence, but in order to have a more comprehensive view, it is impossible to avoid touching upon first two periods of seven years.

2.2.4 Ways for facilitating the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context

Rhythms and habits

Developing healthy rhythms and habits in teaching and learning is one of the pedagogical tools of Waldorf education in order to support pupils' inner strength and will. It was Steiner's confidence that children's will develops through conscious and unconscious repetition and that a repetitive activity strongly affects one's will. What he suggested was giving children a task that they should repeat every day, even for the whole school year some times (Steiner, 1996b).

Mathisen (2015) further explains that rhythm is a living organism that educates children for freedom. It interweaves every part of curriculum and is the heart of the pedagogical and methodological approach. The human constitution has its rhythms and age appropriate teaching can work with them in a healthy way. Letting children breathe in and out and not occupy them with early intellectualization is a part of the rhythm. Rhythms of humour and seriousness. Rhythms of learning and rhythms of sleeping as well as rhythms in arts. Steiner

has pointed that if teachers engage pupils in the learning process in an artistic way, it results with students not getting tired.

On the contrary, discontinuous experiences result with the weakening of one's inner strength and points to the healing influence of things becoming a habit. Steiner explains:

Earlier, more patriarchal education used this fact. Things became simply a matter of habit. In all such things done in this manner lies something quite good pedagogically. For instance, why did people say the Lord's Prayer every day? Were people today asked to read the same story every day, they would refuse because it would be much too boring. Modern people have been trained for one-time experiences. Earlier people not only prayed the same prayer every day, but they also had a storybook that they read at least once every week. Thus they also had much stronger wills than those people who undergo modern education. (Steiner, 1996b, p. 98)

In other words, Steiner explains that repetition and tradition creates a strong rhythm, which exercises people's will. Therefore, there lies something pedagogically beneficial in creating habits in education. Meanwhile, discontinuous experiences lead the will to weaken, which, with reference to Steiner, may cause people an inner struggle.

The Waldorf curriculum implements rhythms of human nature and rhythms of learning and sleep in teaching methodology (Dahlin, 2017; Mathisen, 2015). Steiner believed that children at night "experience something that can only be experienced during sleep, and everything you taught the children participates in the experience" (Steiner, 1996, as cited in Mathisen, 2015). Steiner's idea might be understood as that it is fruitful to teach a subject day by day for a longer period so the children have the experience of "learning" at night between the lessons. In Waldorf education, as Mathisen (2015) explains, "what is taught one day is as a rule continued in specific ways on the following day, targeting new aspects of learning after sleep" (p. 56).

Therefore, teaching takes place in a system of blocks, which lengths varies from two to five weeks. Every school day begins with a longer lesson (90 to 120 minutes long). It is known as "the main lesson" and it is devoted to a specific topic. It means that a class together with their teacher are deeply immersed in one subject day by day for a longer period. Thus, the methodological approach takes into account the fruits of the night – the learning experiences that children work upon unconsciously over the night (Mathisen, 2015). Meanwhile, as Wember (2015) explains, the schedule is not fragmented and it does not turn into a breathless running from a subject to subject.

The rhythm of the day is threefold. It begins with theoretical subject; the main focus of an intellectual activity takes place during the morning – during the main lesson. Then lessons that focus on repetition and practice of skills follow and subjects involving physical activity as well as exercising children's will conclude the day. The schools try to arrange languages and mathematics, as subjects that need regular practice and repetition, in the middle of the day but physical education and handcrafts at the end of the day (Dahlin, 2017; Mathisen, 2015).

In summary, this part of the chapter has looked at the role of rhythms in Waldorf education that serve as a way for developing one's will and also for having a healthy teaching and learning process. For arts and artistic element in Waldorf education is of primary importance in the daily rhythm (Dahlin, 2017; Mathisen, 2015; Staley, 2009), the next part of the chapter looks upon the artistic element as a way for facilitating the development of one's will.

Artistic activities

Art and artistic activities permeate most aspects of Waldorf education, and Steiner (2009) believed that art strongly influences the formation of the will for it has regular practice and rhythm in it and the joy and enthusiasm the artistic activities bring to people. Further, the right intensity of artistic work leads to awakening intellectual capacities. Steiner explains:

If, when one has gripped a the child's attention with art-work, one can then let the intellectual disposition emerge, then the artistic activity has the correct intensity, so to influence the body that it doesn't become too strong, but is correctly consolidated. You, in fact, impair a child's growth if he is too intellectualized. On the other hand, however, you set the child's growth free if you let him glide over from artistic activity to intellectual activity. (Steiner, as cited in Roh, 2009, p. 23)

In summary, Steiner believes that if education lets children have a smooth transition from artistic activity to intellectual activity, their growth is set free; meanwhile, their forces of will are addressed.

In Waldorf education, art is welcomed in teaching of all the subjects, be it foreign languages, biology or mathematics, teacher education, teachers' meetings, school architecture and social relations of the school. Waldorf curriculum appreciates art in its own unique intrinsic value as well as perceives it as a companion in teaching and learning. Art is a way for deepening experiences, knowledge and understanding of any field and subject (Mathisen, 2014).

The artistic activities differ according to pupils' age. In primary school, the class teacher initiates the day by inviting children to sing, play the recorder, move or recite. Artistic

instruction accompanies theoretical subjects in all ages. In addition to that, art and handcraft subjects occupy a great part in the Waldorf curriculum from the first to the last year of education. Pupils work with such subjects as music, painting, drama, eurythmy, drawing modelling and different handcrafts. They get to know different materials by doing leatherwork, glasswork, woodwork, sculpting, stone forging and metalwork. It is believed that artistically inspired ways of working aids both teaching and learning (Mathisen, 2014; Rawson, 2020; Stehlik, 2008).

In summary, art and aesthetic experiences in Waldorf education is like a thread that goes through all methods both in primary and secondary education. It was discussed earlier that education of the will and of the feeling is of primary importance in the curriculum in order to awaken the thinking capacities of children. It can be concluded that the artistic element, through the rhythms of regular practice (which works on one's will) and the joy and enthusiasm that it brings (feeling life), supports a holistic development of the child.

2.2.5 Students as active participants in the learning process

One of the principles in Waldorf education is self-education. Therefore, teachers are there to "provide as good an environment as possible for children to learn and develop by their own activity" (Steiner, as cited in Dahlin, 2007, p. 89). Educators do not teach the students directly, but they bring the possibility to experience the world. The teacher becomes a link between the school, the child and the world, meanwhile, children – active participants in developing their relationship to the world. A lot of focus is put on practical activity so children can experience the world themselves (Dahlin, 2007).

Further, according to Steiner, teachers should not offer children readymade representations of reality, but involve them in the process of constructing their own reality instead. If school lessons solely focus upon "the reception and reproduction from memory of contents that have the character of representations, this will have the effect of reinforcing in experience the separation of mind and the world" (Schieren, 2012, p. 66). Similarly, Rawson (2020) refers to alienating and estranging learning experiences.

If children cannot experience the fruits of their activity (something that is truly meaningful for them) and satisfy their learning interests and needs, alienation occurs. It mostly happens when pupils feel that they learn because of an 'outer system', not because of their own interest.

Formal schooling often asks students to learn prescribed facts and reach pre-defined learning

goals, which can be measured by tests and exams. These type of experiences are not agentic, because they are often more about results and statistics than about the process, and that does not contribute to helping adolescents to develop a healthy relationship with the world. (Rawson, 2020).

Practical work is a great part of the Waldorf curriculum for adolescents. According to Steiner, education must provide everything necessary for the real life. When entering the third period of seven years, “the human being must be led directly to all that touches us most vitally in the life of the current time” (Steiner, as cited in Staley, 2009, p. 36). It means that students learn everything connected with trade, industry, agriculture, farming, commerce, forestry, also such subjects as world affairs, but always in relation to human being and the current time (Staley, 2009). Teachers often hold their lessons in expert places, for example, laboratories, different workshops, sports halls, drama and music studios and other sites of practice. In addition, students take part in different internships, such as biodynamic farming, social work, forestry and production work. Hence, they actively participate in learning about the world (Rawson, 2020).

A small-scale practitioner study about students that were in their final year of a Waldorf school in Germany was carried out. The study found out that the young people interviewed associated most significant learning experiences and experiences of personal development with non-formal learning situations, for instance, theatre productions, internships and different projects in the class community. One of the conclusions of the study are that joining authentic practices, boundary crossings and challenging identities may provide encounters with others as well as discontinuity and interruption. Such learning is meaningful for young people who are searching for their role in the world and trying to create a sustainable relationship with it. The study concluded that involving the person physically and mentally leads to a high intensity of engagement, which cannot be achieved in academic subjects in the class (Rawson, 2020).

To summarize, the Waldorf curriculum for the secondary school focuses on creating a relationship between the world and young people through real life and authentic experiences (Rawson, 2020). Pupils learn about farming, trade, industry and other subjects that are important in order to understand the world through practical experiences (Staley, 2009). In order to address one’s will, learning must be meaningful for students and they have to be

active participants in their learning process both mentally and physically. Authentic experiences often involve crisis and encountering difficulties, which is a significant and transformative learning experience. Teachers are there for the students to provide them with opportunities to experience the world and learn by their own activity (Rawson, 2020; Schieren, 2012).

2.2.6 Teacher's role in facilitating the development of students' will in Waldorf pedagogy

“Human beings of initiative, human beings interested in the world, human beings who seek the truth, human beings who will not sour (Steiner, 2000, p. 20)” are the qualities that a healthy and inspired teacher, according to Steiner, should have. Waldorf education wants to foster these qualities in human beings in general. Teachers share a lot of responsibility regarding the learning process and children's development in the Waldorf curriculum (Dahlin, 2017). This sub-chapter looks upon the teacher's role in educating their pupil's will in Waldorf education.

To develop the whole human being (thinking, willing and feeling), teachers need to be passionate about their subject and study it in such a way that they can bring artistic element to their lessons, instead of working merely with facts and memory (Dahlin, 2017). It is further explained that teachers' ability to enliven artistic element in their lessons, be it math, foreign language studies, history or any other subject, bring joy and enthusiasm to the children as well as strongly influences the formation of the will.

In accordance, the teacher's relation and attitude to the subject influences students' encounter with the subject as well as with the teacher. Larsson & Dahlin (2016) maintain:

Students more or less subconsciously experience the teacher's personal relation to the knowledge they endeavor to transmit. If this relation is authentic, i.e., if the teacher has engaged themselves in a personal and responsible way with the knowledge they are teaching, the student may have a deeply personal encounter with both the teacher and the knowledge. (p. 12)

Larsson&Dahlin (2016) explain that the way the teacher engages to his or her subject subconsciously influences the way students develop relation with both the teacher and the subject.

Steiner (2009) further explains that, in order to be able to have a fruitful relationship to the world and have freedom in doing one's work, people must understand the time they live in

and be aware of the dominant ideas. Teachers must be open and interested in everything that is happening in the society, politics and culture. They should bring the world they find around them into the classroom in an appropriate way for the age and needs of the children.

Meanwhile, developing a relationship between the teacher and students is of importance. The teacher's personhood and the feelings that students have for their teacher have an impact on their learning largely. As Steiner have stated, teachers should have "the heart, mind and temperament for gradually establishing a relationship between themselves and their students" (Steiner, as cited in Dahlin, 2017, p. 110).

Schieren (2012) points that Steiner, in his lectures to teachers, emphasized the primary importance of facilitating the development of the will, which in this context relates to students' active participation in the formation of dispositions and conditions and constructing reality. Schieren (2012) maintains:

Only insofar as teaching style is not restricted to conveying contents of this kind alone, but takes account of the individual mind's active contribution to the formation of representations and makes practical, didactic use of it, will the mind's participation in the construction of reality enter into experience. This leads to an essentially monistic form of awareness, which experiences itself as not separated from the phenomena, but involved, both epistemologically and functionally, in the genesis of reality, and which provides the basis for the development of an individual's abilities. (Schieren, 2012, p. 66).

In summary, Schieren (2012) points that a teaching style, which asks students to be active participants in formation of representations does not separate them from the phenomena and leads to the mind's contribution in constituting the reality. It goes hand in hand with what has been written earlier in this chapter about students as active participants in developing a relationship with the world.

In conclusion, this sub-chapter has looked upon the multifaceted role that teachers have in working with the will in an educational context. It appears that teachers share a lot of responsibility for the learning process in a Waldorf educational context. It was pointed that pupils' encounter with the subject and the teacher depends on the teacher's relationship and attitude to the subject. Therefore, passion about the subject and teachers' true interest in the whole humanity and the time they live in were mentioned. Meanwhile, developing a trustworthy relationship with a class is of importance. In addition, teaching with and through the artistic element and involving students' in active working were mentioned.

The first part of the literature review has focused on how the characteristics and expressions of the will have been understood in a Waldorf educational context. It looked upon such themes as the historical background of Waldorf Education, the will as one of the three soul qualities and how the soul qualities (thinking, willing and feeling) unfold during the first three periods of seven years. Further, the chapter looked at ways for facilitating the development of adolescents' will in a Waldorf educational context. With reference to that, rhythms and habits, artistic and aesthetic experiences as well as students' active participation in developing relationship to the world and knowledge construction were discussed. Lastly, this chapter looked upon the teacher's role in facilitating the development of pupils' will. The following part of my literature review looks at how different scholars from the 20th and 21st century reflect on the characteristics and expressions of the will in educational context.

2.3 Education of the will in the scholarly debate

2.3.1 Introduction

Biesta (2012b) and Arendt (1971) discuss a worldly existence as the aim of education. They invite to look upon the aim of education as helping children to create a relationship with the world and have a connection with it; to engage with the world and to lead a worldly life, not merely private and individual. With reference Biesta (2015a) and Arendt (1971), education should thrive towards students becoming active and responsible subjects, who can have a sustainable life in both material and social world. In order to reach that, according to Biesta (2012b), education of the will is what is at stake. It is an educational theme, as Biesta (2012b) explains, that was widely discussed in the 19th and 20th century, but is rather forgotten now.

According to Sockett (1998), the notion of effort and striving are at heart of the qualities of the will and they manifest as "habits or character traits or virtues" that "provide students with a major resource for the achievement of goals in socially acceptable ways" (p. 207). Sockett (1998) emphasizes the importance of facilitating the development of qualities of the will in educational settings, for they equip children with abilities to face difficulties in life and achieve their goals in socially acceptable ways.

Education of the will, according to Biesta (2012b), is a question of the place of resistance in a child's education. How do children react when they encounter resistance? Do they shy away and try to escape? Do they overtake and become destructive towards what caused resistance?

Do they find a way to work with what resists? Similarly, Sockett (1998) points out that in order to facilitate the development of the qualities of the will, there is a need for difficulty in a child's education. According to Sockett (1988), it is important that children learn to face obstacles in nature, other people and themselves, because it teaches them how to face difficulties of life, make effort and achieve their goals in socially acceptable ways. Therefore, this study suggests that the development of the will in educational context is a theme that still should be a part of the educational discussion. In addition to Arendt (1971) and Biesta's (2015a) ideas, this chapter presents Dewey and Sockett's views on the will and education as well as an insight into agency.

2.3.2 School's duty to resist and school as a place between

The problem that many educational settings face today, according to Biesta (2015a), is alike what Arendt (1961, 1998) and Dewey (2012) were concerned about. It is the expectations that the society have regarding education. What is in common in these authors' views is the idea that schools should resist the demands of the society and remain a "protected" space where children with teachers learn to live together and have a sustainable relationship with the material and social world.

Biesta sees the purpose of the education to be threefold: qualification, socialization, and subjectification. Qualification is about acquiring skills, knowledge and competencies so children and young people can learn how to do different things and use the skills, for example, for their future work. Then comes socialization, which let children become a part of different traditions, such as professional, cultural, political and religious, thus, they join their community. Lastly, the domain of subjectification, which is about formation of a person. Education shapes how one is a person and it can have either a negative or a positive impact on the young person. Subjectification has to do "with the way in which children and young people come to exist as subjects of initiative and responsibility rather than as objects of the actions of others" (Biesta, 2015b, p. 77). In other words, one of the roles of education is to help children and young people form in a way that they can act responsibly out of their free will, instead of depend on others' actions.

Even though qualification is only one of the aspects of education, it is still often paid the greatest attention. Focusing on qualification is not empowering children because knowledge is static (Biesta, 2015a). As Arendt (1971) states, there is no learning in education that is based

on transmission of knowledge. Accordingly, Dewey (2012) strongly criticizes the tendency of the society of his time to stick children's head with information and ways of acting that adults want them to reproduce. He describes it as "the inert, stupid quality of current customs perverts learning into a willingness to follow where others point the way, into conformity, constriction, surrender of scepticism and experiment" (p. 64) and points that this tradition fades the freshness of youth and dulls its curiosity.

Introducing children into the world so they can create their own common world is the aim of education for Arendt (1971). She states that the school should be a protected space where children learn about the existing (old) social and material world (the concept of work, which I will explain later in this chapter) so they can build their own world together. "Natality" is a concept that Arendt (1998) uses to explain that every new generation can create a new beginning. Therefore, teachers are responsible for the world they introduce to children. The world they bring to students should be free from adult world knowledge about politics and economical needs. According to Arendt (1998), the teacher's authority plays a significant role in education, for they create the learning atmosphere in the class and choose the world, in other words, knowledge, skills and attitudes, they introduce to the children.

The teacher's role in education is a topic that also Biesta (2012a) looks upon. He is critical about the fact that the society eliminates the teacher's role to "(just)" facilitating the learning process. According to Biesta, it is an effect of what he calls "new language of learning" (p. 37) in education, "including the tendency to refer to teachers as facilitators of learning, to teaching as the creation of learning opportunities, to schools as learning environments, to students as learners and adults as adult learners" (p. 37). Teachers as facilitators, for Biesta (2012a), seem to be an authoritarian concept, because teachers should take the responsibility and control that students learn pre-defined learning outcomes. Even though teachers are often mentioned as an important factor in the process of education, the claims about their importance are problematic, with reference to Biesta (2015b). Teachers are seen as a "factor" (p. 75) and there is a belief that this "factor" should work in the most efficient and effective way possible in order to increase the "performance" of the educational system.

Biesta (2012a) encourages teachers to teach and the educational system to allow teachers teach. According to Biesta (2012a, 2015b), learning takes place when children learn something specific, for a purpose and they learn from another person. The author maintains:

The quickest way to express what is at stake here is to say that the point of education is never that children or students learn, but that they learn something, that they learn this for particular purposes, and that they learn this from someone. (Biesta, 2012a, p. 36)

In short, with reference to Biesta (2012a), learning is not a neutral or isolated activity. It takes place when a student learns something for a specific purpose and from someone. He continues that successful teaching lets students experience encounters with moments of resistance, which develop a dialogical relationship with the world and pupils' will. It is the teacher who brings something new to the class, lets it "arrive" and teaching becomes an interruption of some kind.

Biesta (2015a) explains that schools should work with children in a way so they gradually reach grown-up-ness in the process of learning. He explains grown-up-ness: "Grown-up-ness responds to the enduring challenges of human life and human living: the questions of democracy, ecology and care that in each case call upon us to respond in a grown-up, non-ego-logical way" (p. 10). Further, he describes our world as a world where everyone wants to remain ego-logical. The temporary society is not interested in the interruption of desires. People have more and more desires. They keep wanting more and they buy more. It is a never-ending cycle of wanting and buying. Everything works in a way so the economy can keep growing. Biesta (2015a) states the importance of having places of refuge where people can practice other ways of being and being together. Therefore, he insists that is the schools' duty to resist "by standing for the value of grown-up-ness in a world that quite often rather wants us to remain children" (p. 10). If we want schools to be places where education can occur, this is what is at stake, according to Biesta (2015a).

Further, Arendt (1961) makes a plea for not ruining the world and advocates that letting the young to have an education free from external agendas and build their own common world is the only way of a sustainable continuation of the world.

Education is the point at which we decide whether we love the world enough to assume responsibility for it and by the same token save it from that ruin which, except for renewal, except for the coming of the new and young, would be inevitable. And education, too, is where we decide whether we love our children enough not to expel them from our world and leave them to their own devices, nor to strike from their hands their chance of undertaking something new, something unforeseen by us, but to prepare them in advance for the task of renewing a common world. (Arendt, 1961, p. 196)

In summary, Arendt (1961) invites to let children bring something unexpected to fore, for they are the ones to renew a common world. Therefore, politics and external agendas should be of no influence in education. She points to the importance of children acquiring skills and knowledge how to live together in this world and have a healthy relationship with it, not the knowledge of the adult world.

To summarize, this part of the chapter has looked at Arendt (1961), Biesta (2015a) and Dewey's (2012) views on the purpose of education. What is in common in the authors' ideas is that qualification, which is often paid the biggest attention at school, should not be the focus. It is equally important for children to acquire different personal capabilities that enable them to live together in a no-ego-logical way and act responsibly (towards social and material world) out of their free will. It is suggested that the teacher's role in education is of importance in order to introduce children into the world (Arendt, 1961) and bring encounters of resistance to the class (Biesta, 2012a). For Biesta (2012a), learning takes place when someone learns something from someone for a specific reason and the teacher brings something new into the class. The following part of the chapter looks closer at Biesta's concept of resistance as a way for facilitating the development of the will in educational settings.

2.3.3 Experience of resistance in the education of the will

A balanced development of children asks for a dialogical education that lets them experience resistance. Biesta (2012b) calls for resistance in education, which, according to him, goes in hand in hand with education of the will. This sub-chapter explores Biesta's concept of resistance and its relation to the development of one's will in an educational context.

The world is something *other*; it is not something that the mind projects; it exists on its own. It is diverse; it consists of different people, nature, events, rules and laws of its own. It is sometimes unacceptable, complicated to understand or too difficult to act upon. Therefore, when people act and engage with the world, they experience resistance; they come across barriers and obstacles that require them to question themselves about whether to remain who they are or to change (Biesta, 2012b, 2015a).

There are three ways how people can respond to encounters with resistance. First, a response that leads to the denial or a destruction of the otherness and strangeness; an almost aggressive like reaction that is full of force against the thing, which causes resistance. The other option,

which is opposite, is withdrawing, holding back and shying away. If the first option means coming into the world so much that the *thing*, which causes one's resistance, is suppressed, the second option means not coming into the world at all and avoiding the *thing* that causes resistance. One may understand it as fright. Neither the first nor the second option creates a sustainable relationship between a child and the world (Biesta, 2012b).

There is a third option as well, and it creates a truly educational space. It is to stay in the middle; neither destroy the world (the *thing*, which causes resistance), nor destroy the self so it is possible to engage with the world. Biesta (2012b) calls it "the frustrating middle ground". It means having enough will to create a relationship with what causes one's resistance, meanwhile, having not too much will in order not to suppress its existence. In other words, creating a dialogue with the world where the child is not in the centre but also leaves space for others.

Therefore, there are three steps that are important for pupils during their education. First, teachers should support a dialogue with what resists. Second, teachers should invite pupils to perceive encounters with resistance as positive, and, third, teachers should help children to cope with difficulties so they do not shy away (Biesta, 2012b). Similarly, Sockett (1998) questions the place of difficulty in a child's education.

According to Sockett (1998), there are different aspects of personal capability that children need to require, and schools should support the development of these qualities. Sockett (1998) puts these qualities in three categories - endeavour, heed and control – and refer to them as the qualities of will. For Sockett (1998), the notion of striving is central to one's will and it does not mean simply trying, which is a synonym to intending, but it "carries with it the assumption of difficulty" (p. 199). As people strive for things, according to Sockett (1998), they encounter difficulties that are "obstacle in nature, other people, and ourselves" (p. 199). In other words, striving seems to be an expression of the will that implicates overcoming obstacles encountered in nature, other people and ourselves. Further, Biesta's (2012a, 2012b) concepts of material and social resistance as pedagogical approaches in the education of the will are discussed.

Material resistance and social resistance as pedagogical approaches

The aim of the education regarding the will is to make it in a such force that supports one's existence in the world instead of directing one to destroy the world or the conditions for the

worldly existence of the self (Biesta, 2012b). If education starts where the point of resistance begins, creating an encounter with the world becomes one of the tasks of the teacher. It means even ‘staging’ learning situations where there are possibilities to encounter resistance and engage with it. Biesta (2012a, 2012b) underlines the importance of experiencing resistance in both material world (working with ‘resistant’ materials) and social world (human world). It is stated that if there is no resistance in education, it is merely a monologue of the teacher and learning loses its meaningfulness.

The domain of hands is a unique domain, through hands and action people connect to the world immediately (Biesta, 2012b). Working with hands offer the important opportunity for the education of the will regarding the material world. As an example, working with ‘resistant materials’ (working with wood, stone and metal) is a part of the English curriculum for secondary schools. Not only working with these materials let the young people encounter resistance (because the process is difficult and frustrating), but also it lets them develop a dialogical relationship with the world (Biesta, 2012b). Biesta adds:

And it means, above all, to help the child or student to stay 'with' that which resists and to work 'through' it rather than against it; to help the child or student to endure the frustration of staying in the middle ground. (Biesta, 2012a, p. 44)

In other words, crafts classes and workshops teaches students to get hold of their will and stay in the middle ground – not shy away and leave the complicated task, nor use as much force as possible and destroy it. It is the golden mean.

Regarding the social resistance and the education of the will, children gain a lot from “encountering and engaging with resistance posed by other people” (Biesta, 2012b, p. 98), for example, drama education and art group work serves well. Schieren (2012) speaks about class projects together, be it agricultural practice or any other working together. He notes that learning means transformation and it always involves encounters with difficulties. He maintains:

Learning always involves effort, it must of necessity lead to a crisis. Even good teachers cannot spare their students the effort of learning. Good teaching does not mean that everything comes easily to the students and no crises arise. It means, rather, good crisis management, which involves teaching them how to cope with the struggles and crises of learning. (p. 71)

In summary, Schieren (2012) points that crisis is where learning and transformation takes place. Therefore, the task of the teacher is a good crises management. Further, he adds that

errors and mistakes become an important part of learning that pupils and teachers have to deal with.

Socket (1998) points out that a starting point for schools to think about the education of the will is to evaluate the place of difficulty in a child's education. He invites to work with the qualities of the will so children are equipped "to face difficulty and to resist both fatalism and escapism", which "are common human actions, and the former at least indicates the presence of an active mind" (p. 209). He (1998) states that it is not about the curriculum being painless, but the children should see the curriculum as one in which "striving – for understanding, for knowledge, for skill of whatever – is seen as valuable" (p. 210).

In conclusion, the aim of education, for Biesta (2012b), is that the young people learn to cope with the difficulties that encounters with resistance provide and are able to stay "in the middle ground". With reference to Biesta (2012b), working with hands, working with resistant materials is one of the forms of the education of the will. Another is encountering resistance posed by other people, for instance, drama projects or art group work. Similarly, Schieren (2012) explains that learning must involve effort and lead to a crisis, for solving a crisis leads to fruitful learning and transformation. In this way, according to Socket (1988), children will be equipped with the ability to face difficulties in life and resist fatalism and escapism.

2.3.4 Hannah Arendt and the Will

Hannah Arendt is known for strictly separating the education from the society and politics. For her, schools are primarily socializing institutions, where children build up their common world. Under no circumstances, the society should consider children as adults and educate them about the topics from the adult world. Education is a mean for renewing the society and bringing something new. According to Arendt, man is capable of action, and it means that the surrounding environment can await something unexpected to come to fore. Because of the man's ability to act and the socialness of acting, the common world of a particular time is in the process of being renewed. Education should give children the freedom to do it, and then both the world and the children would be taken care of. If school is a protected space, where children's world is not interfered with the world of adults and politics, every generation can bring a new beginning (Arendt, 1998).

Even though Hannah Arendt is a political thinker, her work has questioned the role of education to a great extent. In her work, free action and the will are central. Arendt was

inspired and impressed by St. Augustine's reflections on the will, who emphasized the self-determined nature of will and the free human choice. Duns Scotus, who followed the tradition of St. Augustine regarding the man's radical freedom of choice and the will as the source of individuality, was the second philosopher of the will that Arendt admired. One might consider her as a phenomenologist, for "experiences" and "phenomena" are of fundamental importance to her general method. She argues that since the time of St. Augustine the will has been the subject of philosophical inquiry, but it is mostly looked upon through theoretical arguments, which reflect the philosophers' bias against the will. The will is a phenomena that cannot be explained by theoretical descriptions, which have lost the sight of "experiences". In other words, she is critical about philosophers subordinating the will to reason, for willing is an autonomous and active mental capacity, rooted in experience in the world (Jacobitti, 1988).

According to Arendt (1998), the will is connected to the ability to act, which is central to her notion of "natality". The will means to begin something, to take initiative and to do it. She continues that the will is what enables free action. Therefore, one's freedom to choose its projects and to initiate change in the world stems from the will. For her, the will is a "spring of action" and a mental organ for the future. It unites the mind's inner world with the outer world and creates basis for action towards the future. Arendt (1971) explains: "By directing the senses' attention, presiding over the images impressed on memory, and providing the intellect with material for understanding, the Will prepares the ground on which action can take place" (p. 249).

With reference to Tamboukou (2016), natality and new beginnings are crucial in Arendt's overall philosophy and her views on education. For her, "the essence of education is natality, the fact that human beings are born into the world" (Arendt, in Tamboukou, 2016, p. 4). As the possibility to *be* and to make a new beginning, natality is fundamental to human action and to the freedom to act. Arendt calls natality - the capacity to interrupt and begin something new - a "miracle". She maintains:

The miracle that saves the world, the realm of human affairs, from its normal, 'natural' ruin is ultimately the fact of natality, in which the faculty of action is ontologically rooted. It is, in other words, the birth of new men and the new beginning, the action they are capable of by virtue of being born. Only the full experience of this capacity can bestow upon human affairs faith and hope, those two essential characteristics of human existence [...]. (Arendt, 1998, in Pols & Berding, 2018, p. 45)

Arendt expresses that action originates in natality. Every new generation can bring a new beginning, and this capacity gives the human existence faith and hope. Pols and Berding (2018) explains further that, for Arendt, education is not “just a matter of growing up, it is a matter of growing up in the world” (p. 39). Therefore, the task of education is to introduce children into the world and protect their newness, so they can renew it (Pols & Berding, 2018).

In summary, Arendt’s concept of natality takes the central role in her views about the essence of education. She calls natality a “miracle”, for natality is the capacity to carry out a free action and bring a new beginning. The ability to act and can be seen in relation to the will as it has been operationalized in this study. Further, I will discuss her anthropology of *vita activa*, in which action is one of the three components.

Vita activa

Pols and Berding (2018) provides an insight of the anthropology that Hannah Arendt as a political thinker develops in *The human condition*. What she argues is that the lives of man and woman nowadays are no longer characterized by *vita contemplative* (thinking beings) but by *vita activa* (active life). The following part of the chapter explains Arendt’s understanding of the active life, which, in her view, has three modes: labour, work and action.

Labour is the fundamental mode of life. Arendt describes it as “the activity which corresponds to the biological process of the human body, whose spontaneous growth, metabolism, and eventual decay are bound to the vital necessities, produced and fed into the life process of labour” (Arendt, in Pols & Berding, 2018, p. 40). Earlier the process was associated with something that happened in the private sphere of the household. It is much different now, since it has exceeded the private sphere of the household and spread globally. The economic process of labour is what characterizes the modern society. “It is the process of production and consumption, just like the biological process: ongoing and repetitive. It is a process based on always new, emerging needs that should be satisfied again and again” (p. 40).

The second mode of active life is work and it has a different structure than labour. If labour is biological and natural, work is cultural. Humans create different things that they use (use objects) by working and it differs from things that are meant for consumption (consumer goods). They furnish the world with artificial objects that differ from all natural surroundings. Work is a process of creating things that are brought forth to make the world stable, because

“in contrast to the mode of labour, work creates a world that transcends the ever changing moment of the lives of mortal men” (Pols & Berding, 2018, p. 41). In short, our lives are always in the process of changing, and the objects created by work are what remain the same, and therefore, provide stability. According to Pols & Berding (2018), work is what makes the world a human world.

The last mode of *vita activa* according to Hannah Arendt is action. “Action corresponds to the human condition of plurality, to the fact that men, not Man, live on the earth and inhabit the world” (Arendt, in Pols & Berding, 2018, p. 41). A human comes into the world by acting. “With word and deed we insert ourselves into the human world” (Arendt, in Pols & Berding, 2018, p. 41). Only in this shared and public world, a human can be a human. “Men are free as long as they act, neither before nor after; for to be and act are the same” (Arendt, 2006, in Pols & Berding, p. 41). Acting is a social concept, because it is always done by someone and interplays with the surrounding environment. Arendt (1998) explains that “action and speech need the surrounding presence of others” and “to be isolated is to be deprived of the capacity to act” (p. 210). What one says and what one does is a medium to create a common world. Therefore, action becomes present through a dialogical relationship between the individual and the world and development of a person is a social activity.

In conclusion, Hannah Arendt has developed a layered anthropology of *vita activa* or the *active life*, which, in her opinion, characterizes the life of our society. It is divided in three modes: labour, which is a cyclical and natural process connected to meeting the always-emerging new needs of the human and growth; work, which is all the material object’s and mental objects that the society of a particular time creates; action, which is the doing and speaking of a person or, as Arendt says, the deed and the word. Her concept of action can shed light to the social aspect of the will as it has been utilized in this study, for every human action, according to Arendt (1998), interrelates to the surrounding environment, either social or material, and initiates change.

2.3.5 Agency

Agency is mostly looked upon from the perspective of social theory and social psychology, but many discussions stem from earlier philosophical work concerning human freedom. With reference to Biesta and Tedder (2006), Emirbayer, and Mische (1988), at least since the Enlightenment, the idea of agency has been present in educational thinking and practice. It

refers to the psychological and social psychological conditions of a person that “imply the capacity for willed (voluntary) action”. Social theorists, in general, see agency as “the capacity for autonomous social action” (Calhoun, 2002, as cited in Biesta & Tedder, 2006, p. 5). This part of the chapter tries to acknowledge similarities, nuances and differences between agency and will.

Eteläpelto et al. (2013) points to the popularity of the concept of agency in education and draw one’s attention to the lack of any explicit definition of the core meaning of agentic processes. Scholars have been using agency as a multidisciplinary and abstract concept, “involving various assumptions of reality”.

Anthony Giddens, a social scientist, understands the concept of agency as “intentional choice involving actions with consequences” (Eteläpelto et al., 2013, p. 49). Rational intentions and power are key words that define Giddens’ concept of agency. First, people need to have a capability to carry out actions arising from their intentions. Second, they need to have the power to intervene in an event or to evoke an event. For Giddens, agency regards only human conscious acts and is rationally separated from non-conscious acts, such as automatic actions or actions driven by habits. With reference to the limitation to individual rational action in Giddens’ theory of agency, it has been increasingly criticized (Eteläpelto et al., 2013).

Emirbayer and Mische (1998) point to the lack of “a temporal dimension in definitions of agency” and suggest widening “the temporal scope of agency” so that it takes into account the past and the future in connection to the present (Emirbayer and Mische, 1998, in Eteläpelto et al., 2013).

The conception of agency, for Emirbayer and Mische (1988), is intrinsically social and relational. Agency is always agency toward something or someone. It means creating a relationship with the surrounding environment, be it persons, places, meanings or events. Therefore, one can understand agency as interaction and as a dialogical process with the world. Intersubjectivity, social interaction and communication are important components of agentic processes. The human agency, according to Emirbayer and Mische (1998), is a process that lies in the human self and is like an internal conversation, which holds seeds for giving a shape and direction to future possibilities. They define agency as:

A temporally embedded process of social engagement, informed by the past (in its "iterational" or habitual aspect) but also oriented toward the future (as a "projective" capacity to imagine alternative possibilities) and toward the present

(as a "practical-evaluative" capacity to contextualize past habits and future projects within the contingencies of the moment). (Emirbayer & Mische, 1998, p. 963)

In other words, agency is a process of social engagement, which, in a way, connects past with the future as well as the present moment. Further, Emirbayer and Mische (1998) relate to habits as a part of agency. Habits, as explained by Dewey (1922), mean the will. Dewey (1922) maintains:

Habits are active means, means that project themselves, energetic and dominating ways of acting ... Habit means special sensitiveness or accessibility to certain classes of stimuli, standing predilections and aversions, rather than bare recurrence of specific acts. It means will. (Dewey, 1922, as cited in Emirbreyer & Mische, 1998, p. 977).

In summary, Dewey (1922) notes that habits are not purely repeated actions. They are energetic and dominating ways of action and, therefore, represent the will. Dewey's idea of habit may be understood as "active and creative relation to the world" (Emirbreyer & Mische, 1998, p. 978). In the following part of this chapter, I will introduce Dewey's conception of the habits and will in more detail.

Habits and the will – John Dewey's point of view

In *Human nature and conduct*, Dewey (2012) describes habits as will. According to him, habits constitute the self. They are affections with projectile power and they are a fundamental part of the human, for habits are "a predisposition formed by a number of specific acts" (p. 25), instead of vague and general choices. Dewey (2012) continues:

In any intelligible sense of the word will, they are will. They form our effective desires and they furnish us with our working capacities. They rule our thoughts, determining which shall appear and be strong and which shall pass from light into obscurity. (p. 25)

In other words, habits, according to Dewey (2012) are a result of several purposefully carried out acts. They provide people with their working capacities and put their thoughts in order according to how strong the thoughts should appear in one's mind. Meanwhile, as Dewey (2012) maintains, habit means special sensitiveness or accessibility to certain classes of stimuli, standing predilections and aversions, rather than bare recurrence of specific acts. It means will." (p. 42).

Dewey (2012) compares habits to tools in a box. He invites to make a clear distinction between materials, tools and means. Nails and boards, for example, are only materials for

making a box. They are not means yet. In addition, the saw and hammer are not means unless employed in actual process of making something. They are tools and potential means. They transform in actual means only when collaborating with eye, hand and arm in some specific operation. Correspondingly, only when they are in active operation, eye, hand and arm can be proper means. Dewey (2012) explains:

And whenever they are in action they are cooperating with external materials and energies. Without support from beyond themselves, the eye stares blankly and the hand moves fumblingly. They are means only when they enter into organization with things, which independently accomplish definite results. These organizations are habits. (p. 26)

In short, Dewey (2012) points that materials and tools can become active means if they are in put in action by cooperating with “external materials and energies”. One might interpret his idea about the habits and the will that they are never isolated. As long as habits are isolated, they are tools that are not in use and do not become one’s active capacity. They are our tools and as soon as they are put into action and relation to other energies, they become our means to carry out a deed. These organizations (or relations in a way) that are between the tool and the external material or energy form the habit and, therefore, the will.

Similar to Arendt, he relates to action as something that can have result only in social context. Encounters with objects, experiences, environment and persons give meaning to activity. Dewey (2012) further explains:

If activity were directly exhibited it would result in certain experiences, contacts with the environment. It would succeed by making environing objects, things and persons, co-partners in its forward movement; or else it would run against obstacles and be troubled, possibly defeated. These experiences of contact with objects and their qualities give meaning, character, to an otherwise fluid, unconscious activity. (p. 192)

Dewey (2012), in other words, point to the fluid and unconscious character of activity that forms, shapes and is given meaning and direction when in contact with the surrounding environment, experiences or people.

Further, he is critical about moral theorists separating motive, act, will and deed. With reference to Dewey(2012), “the dynamic force of habit taken in connection with the continuity of habits with one another explains the unity of character and conduct, or speaking more concretely of motive and act, will and deed” (p. 42). The projective and dynamic force of habits together with the implication of habits is a unified deed. Dewey (2012) explains that

moral theorists tend to break the concept of habits in two disjoined parts – motive and act. Accordingly, emotions, thought and will (habits) are interrelated. As Dewey (2012) states, “emotion without thought is unstable” (p. 259). For Dewey (2012), it is a great moral tragedy that people separate the “warm” emotions from the “cool” intellect.

In conclusion, Dewey (2012) explains habits as the will. Habits are not random activities that are enacted from time to time; instead, they are a number of specific acts carried out with their projective and dynamic force. Habits are our tools that become active means when we get hold of our own will and use them. It is interaction with the surrounding environment, experiences and people that give form to otherwise our fluid and unconscious activity. Motive, act, will and deed are an inseparable unity that is interwoven by habits.

2.4 Conceptual framework

The concepts used in the study were *three-foldness*, *habits*, *rhythms*, *striving*, *resistance* and *action*. Within this section, I will explain each of them in detail.

Three-foldness is a concept refers to the threefold functions of the soul - thinking, willing and feeling – and characterizes their interrelatedness (Steiner, 1995). It is a concept that comes from Rudolf Steiner’s philosophical anthropology, or, in other words, anthroposophy (Dahlin, 2017).

Habits is a concept that originates in Dewey’s (2002) conception of the will. They are understood as a number of specific acts carried out with their projective and dynamic force. Habits are our tools that become active means when we get hold of our own will and use them.

Rhythms as utilized in this thesis is based on Steiner’s ideas related to Waldorf educational context. Rhythm is an important part of Waldorf educational settings in order to support healthy modes of learning and the development of children’s’ will (Mathisen, 2015).

Striving is a concept based on Sockett (1998) and it is central to one's will; it "carries with it the assumption of difficulty" (p. 199). As we strive for things, according to Sockett (1998), we encounter difficulties that are "obstacle in nature, other people, and ourselves" (p. 199).

Resistance refers to Biesta’s (2012b, 2015a) idea about developing a sustainable relationship to both the social and material world. Social resistance and material resistance are

pedagogical methods for finding “the frustrating middle ground” and, therefore, educating one’s will.

Action is a concept that Arendt (in Pols & Berding, 2018) uses to explain one of the modes of *Vita activa* or *Active life*. It refers to man’s ability to act and will. It is a social concept, for it is always done by someone and interplays with the surrounding environment. Action enables human beings to be free. At its heart is Arendt’s notion of natality, which explains that every new generation can create a new beginning – their own common world.

2.5 Summary of the literature review

Within this chapter I have tried to deepen my understanding about how the characteristics and expressions of the will have been understood in relation to Waldorf education and how the development of adolescents’ will can be facilitated within Waldorf educational settings. I looked at this issue from the perspective of Waldorf education and from the perspective of such researchers as John Dewey, Hannah Arendt, Hugh Sockett and Biesta.

Rudolf Steiner throughout his lectures on education looks at the will as inseparable part of three-foldness, which refers to the three functions of the soul: thinking, willing and feeling. According to him, a feeling and will are closely linked and feelings influence the will largely. Education of the will in Waldorf education is of primary importance (Steiner, 1996b; 1997).

For will and feelings are closely related, artistic element in Waldorf education is believed to positively affect one’s will. Steiner’s suggestion in his lectures to teachers is to develop everything from the artistic element. As explained by Wember (2015), it supports a healthy rhythm of a lesson, enlivens the content, brings joy and engages imagination. As a result, by stirring children’s feeling life, the artistic element also stirs the will impulses. Further, developing rhythms and habits in teaching and learning is believed to strengthen pupils’ willing forces (Mathisen, 2015). Also, students’ active participation and practical activity, according to Staley (2009) and Rawson (2020), appears to be a part of the pedagogical and methodological approach for developing one’s will in a Waldorf educational setting.

Dewey (2002) links the will to habits, which, according to him, are focused and purposeful activities carried out with their projective and dynamic force. He compares habits to tools that become active means when one gets hold of one’s will and use them. With reference to

Dewey, people give form to activity by interaction with the surrounding environment, experiences and other people.

According to Biesta, Steiner, Arendt and Dewey, the aim of education is creating a sustainable relationship between the child and the world. Thus, with reference to Biesta, education of the will is at stake in order to fulfill this aim. He recognizes that encounters with resistance are the point where real learning experiences start. Therefore, it is important that teachers give children opportunities to encounter resistance, be it social (drama projects, group projects, social projects) or material resistance (different crafts and working with resistant materials), and learn by their own activity. Learning often involves crisis, which is a significant and transformative learning experience (Schieren, 2012). As Biesta explains, this way, the young can learn to have a sustainable relationship with the material (environment and resources) and social world (other people).

For Arendt (1998), will is connected to the ability to act and will enables free action. This idea is central to her concept of natality. According to her, every generation can bring something fresh and young to the existing society. The young should learn what is appropriate to their age and they should be treated as children, not as adults. All the scholars discussed earlier points that every generation can renew the society and bring positive changes if the system does not influence the education with its political and economic needs. Natality is the essence of education, with reference to Arendt (in Pols & Berding, 2018), and it is fundamental to human action and to the freedom to act.

3. Methodology

3.1 Introduction

The purpose of this study has been to explore how the characteristics and expressions of the will have been understood in a Waldorf educational context and how experienced Waldorf class teachers view the possibilities for facilitating the development of the adolescents' will in Waldorf educational settings. In order to reach the aim, I designed the following research questions: (i) How can experienced Waldorf class teachers' reflections on the development of the will in adolescents in classes 9 to 12 be described, interpreted, and understood? (ii) How do experienced Waldorf class teachers perceive and understand the will in their educational settings? (iii) How do experienced Waldorf class teachers perceive and understand the educator's role in facilitating the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context? (iv) What challenges regarding the development of the will in adolescents do practised Waldorf class teachers' experience?

This chapter introduces the methodology that has been applied to the study. First, it explains the rationale for choosing the tradition of a basic qualitative study. Second, it explains the research sample. Third, data collection methods have been introduced. Then, it discusses the data analysis methods used. Next, issues of trustworthiness, limitations and delimitations are paid attention to. Lastly, I provide an overview of the methodology applied in order to carry out this study.

3.2 Rationale for applying the tradition of a basic qualitative study

As Bloomberg and Volpe (2016) explains, qualitative research opens up possibilities for obtaining "a deep understanding of a social setting or activity as viewed from the perspective of research participants" (p. 38). Qualitative research designs emphasize exploration and discovery, and provides rich and thick descriptions of the phenomena that a researcher is interested in. The data is obtained through interactive process between the researcher and research participants (Bloomberg & Volpe, 2016).

I decided to carry out this study in the form of a basic qualitative study, for I as a researcher have been interested in the meaning of the phenomenon of the will as perceived by experienced Waldorf class teachers in their educational settings (Merriam, 2009, p. 22). The

will in this researched has been understood as a phenomenon inspired by the hermeneutic-phenomenological approach to the world. In other words, the goal of research is not to capture and define the will, but to open it up by describing and interpreting it, and trying to understand “what is the nature of this phenomenon as an essentially human experience” (van Manen, 2016a, p. 62). Therefore, the qualitative research design is the most appropriate for this study.

Merriam (2009) points that in a basic qualitative study meaning is constructed, not discovered. Crotty (1998, as cited in Merriam, 2009) explains: “Meaning does not inhere in the object, merely waiting for someone to come upon it. Meanings are constructed by human beings as they engage with the world they are interpreting” (p. 22). Researchers who chose to conduct a basic qualitative study, according to Merriam (2009) are interested in “in (1) how people interpret their experiences, (2) how they construct their worlds, and (3) what meaning they attribute to their experiences” (p. 22). In addition, in qualitative studies, researchers “acknowledge multiple constructed realities”, and it is often believed that “individuals have different perceptions of reality and that at least to some degree they construct realities” (Savin – Baden & Major, 2013, p. 13). It has been my aim to understand the meaning of the will that the teachers attribute to it.

3.3 Research sample and data sources

I used the strategy of purposive or, in other words, purposeful sampling, for I wanted to get a deep insight of the participants’ experiences and reflections on the phenomena. As Merriam (2009) suggests, I designed a criteria in order to “select a sample from which the most can be learned” (p. 77). Therefore, the criteria for sampling were the following. (a) each of the participants should be an experienced Waldorf class teacher and currently work with adolescents (minimum experience of ten years). (b) each of the participants should represent a different country or at least a different institution. (c) each of the participants should be a specialist in a different field. (d) informants should represent different genders.

I interviewed four experienced Waldorf class from three different countries (four different institutions) in order to have a variety of school cultures represented. In addition, they each teach a different subject: Richard is a first language and literature teacher, Morris teaches English as a foreign language, Tessa teaches drama and cultural history, Jane has worked in a Waldorfschool for more than thirty years. She is no longer a class teacher, but she coaches

teachers and is often in contact with students in classes 9 to 12, because she does intervention courses. I find it important to include her insights, because she can contribute to this research by sharing her stories from what she observes when working with students and class teachers. Tessa also has taught in a Waldorf school for more than 30 years and now mostly works with teacher education, but since she is involved in the development of a new Waldorf school and still teaches teenagers from time to time, her views provide nuanced details and enrich the data.

3.3.1 Ethical considerations

I informed NSD (Norwegian Centre for Research Data) and after I received the approval, I started the interview process. I informed the research participants that their data was completely safeguarded and it did not appear on any electronic device as well as was never mentioned to the third person or published in the research. All the data was anonymized – I used pseudonyms to protect the identities of all participants and I never referred to the country they work or the name of their institution. Each of the participants signed a letter of consent, in which I explained the purpose of my study in detail as well as that the participation was voluntarily, and the participants could withdraw from the research process at any point. I informed the participants that they would not be recognizable in publications, although, it could be barely possible that someone figured out who the research participant was by the context of the interview.

3.4 Data collection methods

I used the semi – structured interview as my overall strategy in data collection. According to Bloomberg and Volpe (2016), qualitative researchers choose the interview as the primary method for data collection due to its potential to “elicit rich, thick descriptions” (p. 154). In addition, the interview was the most suitable method for my study, because it allowed clarifying the information and asking for additional comments to the research participants (Bloomberg & Volpe, 2016).

As for most qualitative studies (Merriam, 2009), my preference was semi – structured interviews, because I wanted to leave enough space for the respondents so unique experiences and reflections could come to fore. With reference to Merriam (2009), “less structured formats assume that individual respondents define the world in unique ways” (p. 90).

However, as suggested by Merriam (2009), mostly specific data was required from the participants, but the research questions were used flexibly.

In qualitative research, the researcher intends to understand and interpret the meaning from the data gathered from the perspective of research participants (Bloomberg & Volpe, 2016). As Bloomberg and Volpe (2016) explain: “description, understanding and interpretation, and communication are the primary goals” and that serves as the reason for the researcher to be “the primary instrument for data collection and data analysis” (p. 41). This was also the case in my study – I as a researcher were the one who conducted the interviews. I also transcribed and coded them myself, not using any software.

The interviews took place in December 2019 and January 2020. I arranged them personally, for I knew my informants from different Waldorf seminars in Europe and personal contacts from the institution I work in. Each of them was approximately 45 minutes long. Part of the interviews were organized face to face and part via telephone call or Skype video call. I recorded all the interviews as audio files in two different devices in order to ensure that no data was lost, and I transcribed them in a word file as soon as possible after each interview. The transcribed data was already anonymized and the recordings were deleted from all the devices right after the transcriptions were completed.

3.5 Data analysis methods

The goal of my analysis was to find patterns and nuances in the data gathered that could form the grounds for understanding how the research participants understand the concept of the will and how they reflect on their experiences in working with the concept of the will with adolescents in the secondary school. As Merriam (2009) suggests, data analysis is the process that helps one to answer the research questions.

Steps taken in the coding process

As mentioned earlier, I manually transcribed all the interviews and did code them myself so I could stay close to the data gathered and understand the context of my respondents' answers. Merriam (2009) refers to the coding process as assigning designations to data (letters, words, numbers, colours, phrases, or combinations of these) in order to be able to easily retrieve parts of data.

The first step I took after I had finished the transcriptions was open coding. As I read the transcriptions, I highlighted quotes that seemed meaningful and relevant for answering my research questions. Parallel to that, I used margins to jot down codes that consisted of key words and notes pointing to possible connections or nuances in the answers. Some of the codes consisted of one word only; some were phrases or direct quotes from the participants. Most of the codes were created in an inductive way and were designed out of the data gathered, but few of the codes were deductively designed (the so-called pre-codes as suggested by Bryman, 2012) from the literature reviewed and conceptual framework (for example, the concept of threefoldness was used as a code).

After several rounds of rereading the transcriptions in order to do open coding, I started axial, in other words, analytical coding, which means grouping the open codes in categories (Merriam, 2009). I kept a handwritten diary of memos and mind maps throughout all the analysis and the process of writing the findings chapter as well I designed a board on which I drew different schemes for organizing the findings. Later I started using the online tool *Padlet* for creating digital mind maps and schemes.

The axial coding resulted in analytic categories that I used to name chapters and sub-chapters in the findings section.

3.6 Issues of trustworthiness

I used some of the strategies for promoting reliability and validity accounted by Merriam (2009). They were: member checks, adequate engagement in data collection, peer review/examination, rich, thick descriptions and maximum variation (p. 229).

First, member checks were used in order to evaluate plausibility of the data and interpretations. I was in regular contact with my interviewees (email, phone calls and meetings) during the process of transcribing data, coding and writing the findings section. I asked them to approve that I had understood them correctly or to clarify bits of information and add nuances. In addition, I engaged one of my colleagues in peer review sessions. From time to time, we found time to discuss the findings and interpretations. The third strategy I used in order to improve reliability and validity was providing rich and thick descriptions so that “readers would be able to determine the extent to which their situations match the research context, and, hence, whether findings can be transferred” (Merriam, 2009, p. 229). In

addition, I used maximum variation, which I described in more detail earlier in the section *Research sample and data sources*.

3.7 Limitations and delimitations

One limiting condition of this study is that I used semi – structured interviews as the only data collection method. For further research, the findings suggest to approach the phenomenon of the will through observation in addition to interviews so an even deeper exploration of the characteristics and expressions of the will in educational settings can take place.

Another limiting condition is that the teachers I interviewed have all come across Steiner's view of the will and how he uses will as a concept in his educational writings. This knowledge will undoubtedly influence the way the teachers view and work with the concept of will, and may in this way represent a limitation as teachers in Waldorf schools have a common understanding of will-development based on Steiner's thoughts. This might result in a certain bias in that Waldorf teachers are just looking to confirm what they have read or heard as opposed to seeing the phenomenon of will- development without any prior knowledge or prejudice. That is why I chose to interview teachers who are very experienced.

Another limiting condition might be that I personally knew the research informants and it might be that they tried being as informative as possible and saying more as they naturally would.

A delimiting condition for this study is that the present study has only investigated the experiences and reflections of experienced Waldorf class teachers, because the Waldorf curriculum considers the development of the will to be one of the most important aspects of education. Development of will is seen as part of the three-foldness that focus on developing – not just thinking, but a balancing of feeling, thinking and willing and that these three aspects of the student cannot be separated but must be worked on jointly and interchangeably. This study has been carried out in a Waldorf educational context and builds on interviews with Waldorf teachers only.

3.8 Summary

In summary, this chapter portrayed the research methodology of this study in detail. The purpose of this study has been to explore how the characteristics and manifestations of the will have been understood in relation to education and how the development of adolescents' will can be facilitated within educational settings. A basic qualitative study methodology was employed in order to conduct this study. The participant sample was made of four experienced Waldorf class teachers (whose experience is more than ten years). There were two male and two female teachers representing three countries and four different institutions in the research sample. I used the semi – structure interview as the only data collection method in this study. Data analysis implicated codes that were mostly developed inductively with few exceptions (some pre-codes that were developed deductively). I started the analysis with open coding and proceeded with axial coding. The analytical categories from axial coding become the chapters and sub - chapters of the findings. All the data gathered was completely safeguarded and it did not appear on any electronic device as well as was never mentioned to the third person or published in the research. All the data was anonymized and each of the research participants signed the letter of consent and were aware that they would not be recognizable in publications, although, it could be barely possible that someone figured out who the research participant was by the context of the interview. In order to ensure credibility and dependability of the research project, I used such strategies as member checks, a researcher's position on reflexivity, peer review/examination, rich and thick descriptions, maximum variation and audit trail. The main limiting conditions of this study are related to the interview as the only data collection method and to the education of the research participants.

4. Findings

4.1 Introduction

This chapter presents the findings of my study, which aims to explore how the characteristics and expressions of the will have been understood in a Waldorf educational context and how experienced Waldorf class teachers view the possibilities for facilitating the development of the adolescents' will in Waldorf educational settings. I carried out four semi - structured interviews with experienced Waldorf class teachers (two male and two female teachers) from different countries in order to get insights for my research questions, which are the following:

- v. How can experienced Waldorf class teachers' reflections on the development of the will in adolescents in classes 9 to 12 be described, interpreted, and understood?
- vi. How do experienced Waldorf class teachers perceive and understand the will in their educational settings?
- vii. How do experienced Waldorf class teachers perceive and understand the educator's role in facilitating the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context?
- viii. What challenges regarding the development of the will in adolescents do practised Waldorf class teachers' experience?

The structure of this chapter is organized as a thematic presentation of my findings. First, it looks upon how the will and its qualities are perceived by the teachers and how they relate to it in their educational settings. Second, it explores their views on the educator's role in facilitating the development of the will in adolescents. Third, it looks for ways of facilitating the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context. Lastly, it deals with challenges regarding education of the will that experienced Waldorf class teachers can relate to in an educational context.

The key findings presented in this chapter view the will as a part of the three-foldness of thinking, willing and feeling and point to the social nature of the will. Additionally, the findings reflect upon the teacher's role as an active co – creator in a child's ethical relationship to the world.

4.2 Will and its qualities as perceived by the teachers and their ways for relating to it in an educational context

I started my interviews with the question “what comes to your mind first if I say the will?” in order to explore the teachers’ understanding of the concept. What do they understand by the will? How do they define it? How do they experience it in their students? How do they work with it? These questions have been occupying my mind since I started teaching. What unites all the answers is one’s urge to act and one’s ability to be devoted to something as well as the interrelatedness of thinking, willing and feeling. The interviewees emphasize that willing cannot be looked upon on its own; it is never separated. The concept of three - foldness in Waldorf education is apparent in every conversation. Likewise is the social aspect of the willing.

During our conversation, Richard asks to imagine a person who lies in his bed and thinks about other people or problems. Thinking or feeling on its own does not make one a social being yet, unless one decides to act and do something about it, he explains. One can remain laying in the bed thinking and feeling, and not doing anything about it. The willing is the drive that makes one act, according to Richard. He emphasizes that a person can be harmonious and socially responsible only when all three functions of the soul are present – thinking, feeling and willing. A lack of one the functions, as Richard says, makes a person “rather antisocial” and the personality “deformed”. He concludes that willing is the domain that connects thinking to feeling and only then presents a person as a social being.

In order to explain Richard’s idea about threefoldness and harmonious and social personality, I would like to introduce an example of his literature class in the 12th grade. Together with his students, they analyse each character of the novella “The Little Prince”. They look at each character and think about it as a harmonious being. Something similar to the *Mercedes* logo is drawn for each character and the three sectors are thinking, feeling and willing. Further, students analyse which of the qualities is dominating in each character (the King, the Geographer, the Tippler, the Lamplighter etc.), and if and how it is deforming the harmony of a person. First, the Little Prince meets the king, who seems to have a strong will. He gives orders and appears to have thinking capacities, for he can think a few steps ahead and give orders early enough. Richard looks into my eyes frowningly and asks about the empathy the Kings has. He answers himself that the king has none, which deforms his personality and presents him as a rather antisocial human being. He further describes the Little Prince’s

meeting with the Geographer, who does not really do anything himself to explore the world and the Tippler, who is ashamed of drinking, but drinks to forget his shame.

The Little Prince meets the Geographer. He has a sharp mind (thinking). What about his feelings? Quite a lot of self-indulgence and narcissism. And the willing? Well, he cannot lift his bottom of the chair to start exploring the world himself. He does not think that a geographer should put any effort in that. He is waiting for others to explore all the planets so he could fill his books. There is no harmony again. In addition, the Little Prince meets the Tippler, who drinks to forget his shame, but he is ashamed because he drinks. What is happening here? Is he a harmonious being? What is deformed – is it thinking, willing or feeling? The Tippler always starts a vivid discussion in the class. (Richard)

It appears that for Richard analysing the threefoldness in each of the characters of the “Little Prince” is a method for working with the concept of the will in class 12. What he adds smilingly is that students become enthusiastic about this task and after the work with the Little Prince, they start analysing any character they meet in different works. Sometimes, when they see a classmate acting in an unacceptable way, they might say, “there is something wrong with your Mercedes, buddy”. It seems that this task raises pupils’ awareness about the disharmony caused by one of the three qualities being weak or absent, and not only are they opt to analyse these qualities in different literary characters, but also they notice them in the people around.

Jane brings something new to the conversation – the will that we as teachers can see at school and work with. For her, the will is something that occurs prior to acting, and it has a thought and feeling behind it. It is a multifaceted concept, and the motive and the drive are the sides, which teachers look at when working with children.

Willing has to do with enthusiasm and enthusiasm becomes the drive, as Tessa explains. When students love what they do, they are in connection and the connection is the feeling part there. It is sometimes very complicated to finish a task or a project for the student and teachers experience that the student is going to finish it, not because of an outside pressure but because of an inside pressure. Connection to a subject or connection to a teacher lies behind the effort that the student is able to put in finishing something complicated, according to Tessa.

Correspondingly, Morris provides a description of one of his English blocks in class 11, which, in his opinion, is an example of students’ ability to put a lot of effort in order to carry out an independent project. It was a project on media and journalism, in which each student

had to create a newspaper. The project included writing articles, making a layout for it, writing a poem and finding or taking pictures for the articles. What made the project especially demanding was the fact that most of the students have difficulties with writing and it is not an activity of their preference. Some of the students spent even forty-eight hours of extra work at home to finish their work, which, in Morris, opinion shows their effort. He concludes that giving responsibility to the pupils serves as a method to practice their will and finds the 11th class project to be a wilful example. If the students do not do it, no one else will do it for them and this feeling, in Morris opinion, provides space for exercising one's will.

To conclude, this chapter has given an insight into four experienced Waldorf class teachers' perception of the qualities of the will in their educational settings. It serves as a foundation for developing a further understanding about possibilities for working with the will in educational settings. The teachers mention giving responsibility to students, challenging them and developing positive connection between the subject and the class as ways for facilitating the development of their will.

4.3 Educator's role in facilitating the development of the will as perceived by the teachers

This chapter looks upon the interviewee's opinion about their role in facilitating the development of their pupils' will. As a class teacher and researcher, I am curious about how teachers perceive and understand the educator's role in facilitating the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context.

4.3.1 Being a worthwhile example

The previous chapter has slightly touched upon the importance of pupils' connection to the subject or the teacher as being the drive for enthusiasm and ability to exercise their will. When I asked about the teacher's role in the development of the will, the first answer of nearly all the interviewees was the example the teacher provides. Is the teacher an example whom students would like to follow? Would the students like to learn from the teacher?

Jane points that students grow up and both unconsciously and consciously look for a role model among adults. Not long ago, the 11th grade from Jane's school told their class teacher that the new English teacher is the type of a person one would like to work for. She explains that not only the teacher's skills and enthusiasm about a particular subject matter, but also his

or her personality. As she puts it, “it is also the person whom you see worth following as a student”, and teachers have to work very hard on that they are persons that other people would like to follow or to be interested in, because it is a way to develop a connection to the students.

All the informants emphasize that the teacher’s own drive and motive is important, because it shows children how to step into their will. Morris explains that when children see that their teacher can do something, even if it is highly complicated and seems impossible, they immediately know that they can do it as well. He further adds that being consequent is what is complicated for adolescents and is a great exercise for students’ will. Again, the teacher’s example is helpful. He considers himself a strong-willed teacher and emphasizes the need for clear borders and understanding of consequences. He always keeps his word and expects his students to do the same. How can a class learn how to get hold of their will if their teacher is inconsequent?

Tessa continues Morris’ idea and points that in order to ask something from the students, teachers must ask something from themselves as well. The teacher cannot change the student, but what she can do, is changing herself. As Tessa says: “You cannot just convey a message to your students – act properly and behave like a wilful person [laughs]”. Tessa tells a story from the time she started her teaching career. She had difficulties with coming on time but, needless to say, she expected her students to be on time. Tessa explains: “What did it show to the class? That a teacher is expecting them to be on time but...[a sigh]” She decided to give herself an exercise to arrive 10 minutes early to each class. After a while, it became her habit and she could see that changes in her attitude mirrored in pupils attitude as well.

She continues that enthusiasm and expertise in a subject are of importance as well. A teacher needs to be interested in what he or she is teaching and needs to see and feel, and be in touch with what students are interested in. Renewing and reviving a subject, according to Jane, Morris and Tessa, is the key to a teaching that is lively and invites pupils to be active. Admittedly, as Tessa explains, if the teaching material and attitude are the same as thirty years ago, it is a dead subject indeed and puts students’ willing forces to sleep. When pupils enter adolescence and question the authority of the teacher more than ever, teachers’ expertise in the subject is especially important.

4.3.2 Establishing good relationship with students

During the interviews, the teachers often emphasized that developing relationship to the class and understanding children's needs and interests is the basis for creating an atmosphere where everyone is welcome to learn and to be active. It appears that the teachers interviewed relate being active as a characteristic of the will. This section looks closer to the teachers' views about establishing relationship with students.

Richard has been a class teacher for children in classes 9 to 12 (sometimes classes 7 and 8 as well) for nearly thirty years. When I asked his opinion about the role of the class teacher regarding the education of the will, he had the answer immediately – “do not be silent if something happens and do not miss any situation where a teacher should get involved”. He points that even though the students seem to be older, they as a class often cannot solve complicated situations themselves.

Pupils and situations are not the things that can resolve beautifully themselves. Probably there are small moments that can, but a teacher has to look in the eyes in order to see how the human being feels. If a teacher misses it, it gets more complicated. Besides, children's domestic conditions, family relationship, relationship to people lead them to incapacity to handle a situation. (Richard)

In summary, Richard points to the importance of emotional support, because there are situations for young people that seem to be impossible to handle. Active involvement in problem solving is sometimes the task of the class teacher so the situations do not escalate, as Richard explains.

Accordingly, Morris explains that it sometimes happens that a class as a group has had a complicated day and there is still a lot of tension visible when the teacher enters the class. He emphasizes that the teacher must try his or her best to reach out to the students and understand their situation, in other words, not ignore the tension in the class. Otherwise, most likely the teacher will experience resistance in the class. Morris points that establishing harmony in the learning atmosphere is of primary importance for having a fruitful lesson.

Resistance in the class is something that Jane and Morris pay great attention to. They conclude that resistance in the class is opposite to the will. According to Morris, sometimes it takes place because a class as a group has had a bad day and that is natural. Nonetheless, in his opinion, it is hardly ever the case. He continues:

More often I find that I was not there one hundred per cent or I was not prepared

enough as I should have been. I was not present; I was not one hundred per cent with them, because I was worried about something or thinking about something else. That is what they reflected. That is something I can always change. I am sure that if there is resistance in the class, it is we, teachers, who cause it. That is what my experience shows. Us not being able to meet their interests and learning their needs. (Morris)

In summary, Morris points that sometimes the teacher causes resistance in the class. He finds that the reason for lessons, which he is not fully satisfied with, can be often found in himself.

Observing other teachers' lessons and coaching new teachers in different countries is Jane's daily work. Taking into account this experience and looking back at the time when she was teaching, she recognizes the importance of the teacher's true interest in the children's world and knowledge about pupils' age group. She continues:

It very much has to do if you reach out to the world the child is in. If what you are talking about or what you are bringing as a teacher is abstract or has a lot of to do with yourself not with the world of the children, you need to bend down or be interested in the world the child lives in. [...] If a teacher is pushing them down, asking students what to do even without looking at them or not considering their age...if a teacher is having his own party, as to say, or has his thing in mind that he wants to reach as a goal, then it is easy to lose children. (Jane)

Similarly as Morris, Jane points that, both, understanding the needs and interests of a particular age group and spotting the mood of a class leads the teacher to connect to his or her pupils. In fact, it is easy to disconnect from the students if the teacher does not relate to their learning interests and needs. She continues with the idea that a teacher should work in a way that lets students feel as an important part of the learning process and willing to learn new knowledge and skills.

In the same way, Richard emphasizes that pupils at puberty seem to be lazy in their will and they look like they would not like to do anything at all from time to time. There comes the task for teachers, which is to awaken pupils' will and get them going. He maintains:

When you look at a ninth grader, oh, of course often they are not willing to do anything at all. They prefer sleeping on the table. They look bored, lazy and will-less. There comes my task – to make them willing. I have to plan an activity in a way they start feeling - yes, I want to do it and it is going to go well. We as teachers have to make them feel willing. When we move them and they start working, the fruits are beautiful. They can be active; they just have to be awakened. (Richard)

What Richard explains is that naturally a ninth grader is not the one who demonstrates a strong will. It is a matter of how the teacher makes the young people, who are at puberty,

willing. Thus, the teacher's role is to invite students to be active and, as Richard says, "make them willing".

Furthermore, Jane points that if we as teachers want the students to be active, we have to ask them to be active and give tasks that exercise their will and are effective for that. She maintains:

When a student only has to copy what the teachers show him or have to know what the teacher knows; when there is no individual question to a student; when there is no question that gets creative thinking stirred up or where the student realizes he is the one to solve the problem himself, the student sits back and has the adults run harder for him. (Jane)

To sum up, Jane explains that students are not active unless their teachers ask them to. If teachers ask obvious questions, do not offer students to solve problems themselves and give no space for creative thinking, students feel that there is no point in participating. They need a challenge.

To summarise, the Waldorf class teachers' experience shows that developing a trustworthy relationship and getting to know interests of a class group helps developing active learning atmosphere in the class. What exercises adolescents' will, according to the teachers interviewed, is giving challenging tasks that require effort and have no easy and quick answer. Therefore, it can be concluded that the teacher's emphasis on challenging their students becomes a part of their teaching method in relation to facilitating the development of students' will.

4.3.3 Helping acquiring healthy habits, rhythm and work ethics

During the conversations, the interviewees report that one of the roles of the teacher in facilitating the development of the will is helping students acquiring rhythm. Work ethics, according to the interviewees, come along with that.

Morris reflects that one of the aspects regarding rhythm that adolescents have to learn is that every action has its consequences. When the teacher sees that a student behaves inappropriately, breaks the rules or just skips lessons, she or he must not keep it to oneself. According to Morris, establishing clear borders and daring to say "no" when necessary is also the role of educators. He further explains that it does not mean being harsh or hard, but loving, strict and consequent, so students can experience that what is said also has to be done

and is going to be done. Therefore, they acquire a rhythm of doing things and it strengthens their will, with reference to Morris.

It is natural, as Richard explains, that the young people at puberty do not know which choices to make or hurt others even if they do not mean to. No situation should be left unsolved.

Richard as a class teacher finds a moment to speak with the child and asks questions that make the student step into the shoes of another person or look at the situation from the perspective of an adult. It is important to let them feel how other people feel about what they do. Therefore, in order to educate adolescents' will, teachers need to find a way to speak to their feelings. Richard feels it is worth thinking about it even in the simplest situations. He describes a situation where a bunch of students skips a lesson, which is held by a teacher who comes to the school only because of this lesson. At the end, no one appears and the teacher travels two hours each way for nothing. He continues:

Did they think of the full bus, which was really stuffy and uncomfortable to be in which the teacher sat for two hours each way? Of course, they did not mean anything bad, but it cannot happen again and they must feel how the other person feels. So I take time to have a talk, describe the picture and let them feel really uncomfortable. (Richard)

In summary, whenever something uncomfortable happens, Richard finds time to talk to pupils and create a detailed image of the situation so they can experience the feelings they caused in other people. He finds it important to talk to his pupils feeling life and make them feel uncomfortable about what they have done.

Education of the pupils' will, even if teachers do not consciously think about it, takes place every day. Morris finds it important that teachers guide their pupils by providing clear borders and rhythm, which they do not break. Pupils naturally tend to stretch the borders but a teacher's self-discipline and persistency trains pupils to step into their own will and learn the work ethics. Morris continues that situations like that occur every day, for example, children might approach him because one of their teachers is not at school and they expect to get a free lesson. As he explains, "it is not meant to be a free lesson when they can have a cup of coffee", and it is his job to tell the students that they have to stay in the class and do the work needed for the school. Most likely they pupils will begin a long debate on why not and that they can do it at home, but "anyway, it ends with them sitting down and doing their job, because I do my job in what you call educating their will. I never give up". Morris finds it of

utmost importance that pupils learn rhythm and work ethics, and “there have to be certain borders that cannot be stretched or extended”.

On the contrary, giving space and not acting straight away is what Tessa offers. Surely, there are situations when the teacher must participate immediately, but there are many when drawing back and reflecting on it after is more important. She continues:

If a child falls from a chair you must catch him, but there are many situations when you should draw back and you just leave it. You do not interfere. Draw back and ask after – what just happened? (Tessa)

What Tessa concludes is that drawing back is a conscious act of the will of the teacher in order to teach children to be responsible. Teachers should practice not to interfere straight ahead and leave pupils a space for responsibility, according to Tessa. Students should experience the consequences their actions cause themselves, and teachers should not solve problems instead of them. What are they going to do about it? How are they going to solve it? It is their task, Tessa states, and the task of the teacher in this case is not to react and to hold back purposefully.

Morris admits that sometimes adults are prone on “helping” students too much, which does not help in the development of their will. He explains that if a student wants to do something, adults too often make it happen for him. He questions - how are they going to learn to be independent and get hold of their own will if they do not have to practice that? He as a father and a teacher believes that children should experience the feeling of striving for something and the process of getting “there”; overcoming difficulties and obstacles themselves is healthy for their development.

In summary, the teachers emphasize the importance of helping pupils acquiring rhythms and habits. Sometimes it means guidance and interfering in a situation straight away, but sometimes it means the opposite – drawing back so students take the responsibility for the situation and face the consequences themselves.

4.3.4 Giving more responsibility to students

It appears in the previous section that a part of teachers’ role in facilitating the development of student’s will is being able to draw back and not taking the students’ responsibility. This sub-chapter gathers practical ideas and thoughts on how to facilitate the development of students’ will through giving them more responsibility.

Richard discusses the need to arouse students' thinking. For him, it means giving a task, which does not have to be easy, and make them think about the steps to do it or to solve it. Pupils need to be challenged so there is a need to engage the will and be active. The teacher should never do instead of students or tell them what to do exactly. Why would they be wilful and active if the learning situation does not require that? When students do something demanding themselves, it usually results with joy and enthusiasm, which also nurtures their will, as Richard explains. Teacher remains the guiding spirit, but students do the task. Diplomacy, being able to provoke students, and guiding students in such a way they do not notice, are the pedagogical "tricks" that Richard uses in order to activate his students.

Morris provides an example from his class tutoring experience. There is a lesson every week where class as a group takes responsibility to lead it themselves and to solve different issues regarding the class life, be it organizational matters as a class trip and fundraising or social matters. This is the time when teachers hold back and provide guidance only when asked. He finds it a good exercise for the will since the students have to work together and find common ground. The students have to think about steps of organizing, the time needed, people responsible, and the plan b when it goes wrong etc.

All the interviewees emphasize that when pupils enter their adolescence, teachers have to draw back a lot more than ever before. Morris explains that the teacher's role at this point is to be there and provide guidance, if students need help, but the teacher is not there anymore "to put something in their hands and to give it to them".

Jane stresses the importance of teachers drawing back and letting pupils get into trouble, "giving the space to mash on the floor" and solve it themselves. She further adds that many students do not start working unless there is a serious problem, "unless they have a knife at their throat". In situations like that, it is important to talk to the child and then to stick to the consequences, for example, if it is a talk with the parents and the child about passing the exam to stay in the school, and it is not passed, the child must go. According to Jane, consequences provide a space "where a child starts to think and feel". She explains: "You cannot help all of your students to get the right willpower to work by taking them by the hand. That is utopia. That is impossible. You need to step back and you need to do that more than you are willing to do".

Tessa elaborates that in order to be able to have an independent secondary school like working atmosphere when pupils get older, also primary school teachers have to put effort into developing these skills. Drawing back and handing the process over to students starts already in classes 6, 7 and 8. Tessa adds that it can start with as simple example as the following – pupils responsibility for their tools. She introduces a situation where the teacher takes the whole responsibility.

The teacher prepares the little animals you have to sew. The needle and thread, cloth cut in the right space in a little bag so you would not lose anything. That is all taking away the responsibility for the job, because the teacher prepares it. It works towards a nice result, but it does not help the will. She sits there and controls the process so it has a nice result. It is not much to do with the willing.
(Tessa)

What Tessa explains is that the process of not losing things and bringing them to the class is training the will of pupils. It should be their responsibility. According to Tessa, the focus should be on the process in order to exercise pupils' will, not so much on the aesthetic result.

In conclusion, the interviewees point that teachers should draw back and hand the process over to pupils, as they grow older. As Tessa explained, teachers should practice that already in classes 6 and 7 so pupils can learn to be independent gradually. That might result, with reference to Tessa, with strong willed secondary school students who create independent working atmosphere around them.

4.3.5 Working with pupils in a threefold way

During my conversations with teachers, they emphasized that that lessons should be planned in a way so the teaching material relates to pupils' thinking, willing and feeling. The teachers pointed that they pay careful attention so the lessons are not working only with students' head.

When it comes to addressing the will, according to Richard, it is more about methods and pedagogical "tricks", not so much about the content. He explains that he never thinks about the qualities in such a way when preparing lessons. What he always considers is that every lesson needs an exercise in which the students have to be active participants. His subject is literature and he never gives a readymade material to his students. They have to research, read and find out themselves. Leaving the class intrigued and asking provoking questions are two options that Richard finds activating the students thinking, willing and feeling. He speaks

about responsibility again. The students are responsible for finding answers in his lessons. They are never given answers; they are always given questions. Questions that are intriguing, often controversial and stir their feeling life.

Jane explains that she gives careful attention to the meaning of the tasks she assigns to her pupils. She finds it important that the task addresses pupils not only in their heads and thinking, but also in their feelings and willing. She shares an example of the working forms during the main lesson block on the platonic bodies. The pupils needed to score in three areas. First, a test on the content and skills. Second, creating 3D examples of the different platonic bodies and Archimedes' bodies in coloured paper. Third, drawings and texts in their notebooks, which would look "at completeness, creativity, working neatly and precise". In addition, during the lessons pupils sculptured the platonic bodies in clay. Jane points that everyone was involved in the process and worked hard. It seems that each of the tasks worked with knowledge in a different way – through thinking, willing and feeling.

Tessa shares an example of her lesson, which she considers one of the best in her years of teaching. She finds the success to be in finding ways that let students "step out of their head" and join creative processes. She had a block of history of art and prepared a lesson on Hieronymus Bosch. She put the huge projection of the garden of the lights in front of her pupils and asked what it meant. She explained the students that she would not answer; the task for the children was to ask questions to the painting. Everyone was supposed to prepare ten questions about the painting for the following day. There were twenty-one pupils in the 10th grade and at the end everybody had a hundred and fifty questions. Tessa smilingly reflects on the enthusiasm that the exercise created and pupils' eagerness to learn the answers from her.

For three quarters... It was a complete silence. What a good question! Oh, what a good question! Everyone went on like that, looking for the answers at the same time. At the end everyone puts down their pen and they ask: "OK, teacher, now, what is the answer?" And I said that I had no idea. They looked at me: "How dare you"? This is what history of art is. We do not know, but it does not mean we cannot ask questions. Probably one day in your life you will know the answer.

In summary, the pupils were immersed in the task to a high extent. It was completely silent for three quarters and at the end, they wanted to get the "correct" answer from Tessa, which she had no idea about. I can just imagine the hustle of the pupils; almost a quest like interest and the teacher says that there is no answer. Tessa maintains: "That is training of the will. Training to hold back and training to be alert to the outside".

On the contrary, according to Jane, students have lately been becoming more and more concerned whether the task they are asked to do at school counts for the exams or what grade they would receive. She finds it wrong and feels that teachers as a collegium should crystalize the skills that students need to learn at school apart from content so when finishing the school, they are empowered by skills and awareness and can bring new impulses to the society and improve it. It must be a decision of the school and live in the every corner of it.

Jane continues with an example of a man who works on the project of gathering plastic on the surface of the ocean. He was a Waldorf student “very much aware of environmental issues and of the responsibility of men, not only to take from planet Earth, but also to contribute to it in a positive way”. She recognizes the need for education on sustainability. In one of the Waldorf schools, they organize the “Durability Week”. Former Waldorf pupils come and introduce to what they are doing in their lives and how they have achieved it. Jane explains:

It helps the students to formulate what they think is necessary in the world to support or improve or clean up or... They have to translate their ideas in a realistic form: what is necessary to give it hands and feet, so it can actually be achieved in reality...

In summary, the “Durability Week” provides pupils with the opportunity to see how people carry out their ideas in real life and what it takes to give ideas a form and put them into action.

In conclusion, in order to engage pupils’ will in educational contexts, teachers report that it is especially important is to get children “out of their heads”. In order to do that, the interviewees suggest putting emphasis on the meaningfulness of a process instead of the result whatever subject it is. They suggest such ways as asking intriguing questions, challenging pupils and involving them in creative work. Once again, they emphasize that thinking, will and feeling continuously intertwine and lessons should be planned in a way that addresses each of the three domains.

4.4 Ways for facilitating the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context

I asked the teachers to share their experience in ways for facilitating the development of the will regarding the Waldorf curriculum. My intention was to get an insight for answering the research question about activities that experienced waldorf class teachers see as fruitful regarding the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context. During the

conversations, the teachers emphasized that artistic activities play a huge role in the development of the will; meanwhile, they also mentioned working with the year projects and biographies. I will share a detailed description of teacher's reflections in the following chapter.

Richard finds that artistic activities give students the impulse of the will for several reasons. First, different activities require working with hands, which requires exercising their will. They have to be active. Second, pupils can feel the result by hands as well as aesthetically. It brings them enthusiasm and aesthetic pleasure. Third, artistic activities develop sense of belonging and meaning because pupils use the knowledge they have acquired in different subjects. Richard mentions several examples of how teachers integrate art in the school where he works at. The sixth grade study Rome and collaborate in order to create a huge aqueduct and try it out afterwards, the seventh grade study the Medieval ages and make stained glass artwork, later students render the movement of plates in geography, create different phases of an embryo in anatomy and do serious sculpting.

Both Morris and Richard speak about material resistance. In Morris' school, students work with silver, copper, do woodwork, and make their own jewellery. He asks to imagine how students have to overcome themselves in order to stay on the task when working with hard materials. Students, for example, start with a piece of led and their task is to create a bowl. Morris concludes that it takes a lot of will to do that, for "the process involves a lot of patience, overcoming resistance and being able to carry out a continuous work, and practising to start again after failing".

Richard further provides an insight into pupils working with glass, which, according to him, provides experience in great material resistance. He explains: "Students have to cut it precisely, break it precisely and work with soldering iron, copper foil and tin. Glass often breaks and they have to start again and again". To summarize Richard and Morris' idea, it takes a lot of effort to carry out a project from the beginning to the end when working with resistant materials. Practising not to give up after failing and finish the work no matter how difficult is the process makes it a great exercise for one's will.

Before Tessa mentions all the art subjects, she talks about students' individual year projects. These are projects that students do as their final work in a Waldorfschool; a completely independent work where one puts a lot of effort and presents the results to the whole school

community. There are different choices students make: some write and stage a play, some carve a canoe and pedal the boat through different rivers in their country, meanwhile others design a clothing collection of their own. As Tessa says, it can be a real obstacle course for pupils, which, in fact, exercises their will a lot, and the ability to finish the work presents them as wilful Waldorf students.

Tasks that are open, in Jane's opinion, are the ones that can be a successful practice for exercising one's will. It can bring a result that no one in the class expects. She shares her experience of observing the 11th grade lessons on Parsifal. The pupils needed to create their own main lesson books; they needed to include the story and illustrations. One of the students decided to write poems instead of prose and found herself painting in bright colours every day. She explains, "it was a revelation for the student, for she never thought painting would be her cup of tea. Because of the open choice, she just tried out. And surprised herself". For Jane, it seems that pupils are active when there is no particular frame for the task. According to her, it opens up space for creativity.

Biographies are something that Richard pays a special attention to. In his opinion, with a lively narration and a developed story telling technique, a teacher can introduce students to growth of different people. It appears that there is something common for all of the authors – they have carried out meaningful deeds, not only laid in their beds and dreamt about it, as Richard says grinning. Only by doing, it is possible to reach the result. Many authors in his country have started out as simple peasants, and during the course of their lives the authors have become the representatives of intelligence. Further, he provides an insight into the biography of Orwell, who purposefully tried to get into jail, and Saint-Exupéry, who was required to bomb a kindergarten. As Richard explains, pupils are usually shocked by these authors' life stories. Richard maintains:

My pupils are usually shocked by the fact that Orwell wanted to experience completely everything in his life. He had a whim and fought for quite a long time in order to get into the jail. Was it a whim or the will – difficult to answer. It was an action, which resulted with getting what he wanted to. Or, for example, Saint-Exupéry, who had to bomb a kindergarten. He did not do it; he threw the bomb past it. This is a clear and biographical fact of a human being that reflects the will impulse, not blind execution of an order.

Richard points that many authors have fascinating biographies and they are strong examples because of their will and quest for their own truth. For him, the biographies of Orwell and Saint-Exupéry reflect one's impulses of the will, "not blind execution of an order".

To sum up, this chapter has provided several examples on practices regarding the Waldorf curriculum that in the opinion of the interviewees are fruitful to develop students' will. Working with biographies, giving open tasks, managing the individual year project and the arts and crafts of the curriculum are the examples that teachers mentioned.

4.5 Challenges in the education of the will as perceived by the teachers

This is the last part of my findings and intends to answer the question about the challenges regarding the development of the will that experienced Waldorf class teachers can relate to in an educational context. Different aspects regarding childhood at home and teaching at school are going to be discussed.

4.5.1 Modern technology, media and gaming

The first challenge mentioned is media. Morris recognizes that mentioning media and modern technology as a challenge in the education of the will already is a cliché, but he still finds it true regarding the context of his school and country. In his opinion, the little attention span that media requires results with students getting use to not immersing themselves in different topics or activities. Students hardly ever watch TV, because that is too long. Meanwhile, social media offers information that is always very on the surface. Morris worry is that children do not practice to dig deeper and take information for granted.

Tessa adds that if we look for answers, we can find them on the internet or if we want to know something, we phone someone. The opportunities that modern technology provide, according to Tessa, may cause a lot of distraction, which slows the willing. She points that it is about concentration. She laughingly explains that "of course, you cannot say kids: well concentrate" and points that the teacher has to ask a question. A question that invites children to be here and now and focus.

Richard's worries are similar. What he finds the most challenging is working with students that are addicted to computer games. For some students it is one of the hobbies and they still

manage to find time to read and do other things. Thus, it is possible to awaken their will at school as well. However, for some gaming is almost like a lifestyle.

Then the child comes to school and communicates with his friends how far they are in the game. They often speak about the computer games on phone. They play on their own or together. All they talk about at school is gaming and when they go back home, they can finally game again. In fact, they do not want anything else but to sit and to play, to satisfy their whims. One should be clear about that the whim and the will are two different concepts, even opposite. (Richard)

What Richard expresses is that children who overexpose themselves to computer games do not show any interest in what is happening at school at all. They seem to have a very weak will and they mostly socialize with other students that are interested in the same topic. He draws attention to that there is no connection between satisfying one's whims and the will. Wish and will are two different concepts, and, unfortunately, students who spend much time on gaming are more relating to their wishes, not their will, according to Richard.

4.5.2 Adults around and the system

Jane touches upon a different challenge in facilitating the development of the will – students losing their greediness because of the system. She continues that it has to do a lot with the attitude of the adults around. For the teacher, to follow the Waldorf curriculum of the secondary school means to work a lot on his or herself. That has a direct effect on children and the learning process. Jane explains that we can see many students who are truly interested in the world; it is a pity if they lose this interest. She points that teachers need to work on their own skills and development to mirror the students that everyone is in progress. It is her belief that development never stops and teachers cannot expect their students to progress, if they themselves feel that they are “good enough”.

Richard also gives a comment on the system and expresses his concern that the will in teachers, the same as the will in a big part of our society nowadays, is not big. People's wish to be amused and entertained overtakes the need to spend time on one's own and experience silence.

If we organize free concerts, there are often few spectators, but if you would like to go to the shopping mall on a Saturday, there is not a single place to park your car. Shopping malls have become means of entertainment. We do not have a museum of temporary art, even though it has been widely discussed. (Richard)

The tendency of people wishing to be entertained, as Richard notices, is growing, meanwhile, less and less people prefer to spend time with themselves and appreciate silence, which, for Richard, is connected to the will impulses.

4.5.3 Childhood and rhythms at home

The development of the will during childhood at home is a challenge that Morris speaks about. The will that teachers look at in school settings is mostly developed, or exactly the opposite, when the students are little, for example, their first three years. The environment where a child grows up plays an immense role. The lack of the will in a pupil often has to do with adults, their parents. In Morris' experience, some adults do not give their children an opportunity to strive for something; everything is given to them. He explains that many children do not know what a real "no" is; the borders are not clear for them. Morris continues that, in fact, they do not have anyone around who says no, means it and is consequent about it. As a result, their will is negatively affected. If a child is not given the opportunity to experience his will and to get hold of his or her will in early stages, it is challenging to work with a student's will later at school, according to Morris.

Meanwhile, Morris as a parent speaks about how complicated it can be for parents to exercise their children's will. Everyone is human and people sometimes just want to choose the easiest way and relax. He shares his experience from being home with children and trying to keep a strict and healthy rhythm of the day.

Now we are at home [I asked additional questions during the time schools were closed due to *Covid*]. It would be very easy just to let my children sleep in. Then they probably would like to go out and we could postpone studying until evening. But then again something different would happen in the evening. Then the next day. That is a natural thing to all of us, adults also. To postpone things as long as possible. There comes the challenge. I wake them up and we start studying at 08:30, as it would happen on a normal school day. I keep the same rhythm. They have to keep the rhythm and do things as they do at school. It requires a lot of argumentation on their side. Could we not do it now? Could we go out and do sports instead? I have to be strong enough to say that we do the main lesson subjects first and then we can go out. To keep this day by day is a challenge, of course, it would be easier to postpone things for thirty minutes from time to time but we all know what would happen then. (Morris)

In short, Morris points to the importance of keeping a rhythm at home. If there is one exception, there always comes another one and then another one. As he explains, naturally, children would like to postpone tasks and break the rhythm, but adults should take the

responsibility to help them stay in it. Morris further explains, that it is a challenge for parents to say no when the kids are really pushing for yes. He exemplifies that “little children might fall on the ground and go a little hysterical or teenagers do this kind of emotional blackmailing – hey mum, everyone can stay home from time to time”. Nevertheless, Morris experiences that rhythm and one’s ability to stick to it is healthy for children and the development of their will.

This chapter has looked at the challenges that teachers recognize regarding facilitating the development of adolescents’ will in an educational context. First, teachers mention media and overuse of modern technology to affect pupils’ will. Distraction is what comes hand in hand with modern technology. However, Richard and Jane point to the huge impact that adults and teachers have on students’ will. Is the attitude of teachers and adults around one that is worth mirroring by students? Another point that teachers raise is pupils’ childhood and education at home; the rhythm they live in with their families.

4.6 Summary

In this chapter, I illustrated my findings on how experienced Waldorf class teachers’ reflect on the will in a Waldorf educational context. The first part of the findings reported experienced Waldorf class teachers’ perception and understanding of the will in their educational settings. The teachers suggest that the will should be looked upon in relation to thinking and feeling, for these three qualities together present the human being as a harmonious and social being. It appeared that they perceive will as a drive that makes the person act – as something that takes place before the action and is given impulse by a thought and a feeling. In this light, enthusiasm becomes an important aspect of the drive – enthusiasm through a connection to the subject and to the teacher.

The following part looked upon the informants’ perception and understanding of the educator’s role in facilitating the development of will in adolescents in a Waldorf educational context. This part of the findings seemed to put a lot of emphasis on the teacher’s role in the development of the will in pupils, which I will discuss in detail in the next chapter. Helping students to acquire healthy habits, rhythm and work ethics emerged as a central theme in the findings. Accordingly, the findings appeared to view the educator’s role in connection to teaching and facilitating for the child’s active participation in the world. In this light, the

teacher becomes an active co – creator in an ethical relationship between the child and the world.

The third part explored the activities that experienced Waldorf class teachers see as fruitful regarding the development of the will in Waldorf educational settings. Among the activities and ways the teachers mention, three subthemes emerge: approaching every activity through creative and artistic element; work with resistant materials; and activating students through tasks that provide a question, but no answer. The findings emphasized the importance of students' active participation in learning process. The research informants relate activity to the will and by asking students to be active in lessons, teachers are likely to invite pupils to step into their will.

The last part of my findings gathered ideas about challenges that the teachers interviewed relate to regarding the development of the will. The findings highlighted the need for pupils to experience the opportunities to strive for something and to overcome difficulties themselves, which is an invitation to adults around, both teachers and parents, to support that.

Another theme that the findings presented is the rhythm and habits children experience at home. Teachers pointed to the difficulties for children to understand borders and work ethics in an educational setting, if they do not experience it as a rhythm and a habit at home. Lastly, overexposure to modern technology and social media is seen as something that softens the borders and does not facilitate pupils' ability to strive for something and dig deeper, for it offers quick answers to almost any question and the information stays on the surface level.

In the following chapter, I will discuss the themes that emerged in the findings of this study in more detail, in relation the conceptual framework and the literature reviewed.

5. Discussion

5.1 Introduction

As mentioned in the preceding chapter, the purpose of my study is to explore how the characteristics and expressions of the will have been understood in a Waldorf educational context and how experienced Waldorf class teachers view the possibilities for facilitating the development of the adolescents' will in Waldorf educational settings. This chapter presents a discussion of my findings of the literature reviewed and the conceptual framework of this study. The conceptual framework of this study consists of such concepts as three-foldness, rhythms, habits, action, resistance, and striving.

I have organized this chapter in a way that sheds light on each of the research questions one by one. I start the discussion with insights that this study has provided on how experienced Waldorf class teachers perceive and understand will in their educational settings. Further, I discuss the educator's role in facilitating the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context. Then, activities that experienced Waldorf class teachers see as fruitful regarding the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context are discussed. Lastly, this chapter looks upon the challenges that the teachers experience and can relate to regarding facilitating the adolescents' will in educational settings.

5.2 Characteristics and expressions of the will

In this chapter, I have tried to deepen my understanding of the characteristics and expressions of the will in the Waldorf educational context. The chapter looks at the characteristics and expressions of the will through a conversation between the findings of this study and the ideas of Rudolf Steiner, John Dewey, Hannah Arendt, Hugh Sockett, and Gert Biesta.

Three-foldness of the soul or "There is something wrong with you Mercedes, buddy"

Waldorf education aims that students have developed thinking, deepened feelings, and the greatest possible energy and capacity of the will (Steiner, 1997). The will, according to Steiner, is an inseparable part of the threefold function of the soul - thinking, willing, and feeling —, for they intertwine continuously.

The findings of my study reported that the Waldorf teachers perceive the will as a social concept that is directed towards society. What Richard stressed was that the will is characterized by a wish to do something, a wish to fulfil one's hopes, dreams, actions and ideas, and by carrying them out, there is always an impact on the surrounding social environment. In other words, if a person takes an action, creates or learns something, it influences the surrounding people.

Arendt (1998) explains that human beings are capable of action, and, therefore, the surrounding environment can expect something unique to come to fore. Action, according to Arendt (1998), is related to the will and it is always connected to the social environment, for "action and speech need the surrounding presence of others" and "to be isolated is to be deprived to act" (Arendt, 1998, p. 210). In other words, Arendt's idea is that action cannot take place in isolation and it always has an impact on the surrounding environment. She explains the will as a "spring of action" and one's ability and freedom to act.

To discuss the social expressions of the will and the three-foldness of thinking, willing and feeling, I would like to bring Richard's story about his lessons on the Little Prince back. He together with his students analyses the harmony of the three soul functions – thinking, willing and feeling – in each of the characters. His students in class 12 draw something similar to the logo of *Mercedes* (one segment for thinking, one for willing and one for feeling) and evaluate which of the qualities dominate in the characters and how it affects the harmony of a person. One of the characters whom the Little Prince meets is the Tippler who, as Richard explains, "drinks to forget his shame, but he is ashamed because he drinks". Is the Tippler a harmonious human being? Richard would ask: "What is deformed – is it thinking, willing or feeling?" Students are usually very enthusiastic about this activity and start analysing characters in everything they read together with the class and their classmates. When a classmate acts unacceptably, there might follow a commentary "there is something wrong with your Mercedes, buddy".

The will, for Richard, appears as a domain that connects thinking to feeling and only then presents a person as a social being. A lack of one of the functions, in Richard's opinion, makes a person "rather antisocial". The findings pointed out that one's will seems to express itself as action and movement – an inner and an outer movement – and it has a thought and a feeling behind it. It appeared in the findings that all the teachers interviewed looked at the will in a

social context. They focus on how a person is in a relationship with other people and the environment. The student's attitude towards work, other people, rules and ethics were emergent themes in the findings when discussing the characteristics and expressions of the will. This study connects it to the art of living together and Biesta's (2012b; 2015a) notion of a worldly existence and reaching grown-up-ness, for finding a balance in relationships to the material and the social world is central to his idea about resistance in education and the education of the will.

The ability to stay in "the frustrating middle ground" as an expression of the will

Biesta (2012a) proposes an argument for a conception of education, which creates a healthy relationship between the world and a child, which is "centred on our worldly existence, that is, our existence in, with and for the world (p. 3)". He recognizes a need for education that is world-centred. Accordingly, he questions to what extent we are (still) able and willing to engage with the world and to lead a worldly rather than a private life (p. 94). Accordingly, he identifies three ways of how people can respond to encounters with resistance. First, a denial or destruction of the otherness and strangeness. Second, withdrawing, holding back and shying away. The third option creates a truly educational space, for it is to stay in the middle; neither destroy the world (the thing, which causes resistance) nor destroys the self so it is possible to engage with the world. Biesta (2012b) calls it "the frustrating middle ground". Neither, according to him, it means to have too little will so the person draws back and shies away, nor too big, which leads a person to suppress the *otherness*. The ability to stay in "the frustrating middle ground" seems to be about gradually finding balance with what resists in the social or material world. Biesta (2012b) states that this ability can be practised through experiencing encounters of resistance in education, which, according to him, facilitate the development of the will. The concept of resistance will be discussed further in section 5.3.5. *Staging encounters with resistance.*

Striving as an expression of the will

The teachers interviewed, apart from the social aspect of the will and acting, pointed to such characteristics of the will as being able to put as much effort as needed to carry out a project and being able to overcome difficulties and obstacles to finish it. This study suggests that Sockett's concept of striving can contribute to understanding this finding. For Sockett (1998), the notion of striving is central to one's will and it does not mean simply trying, which is a synonym to intending, but it "carries with it the assumption of difficulty" (p. 199). As we

strive for things, according to Sockett (1998), we encounter difficulties that are "obstacle in nature, other people, and ourselves" (p. 199). If we look at Biesta's (2012b) concept of resistance, we could say that we experience the social and material resistance as we strive for something. Striving seems to manifest in an ability to overcome the obstacles encountered in nature, other people and ourselves and an ability to get along with difficulties to achieve a goal. Sockett (1998) exemplifies that teachers sometimes meet pupils who seem to possess a great capacity of will and manage whatever task. He maintains:

For these students no task appears too great; no call for greater strivings goes unanswered. They manifest commitment, determination, and doggedness against difficult odds and conflicting demands. (Sockett, 1998, p. 198)

In other words, Sockett (1998) mentions such characteristics of the will as commitment, doggedness and determination, and he explains that pupils who possess these characteristics are willing to take up any challenges.

According to the findings, teachers can often experience situations when a student is going to finish a complicated and frustrating task, not because of outside pressure but because of inside pressure. As Tessa described, what lies behind the effort that a student can put in finishing such a project, is the connection to a subject or a teacher. Accordingly, another nuance in understanding the characteristics and expressions of the will that stems from the findings of this study is connected to one's enthusiasm. The informants reported that when students are enthusiastic about what they do, they are in connection, for they have positive feelings for the process. It appears that enthusiasm about the subject or a connection to a teacher encourages pupils to strive for doing things. The connection is the feeling part there, which is always connected to the will, according to the teachers interviewed. Establishing harmony in the class so active learning can take place and pupils step into their will was an apparent theme in every conversation with the teachers and it will be discussed in detail in the next part of the chapter, which reflects on the educator's role in facilitating the development of the will.

Resistance as an educational expression of the will

On the contrary, from time to time every teacher might experience resistance in the class. The findings showed that the teachers view resistance in the class as something opposite to the will. If the teacher does not consider it, it might result in tension in the class and impair active learning process.

As Morris explained, it is about teachers' ability to see what is going into the class and adapt. Morris identified two reasons for resistance among children. First, the class as a group might have had a complicated day, which naturally happens from time to time. Second, more often he finds that perhaps he has caused resistance in the class by being not prepared enough or being busy in his head with some personal things. Morris maintained:

More often, I find that I was not there one hundred per cent or I was not prepared enough as I should have been. I was not present; I was not one hundred per cent with them, because I was worried about something or thinking about something else. That is what they reflected. That is something I can always change. I am sure that if there is resistance in the class, it is we, teachers, who cause it. That is what my experience shows. Us not being able to meet their interests and learning their needs. (Morris)

In summary, Morris pointed out that sometimes the teacher might cause resistance in the class. He finds that the reasons for lessons, which he is not fully satisfied with, can be often found in himself. Further, the findings suggested that resistance is an educational expression of the will, which teachers should consider and relate to.

5.3 Teachers' role in facilitating the development of the will

All four experienced Waldorf class teachers agreed that the educator has a multifaceted role in facilitating the development of adolescents' will. They mentioned such aspects as being a worthwhile example, engaging students into active work forms and challenge them, developing a trustworthy class relationship and helping pupils to acquire healthy rhythms, habits and work ethics. The following chapter discusses how teachers perceive and understand the educator's role in facilitating the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context.

5.3.1 Teacher as a role model and guide through difficulty

The teacher's personhood and the feelings that students have for their teacher have an impact on their learning largely (Dahlin, 2017). As discussed earlier, the enthusiasm that a child has about a subject, learning process or connection to a teacher, might become his or her drive and to invite a pupil to work hard. Accordingly, teachers should gradually establish a warm and trusting relationship and harmony between themselves and their students (Steiner, in Dahlin, 2017).

The importance of the teacher's personhood was also apparent in the findings of this study. The teachers interviewed pointed to adolescents' unconscious and conscious search for a role model and a worthwhile example to follow. One of the teachers emphasized the importance of teachers working on their personality and development so pupils find them worth following. As the teacher emphasized, it is worth asking whether students would like to learn something from a teacher like oneself. Being a teacher is a continuous development and one should never think "I am good enough", with reference to Jane. "What message would it convey to pupils?" Jane wondered during our conversation.

According to Dahlin (2017), to develop the whole human being (thinking, willing and feeling), teachers need to be passionate about their subject and study it in such a way that they can bring an artistic element to their lessons. This aspect was broadly discussed in the findings. Renewing and reviving a subject, according to the teachers interviewed, is the key to teaching that invites pupils to be active. On the contrary, if the teaching material and attitude are the same as thirty years ago, it is a dead subject indeed and puts students' willing forces to sleep. Meanwhile, the findings highlighted that the teacher's expertise in a subject is especially important when working with adolescents, for they question the authority more than ever.

To establish a warm and trusting relationship, as the findings reflect, it is important to get to know the children and their needs, for example, the characteristics of the age group. Age-appropriate teaching was an emergent theme in the findings. According to Jane, a true interest in the children's world is what is at stake. Jane exemplified:

It very much has to do if you reach out to the world the child is in. If what you are talking about or what you are bringing as a teacher is abstract or has a lot of to do with yourself not with the world of the children, you need to bend down or be interested in the world the child lives in. [...] If a teacher is pushing them down, asking students what to do even without looking at them or not considering their age...if a teacher is having his own party, as to say, or has his thing in mind that he wants to reach as a goal, then it is easy to lose children. (Jane)

In other words, from the point that Jane raised, it seems that teachers should do all their best to understand groups of children they are teaching to develop a connection. "Understanding children" might be interpreted as getting to know their interests, finding a common language, being aware of their age group and its characteristics and to be truly interested in their world.

Socket (1988) suggests that the teacher's role of being a model and a guide through difficulty is of primary importance in facilitating the development of children's will. It might be understood that children need to see and experience that adults whom they trust can manage to face difficulties. He justifies the importance of this aspect with the fact that many children have complicated backgrounds and face severe difficulties in life, as well as life, brings different challenges for every human being. Therefore, children should be equipped with resources to endure difficulties and achieve their goals. Similar nuances regarding the teacher as a role model through difficulty appeared in the findings. As one of the informants exemplified, when children see that their teacher puts effort and manage to do something highly complicated, they get the feeling that they can do it as well. Therefore, it might be concluded that adolescents gain confidence in themselves and the courage to encounter resistance, if they see an example 'how' in the adults around.

Further, the teacher's motive and drive, according to all the teachers interviewed, influences the pupils' motive and drive. A wilful teacher provides an example for the pupils of how to get hold of their own will. It also means being an example of someone who is consequent and always does what one has promised. All the interviewees agreed that the teacher should train to be a wilful person, for his or her capacity of the will reflects in their students. Further, the findings pointed to how teacher's change of attitude mirrors in pupil's attitude. A teacher cannot change anyone, but if the teacher trains herself to be a wilful person, it is probable to affect pupils' attitude. As Tessa said, a teacher cannot tell her student "act properly and behave like a wilful person". She has to work with herself. Her example was that she used to run in the class during the very last minute, meanwhile, expected the children to be always on time. Then, she decided to give herself an exercise and arrive 10 minutes early to her classes, which affected pupils straight away and she could see changes in the class atmosphere.

The findings seem to support Biesta's (2012a) argument about giving teaching back to education in the "new language of learning" (p. 37). He argues that teachers must not be seen only as facilitators of the learning process, for learning is an activity when a person learns from someone and does it for a specific reason. According to Biesta (2012a), successful teaching lets students experience encounters with moments of resistance, which develop a dialogical relationship with the world and pupils' will. It is the teacher who brings something new to the class, lets it "arrive" and teaching becomes an interruption of some kind, according

to Biesta (2012a). I will discuss this idea further in section 5.3.5. *Staging encounters with what resists*.

5.3.2 Helping to develop healthy rhythms, habits and work ethics

In Waldorf education, developing healthy rhythms and habits in teaching and learning is seen as a possibility to support pupils' inner strength and the will (Steiner, 1996c). As Mathisen (2015) explains, the human constitution has its rhythms and age-appropriate ways of teaching can work with them in a healthy way. Rhythms in teaching and learning interweave every aspect of the curriculum. Rhythm is considered as a living organism that educates children for freedom (Mathisen, 2015).

Rhythm in relationships with the social and material world and rhythm as ethics is a theme that emerged in the findings of this study. The teachers often mentioned rhythms and habits in the sense that they gradually develop into a healthy attitude towards work, environment and other people. One aspect that appeared in the findings is the importance of developing clear boundaries and understanding of consequences.

Morris provided different examples of children and teenagers trying to stretch borders by avoiding work, skipping a lesson and not doing homework. He explained that it is a natural thing that adolescents test where the borders are and, therefore, it is adults and teachers' role to help them establish clear borders. Morris maintained:

It does not mean harsh or hard, but loving, strict and consequent so students can experience that what is said also has to be done and is going to be done.

Therefore, they acquire a rhythm of doing things and it strengthens their will.

In other words, Morris pointed to the pupils' need for guidance that roots in a caring and loving relationship. A teacher's example of having clear boundaries and being consequent help pupils acquire a rhythm of doing things. Morris emphasized that "they have to learn the rhythm and the work ethics and there have to be certain borders that cannot be stretched or extended". As Jane emphasized, "doing things" and not trying to escape or slip away should become a matter of habit. One might relate it to practising the ability "to stay in the middle ground" so it becomes a habit, which, according to Dewey (2012), is the will. Dewey (2012) relates habits to the will, for they provide people with their working capacities and put their thoughts in order according to how strong the thoughts should appear in one's mind. It might

be interpreted, as suggested in this study, that habits equip people with everything necessary to take action.

This study suggests that helping to develop healthy rhythms, habits and work ethics can be looked upon through Biesta's (2015a) argument on children gradually reaching grown-up-ness in educational settings. Biesta (2015a) explains that schools should work with children in a way so they gradually reach grown-up-ness in the process of learning. He continues that "grown-up-ness responds to the enduring challenges of human life and human living: the questions of democracy, ecology and care that in each case call upon us to respond in a grown-up, the non-ego-logical way" (p. 10). In other words, grown-up-ness might be understood as one's ability to have a sustainable relationship with other people and the environment.

On the contrary, according to Biesta (2015a), the temporary society focuses on its desires. As Arendt explains, our society is characterized by the mode of labour, which "is the process of production and consumption, just like the biological process: ongoing and repetitive. It is a process based on always new, emerging needs that should be satisfied again and again" (Arendt, in Pols & Berding, 2018, p. 40). Biesta (2015a) sees schools as places of refuge where children can practise other ways of being and being together. He insists that the schools must resist "by standing for the value of grown-up-ness in a world that quite often rather wants us to remain children" (p. 10).

The findings suggest that a grown-up existence entails such qualities as care for other people, patience, ability to invest effort, not escaping difficulty and other that we might relate to the art of living together in non-ego-logical ways. Regarding developing healthy rhythms, work ethics and habits, the research findings drew my attention to the teachers' role to intervene in problem situations. Two of the teachers reflected on the need to solve situations when students act in socially unacceptable ways. As Richard explained, it is natural that pupils make mistakes, because they sometimes think only after they have done something, and it does not mean that they have bad intentions. Meanwhile, it is important to intervene and to point to the problem straight away so they realize that their behaviour is not acceptable. Richard used the example of a group of students that decided to skip a lesson and their teacher travelled two hours each way for nothing (it was his only lesson). Richard continued:

Did they think of the full bus, which was stuffy and uncomfortable to be in which

the teacher sat for two hours each way? Of course, they did not mean anything bad, but it cannot happen again and they must feel how the other person feels. So I take time to talk, describe the picture and let them feel uncomfortable. (Richard)

In other words, Richard explained that the students did not imagine and think about how the teacher would feel. They skipped the lesson and their teacher spent four hours travelling in a stuffy and uncomfortable bus but had no lesson at the end. Richard's suggestion is to talk to the pupils as soon as possible and let them step into the shoes of another person and feel the discomfort the other person might have had. At this point, according to Richard, it is important to touch students' feeling life so it does not only stay as information for their head. They must learn ethics and a respectful attitude towards other people, according to Richard.

Accordingly, Sockett (1998) relates to the will in a social context. He explains that the notion of effort and striving is at the heart of qualities of the will and they manifest as "habits or character traits or virtues" that "provide students with a major resource for the achievement of goals in socially acceptable ways" (p. 207). This study suggests that practising investing effort and doing things in a way that is respectful towards the surrounding environment is likely to strengthen the children's will and show them how to achieve their goals in socially acceptable ways or "grown-up" ways as suggested by Biesta (2015a).

5.3.3 Giving students more responsibility

The last part of the previous section dealt with teachers intervening in any problem situation whenever necessary so pupils would know when they act in socially unacceptable ways straight away. This part of the chapter will focus on completely the opposite – the teacher's drawing back as a conscious act of will.

The research participants pointed out that sometimes problem situations require the opposite attitude – to draw back so pupils find out how to deal with consequences themselves. The teachers interviewed pointed out that educators should practice not to interfere straight ahead and leave pupils space for responsibility. According to Jane, consequences provide a space "where a child starts to think and feel". She explained that teachers cannot help all their students "to get the right willpower to work by taking them by the hand". She emphasized that sometimes teachers need to step back more than they are willing to do.

As the informants pointed, sometimes it gets overwhelming for adults and teachers and, in a way, they help too much and pupils do not have the opportunity to practice being responsible

for their choices and behaviour. Why would they be responsible if we do not ask them and do not let them to? As Morris explained, if a student wants to do something, adults too often make it happen for them, which does not train his or her will. He as a father and a teacher believes that children should experience the feeling of striving for something and the process of getting “there”, overcoming difficulties and obstacles. This idea is further discussed in section 5.5 *Challenges regarding facilitating the development of the will that teachers relate to*.

The research findings reflected that independent secondary school like working atmosphere is a decision of the whole school community and lives in every corner of the school. To educate pupils in a way that they become responsible and wilful students, also primary school teachers have to pay attention to developing these skills and attitudes. Tessa mentioned that drawing back and handing the process over to students starts already in classes 6, 7 and 8.

According to Jane, students have lately been becoming more and more concerned whether the task they are asked to do at school counts for the exams or what grade they would receive. She finds it wrong and feels that teachers as a collegium should crystalize the skills that students need to learn at school apart from content

Sockett (1998) states that teachers must see the development of the qualities of the will as a matter of school policy. He describes the importance of children seeing that all teachers value these qualities as important. Sockett (1998) maintains:

If some teachers emphasize carefulness and others do not if some get children to restrain themselves and others do not if some fail to insist on agreed classroom conditions that will promote concentration, whatever those conditions are, pupils will not see these qualities as important. [...] The total learning environment will lack consistency and coherence for the child. (p. 211)

In other words, teachers should agree upon consistence and coherence about what they ask from their pupils and what qualities they regard as important. Otherwise, children will not experience it as a rhythm of the school and see them as important. Sockett (1998) further adds that the dimension of developing the personal capability of pupils is content free and, therefore, can provide “a cross-curriculum framework of mutual understanding among teachers” (p. 211).

Tessa described that teachers' drawing back and handing the process over to students starts already in classes 6, 7 and 8. She added that it can start with a simple example as the

following – pupils responsibility for their tools. Tessa introduced a situation where the teacher who has the best intentions actually takes the whole responsibility away from her students.

The teacher prepares the little animals you have to sew. The needle and thread, cloth cut in the right space in a little bag so you would not lose anything. That is all taking away the responsibility for the job because the teacher prepares it. It works towards a nice result, but it does not help the will. She sits there and controls the process so it has a nice result. It is not much to do with the willing. (Tessa)

What Tessa explained was that the process of not losing things and bringing them to the class is training the will of pupils. It should be their responsibility. According to Tessa, the focus should be on the process to exercise pupils' will, not so much on the aesthetic result.

This possibly brings an interesting nuance into the discussion – how meaningful are the activities that teachers carry out in crafts. Crafts and practical work are a great part of the Waldorf curriculum (Dahlin, 2017; Rawson, 2020). As this study suggests, it is worth rethinking for teachers whether they achieve the goal they have intended to in different practical activities. Do we as teachers put enough emphasis on the meaningfulness of the process? What can children learn and develop by the process we offer? Do they learn to take responsibility for their work?

All the informants pointed out that the older the students grow, the more teachers have to drawback. Morris explained that the teacher's role at this point is to be there for guidance if students need help, but the teacher is not there anymore "to put something in their hands and to give it to them". This can be practised in several ways in educational settings, as the findings suggest. Morris provided an example from his school where there is a lesson every week for the class as a group to take responsibility and lead it to solve different issues regarding the class life, be it organizational matters as a class trip and fundraising or social matters. This way, students have to work together and find a common ground, which is not always that easy. Teachers are nearby if they are asked to help, but they do not provide answers and "do not give anything ready in pupils' hands". They have to do it themselves. Other examples from the findings regarding practising responsibility will be discussed in the following parts of this chapter.

5.3.4 Facilitating students' active participation

It appears that all of the teachers interviewed connect will to being active and being engaged. Richard explained that he always considers that every lesson needs an exercise in which the students have to be active participants. He suggested not giving pupils readymade materials but inviting them to research, read and find out themselves. In his lessons, pupils are never given answers. He tries to come up with a question that stirs their curiosity and students have to provide their answers. He mentioned that questions, which are intriguing, often controversial and stir pupils' feeling life and might result in their active engagement in the process.

With reference to Schieren (2012), Steiner, in his lectures to teachers, emphasized the paramount importance of education of the will, which in this context relates to students' active participation in the formation of dispositions and conditions and constructing reality. Schieren (2012) maintains:

Only insofar as teaching style is not restricted to conveying contents of this kind alone, but takes account of the individual mind's active contribution to the formation of representations and makes practical, didactic use of it, will the mind's participation in the construction of reality enter into experience. (Schieren, 2012, p. 66).

In summary, Schieren (2012) emphasize that lessons, which are more about conveying the content and provide ready-made representations, do not involve pupils in active participation in learning and constructing knowledge. Similarly, Arendt (1971) has stated that there is no learning in education that is based on the transmission of knowledge and Dewey (2012) points that teaching forms, which are built on conveying content, dulls children's curiosity.

The description of the lesson on Hieronymus Bosch done by Tessa seems to be an example of stirring children's curiosity and involving them in the construction of reality. It was her block of history of art, in which she put the huge projection of the garden of the lights in front of her pupils and asked what it meant. The task was to ask questions about the painting. Everyone was supposed to prepare ten questions about the painting for the following day. There were twenty-one pupils in the 10th grade and, in the end, everybody had a hundred and fifty questions. Tessa reflected on the enthusiasm that the exercise created and pupils' eagerness to learn the answers from her.

For three quarters... It was complete silence. What a good question! Oh, what a

good question! Everyone went on like that, looking for the answers at the same time. In the end, everyone puts down their pen and they ask: "OK, teacher, now, what is the answer?" And I said that I had no idea. They looked at me: "How dare you"? This is what history of art is. We do not know, but it does not mean we cannot ask questions. Probably one day in your life you will know the answer.

In summary, the pupils were immersed in the task to a high extent. It was completely silent for three quarters and at the end, they wanted to get the "correct" answer from Tessa, which she had no idea about. Tessa maintained: "That is a training of the will. Training to hold back and training to be alert to the outside".

The teachers reflected that sometimes the teacher's task is to "to make students willing". Richard explained that not always a ninth grader can get hold of his or her will regarding the characteristics that this particular age has. Richard exemplified:

When you look at a ninth-grader, oh, of course often they are not willing to do anything at all. They prefer sleeping on the table. They look bored, lazy and will-less. There comes my task – to make them willing. I have to plan an activity in a way they start feeling - yes, I want to do it and it is going to go well. (Richard)

What Richard described was that a ninth-grader might leave an impression that they are bored, lazy and will-less. He sees it as the task of the teacher to move and awaken students, for they actually can be active.

Speaking about students' active participation in reality construction, the Waldorf curriculum implicates a lot of practical work for adolescents. Steiner believed that education must provide everything necessary for real life. When entering the third period of seven years, with reference to Steiner, "the human being must be led directly to all that touches us most vitally in the life of the current time" (Steiner, as cited in Staley, 2009, p. 36). The curriculum invites students to learn everything connected with trade, industry, agriculture, farming, commerce, forestry, also such subjects as world affairs (Staley, 2009). According to Rawson (2020), these types of activities are meaningful for students and, therefore, provide agentic learning experiences.

5.3.5 Staging encounters with what resists

Biesta (2012a, 2012b) underlines the importance of experiencing resistance in both material world (working with resistant materials) and the social world (human world). In his opinion, education starts where the point of resistance begins. He states that without resistance in education, it is merely a monologue of the teacher. Resistance, according to Biesta (2012a),

provides meaningfulness in teaching and learning. He suggests that teachers are responsible for "staging" possibilities for children to encounter resistance. Teachers must support a dialogue with what resists, invite pupils to perceive encounters with resistance as positive and help children to cope with difficulties so they do not shy away (Biesta, 2012b). Through resistance in education, according to Biesta (2012b), a healthy relationship between the child and the word is created and encounters of resistance facilitate the education of the will.

The research findings reported that teachers find it important for children to experience the process of overcoming themselves and different obstacles to develop their will. They also mentioned different "interruptions of some kind" (Biesta, 2012a) they bring to their lessons, among them were asking provoking questions, leaving the class intrigued and challenging them. The findings suggested that teachers find adolescents to opt for challenges – they naturally are ready and require bigger challenges. Thus, they pointed out, as mentioned earlier, that the teacher must exercise his or her students' will by tasks that require them to be active. Students seem to be greedy for new knowledge and skills, and, as Jane stated, apart from the knowledge and content, pupils should be empowered by skills and awareness, because they can bring new impulses to the society and improve it.

Biesta's (2012a, 2012b) concept of resistance in education and the notion of "staying in the frustrating middle ground", as well as Arendt's (1961) concept of action, seem to shed light on an important aspect of Waldorf education – facilitating for the pupils coming into the world and renewing it. It was Rudolf Steiner's confidence that pupils need to achieve the ability to face different challenges in their life, be courageous, independent and innovative. Meanwhile, a person should base his or her decisions and actions on a deeply rooted ethical foundation. He saw education as a force for social change and was confident that pupils can contribute to the development of society by bringing something new and fresh if they are not asked to repeat everything present already. His ideas were that the society changes so education should not adjust students to the society of a particular time or train for a specific profession. (Dahlin, 2017; Mathisen, 2014).

Biesta (2012b) explains that working with hands offer the important opportunity for the education of the will regarding the material world. The domain of hands is a unique domain, through hands and action people connect to the world immediately. An example of experiencing material resistance is working with resistant materials (such as wood, metal,

glass etc.). Not only working with these materials, according to Biesta (2012b) let the young people encounter resistance (because the process is difficult and frustrating) but also it lets them develop a dialogical relationship with the world. Different arts and crafts are part of the Waldorf curriculum throughout all the years of children's education (Staley, 2009). The findings reported that the teachers view working with resistant materials as especially fruitful to work with students' will and I will provide the examples they mentioned in the next part of the chapter *5.4 Ways and possibilities for facilitating the development of will in an educational setting*.

Regarding social resistance, Biesta (2012b) states that children gain a lot from "encountering and engaging with resistance posed by other people" (Biesta, 2012b, p. 98), for example, drama education and art group work serves well. Schieren (2012) mentions class projects together, be it agricultural practice or any other working together and notes that learning means transformation and it always involves encounters with difficulties. He maintains that a crisis is where learning and transformation take place. Therefore, the task of the teacher is a good crises management. Besides, as per Rawson (2020), these type of activities are agentic. A small-scale practitioner study about students that were in their final year of a Waldorf school in Germany found out that the young people interviewed associated most significant learning experiences and experiences of personal development with non-formal learning situations, for instance, theatre productions, internships and different projects in the class community. One of the conclusions of the study was that joining authentic practices, boundary crossings and challenging identities might provide encounters with others as well as discontinuity and interruption. Such learning is meaningful and agentic for young people who are searching for their role in the world and trying to create a sustainable relationship with it. The proceeding chapter continues with activities that the research informants find agentic and meaningful in facilitating the development of adolescents' will.

5.4 Ways and possibilities for facilitating the development of the will in educational settings

This chapter discusses the activities that experienced Waldorf class teachers see as fruitful regarding facilitating the development of the will. The findings reflect two dimensions – working with the concept of the threefoldness and providing space for social and material resistance.

Balance of the three – foldness of thinking, willing and feeling

In Waldorf education, the teaching method takes into account pupils' intellectual capacities, their feeling system and will. Steiner in his lectures to teachers invited them to protect children from over – intellectualism (Wember, 2015). Mathisen (2015) explains that the development of thinking, forming of judgement, acquiring theoretical knowledge bases on the engagement of will, and feeling life during the learning process and teachers should look upon these qualities as a whole. Education of the will and the feeling life is the salient point of the curriculum to awaken the thinking capacities of children.

The research findings report that teachers find it important to get children "out of their heads" to facilitate the development of their will. To reach that, the interviewees suggested emphasizing the meaningfulness of a process instead of the result whatever subject it is. It appears that it is worth thinking about the following aspects when preparing lessons: which exercise of the lesson will involve students' active participation; what is the meaning of the tasks that I as a teacher will assign to my students; what question can I ask my students to stir their curiosity; how can I involve the artistic element and creative work in my lessons and are my tasks going to be challenging enough.

Jane provided an example of her lesson on platonic bodies, which she finds to address knowledge in a balanced way. The lesson was on platonic bodies and pupils needed to score in three areas. First, a test on the content and skills. Second, creating 3D examples of the different platonic bodies and Archimedes' bodies in coloured paper. Third, drawings and texts in their notebooks, which would look "at completeness, creativity, working neatly and precise". Also, during the lessons pupils sculptured the platonic bodies in clay. This seems to be a practical example of how to plan a lesson in a three-fold way.

Further, the research informants find it important that the lesson content touches students' feeling life because that exercises their willing and is likely to lead to total immersion in the class process. The importance of touching students' feeling life was an emergent theme in the findings. According to the interviewees, stirred feelings can, both, activate into deep thinking and shape one's will.

Richard pointed out that, in his opinion, working with different author's biographies provide meaningful learning experiences. With lively narration and a developed storytelling technique, a teacher can introduce students to the growth of different people, according to

Richard. Through a teacher's story about an author, the pupils' feelings might be touched and they can put themselves into the shoes of the authors, who have carried out meaningful deeds. Richard provided the context of authors in his country, from whom many have started their lives as simple peasants and during the course of their lives have become the representatives of intelligence. He also described how shocked his students have sometimes been about the biography of Orwell or Saint-Exupéry.

My pupils are usually shocked by the fact that Orwell wanted to experience completely everything in his life. He had a whim and fought for quite a long time to get into jail. Was it a whim or the will – difficult to answer? It was an action, which resulted in getting what he wanted to. Or, for example, Saint-Exupéry, who had to bomb a kindergarten. He did not do it; he threw the bomb past it. This is a clear and biographical fact of a human being that reflects the will impulse, not blind execution of an order.

To sum up, Richard experiences working with biographies and storytelling to leave lasting footprints in the students' feeling of life. This way, the students seem to be allowed to experience real-life stories of people who have encountered severe difficulties and resistance in their life and have chosen to "stay in the frustrating middle ground", instead of following blindly the direction pointed by others.

Artistic element and working with resistant materials

Art and artistic activities permeate most aspects of Waldorf education and it is believed that art strongly influences the formation of the will for it has regular practice and rhythm in it and the joy and enthusiasm the artistic activities bring to people. In addition, artwork is believed to contribute to awakening intellectual capacities (Steiner, 2000).

The research findings reported that the teachers experience artistic activities to give the impulse of the will for three reasons. First, aesthetic result, which brings joy and enthusiasm. Second, working with hands and experiencing material resistance, which exercises one's will largely. Third, artistic activities develop a sense of belonging and meaning, for they invite pupils to use the knowledge that they have acquired in different subjects. Morris mostly focused on the material resistance as a way for engaging students' will, for the hard materials require patience, precision and persistence. It takes a lot of will to work with hard materials, according to Morris, because "the process involves a lot of patience, overcoming resistance and being able to carry out a continuous work, and practising to start again after failing".

The two teachers shared examples of artistic activities that are a part of the curriculum in their schools. The activities mentioned were the following: the sixth grade, when studying Rome, collaborates to create a huge aqueduct and tries it out, the seventh grade creates stained glass artwork when studying the Medieval Ages, later students render the movement of plates in geography, create different phases of an embryo in anatomy, do serious sculpting, works with wood, metal, silver, copper and stone. Additionally, students make their own jewellery. Richard exemplified that when working with glass students "have to cut it precisely, break it precisely and work with the soldering iron, copper foil and tin, glass often breaks and they have to start again and again".

The findings seem to support Biesta's (2012a) argument on material resistance largely. As discussed earlier, Biesta (2012a) states that working with material resistance helps children develop a dialogical relationship with the world. According to him, working with resistant materials help children to train their will and stay in the middle ground. They practise encountering something the other in a way that they reach a compromise – neither shy away from nor destroy the other.

Encountering social resistance and obstacles in oneself

Socket (1998) points out that a starting point for schools to think about the education of the will is to evaluate the place of difficulty in a child's education. He invites to work with the qualities of the will so children are equipped "to face difficulty and to resist both fatalism and escapism", which "are common human actions, and the former at least indicates the presence of an active mind" (p. 209). Socket (1998) states that it is not about the curriculum being painless, but the children should see the curriculum as one in which "striving – for understanding, for knowledge, for skill of whatever – is seen as valuable" (p. 210). Thus, he invites to see "doing your best" as the goal of the curriculum, instead of achievement.

The findings showed that the teachers interviewed value overcoming resistance in oneself and social contexts as significant to acquire rhythms, habits and work ethics. Many examples were provided earlier in the discussion chapter, some of them being farming projects, drama projects and different types of practical work. Additionally, there is a tradition of carrying out individual year projects in Waldorf schools all over the world. Tessa mentioned this tradition as an example where one needs to invest a lot of effort and overcome oneself. These are projects that students do as their final work in a Waldorfschool; a completely independent

work where one puts a lot of effort and presents the results to the whole school community. There are different choices students make: some write and stage a play, some carve a canoe and pedal the boat through different rivers in their country, meanwhile, others design a clothing collection of their own. As Tessa mentioned, it can be a real obstacle course for pupils, which exercises their will a lot, and the ability to finish the work presents them as wilful Waldorf students.

5.5 Challenges in the education of the will

This is the last part of the discussion chapter and it invites to think about the challenges that the teachers are concerned of regarding the development of the will in an educational context. The findings point to such issues as the will in teachers, the adults and system around, childhood and rhythm at home, and modern technology.

The findings reported that two of the teachers interviewed worry about students losing their greediness because of the system and adults around. As Jane pointed, “we can see many students who are truly interested in the world; it is a pity if they lose this interest”.

Additionally, she emphasized the importance of teachers’ work on themselves, for it has a direct effect on children and the learning process. Similarly, Richard expressed his concern that the will in teachers, the same as the will in a big part of the society nowadays, is not big. People’s wish to be amused and entertained overtakes the need to spend time on one’s own and experience silence, with reference to Richard.

If we organize free concerts, there are often a few spectators, but if you would like to go to the shopping mall on a Saturday, there is not a single place to park your car. Shopping malls have become a mean of entertainment. We do not have a museum of temporary art, even though it has been widely discussed. (Richard)

The tendency of people wishing to be entertained, as Richard notices, is growing, meanwhile fewer and fewer people prefer to spend time with themselves and appreciate silence, which, for Richard, is connected to the will impulses.

These findings might be looked upon with Steiner's (1996b) views on discontinuous experiences, which, according to him, result with the weakening of one's inner strength. Earlier people had more consequent rhythms in their daily life, which, according to Steiner (1996b), developed a stronger will in people. Steiner (1996b) maintains:

Were people today asked to read the same story every day, they would refuse because it would be much too boring. Modern people have been trained for one-time experiences. Earlier people not only prayed the same prayer every day, but they also had a storybook that they read at least once every week. Thus they also had much stronger wills than those people who undergo modern education. (Steiner, 1996b, p. 98)

To summarize, Steiner (1996b) points out that people nowadays are used to discontinuous experiences and he relates that to the weakening of people's will. Additionally, things becoming a habit has a healing effect and strengthens the inner self, which is paid great attention throughout the Waldorf curriculum (Dahlin, 2017; Mathisen, 2015).

Biesta (2012a) and Arendt (1998) also relate to the system around. Their concern is that education is too much influenced by the economic and political needs of society. Arendt (1998) invites to look at schools as "a place in-between" where children can remain children and gradually, together with their teachers, are introduced into the world so they can create their own common world. Biesta (2015a) explains that schools can be places of refuge where people can practise other ways of being and being together.

The next aspect that the findings showed is also connected to discontinuous experiences. It is the softness and distraction that comes along with modern technology, which, according to the most interviewees, slows one's will. As Morris explained, the little attention span that media requires results with students getting used to not immersing themselves in different topics or activities – they tend to remain on the surface level. If we look for answers, we can find them on the internet or if we want to know something, we phone someone. Richard expressed that children who overexpose themselves to computer games seem to have a very weak will and they mostly socialize with other students that are interested in the same topic. He draws attention to that there is no connection between satisfying one's whims and the will. Wish and will are two different concepts, and, unfortunately, students who spend much time on gaming are more relating to their wishes, according to Richard. Thus, collaboration with parents and children's experiences at home comes into play.

One of the teachers, regarding the challenges in facilitating the development of pupil's will at school, is mostly concerned about the rhythm children have at home. The will that teachers look at in a school setting is mostly developed when the students are young, with reference to Morris. In his experience, some adults do not allow their children to strive for something; everything is given to them. Many children do not know what a real "no" is; the borders are

not clear for them. As a result, they lack opportunities for the development of the will at home. If a child is not allowed to experience his will and to get hold of his or her will in the early stages, it is challenging to work with a student's will later at school. Morris highlights the importance for parents to help their children acquire healthy daily rhythms and establish clear borders at home so there can be coherence established between the work that teachers do at school and parents do at home. Then, children will feel that it is important too, for example, be on time, have a neat and tidy working environment, not skipping their work, be polite and take into account other people's needs.

6. Conclusions

The purpose of this basic qualitative study was to explore how the characteristics and expressions of the will have been understood in a Waldorf educational context and how experienced Waldorf class teachers view the possibilities for facilitating the development of the adolescents' will in Waldorf educational settings. The conclusion from this study follows the research questions and the findings and therefore address four areas: (a) experienced Waldorf class teachers' perceptions and understanding of the will; (b) the educator's role in facilitating the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context; (c) ways and possibilities for facilitating the development of adolescents' will in Waldorf educational settings; (d) how teachers experience and reflect on the challenges related to the will-development. Following is a discussion of the major findings and conclusions drawn from this research. Lastly, I present my recommendations and final reflection on this study.

Experienced Waldorf class teachers' perceptions and understanding of the will

The first major finding of this research is that the teachers interviewed perceive the will as a social quality that is always directed towards the society and presents person as a social being. The teachers emphasized that children can become socially responsible and harmonious beings only when there is a harmony between their thinking, willing and feeling. The teachers seem to always look at the pupils' will in relation to their feeling life and thinking. Thus, the three-foldness of feeling, thinking and willing became the central concept and idea of this study. A conclusion that I draw from this finding is that teachers understand the development of the will as a constant practise of balancing the three-foldness of thinking, willing and feeling in their educational settings. Similarly, as Biesta (2012b) speaks about practising "to stay in the frustrating middle ground" when encountering social or material resistance. It seems to be about finding balance in order to be able to act in a grown-up and non-ego-logical way (Biesta, 2015b) or, in other words, reaching one's goals in socially acceptable ways (Socket, 1998).

The second finding indicates that teachers characterize the will as one's ability to put as much effort as needed in order to carry out a project and to overcome difficulties and obstacles to finish it. The finding suggested an interesting nuance – the teachers related it to adolescents' ability to finish something not because of an outside pressure, but because of an inner pressure – the motive and the drive of a student. I discussed this characteristic through

Sockett's (1998) concept of striving, which, according to him, is central to the will and manifests in an ability to overcome the obstacles encountered in nature, other people and ourselves. These obstacles might be regarded as encounters with resistance (Biesta, 2012b), which offer a truly educational space for the development of the will. A conclusion that might be drawn from this study is that teachers see a place for difficulty and resistance in a child's education and value these aspects as meaningful for the will development.

The educator's role in facilitating the development of the will in a Waldorf educational context

The third major finding of this study was that the Waldorf teachers interviewed see the educator's role in facilitating the development of the pupils' will to be multifaceted. Helping children to develop habits, rhythm and work ethics appear to be central to the teacher's role. It was concluded that behind this role lie such aspects as being a role model and a worthwhile example for students to follow, giving students more responsibility for their learning process and responsibility for their actions and behaviour, increasing moments of active learning processes during lessons and providing encounters with resistance in educational settings. The research findings reported that the interviewees consider the teacher's own motive and drive to be of primary importance, because it influences the pupils' motive and drive, which are the sides of the will that can be worked with in educational settings. Therefore, the findings support Arendt's (1971) argument on introducing the children into the world as the aim of education and Biesta's (2012a) argument on the place of teachers in "the new language of learning" being delimited to "just" facilitating the learning process. These findings highlight the teachers' own work on themselves and the part they play as role models for their students. In this light of the findings, teachers share a lot of responsibility in facilitating the development of their students' will and introducing them into the world.

The next major finding of the study was that the participants believe that the development of children's will depends on the school culture and is a mutual agreement among all the teachers. The participants pointed that teachers as a collegium should crystalize the skills that students need to learn at school apart from content, which strongly supports Sockett's (1998) argument that the learning environment should seem consistent and coherent to children in order to see that the qualities they are asked to develop are important. A conclusion that might be drawn from these two findings is that our actions are also shaped by and recreated in social

relations, and, in this light, the teacher's role seems to be an active co – creator in a child's ethical relationship to the world.

Ways and possibilities for facilitating the development of adolescents' will in Waldorf educational settings

The fifth major finding reported two dimensions regarding facilitating an education of the will - working with the concept of the three – foldness of thinking, willing and feeling and providing space for social and material resistance. The participants emphasized the importance of “getting students out of their heads” in order to awaken their will impulses. The teachers all mention how this aim and process is one of their primary educational goals and they present examples of how they work with this within the threefold process of feeling, thinking and willing, and social and material resistance. This highlights the importance of a broad curriculum, which encompasses subjects like art, crafts, movement, drama, gardening and physical education, as these subjects awaken not just the head, but hearts and hands (feeling and willing) of the pupils.

How teachers experience and reflect on the challenges related to the will-development

The sample of teachers related to different challenges they experience regarding the will development. The sixth finding reflected that teachers are concerned about the influence of adults and system around, modern technology, and rhythms and habits that children experience at home. Two of the informants pointed out that the society prefers entertainment above being with oneself in silence, and the system and adults around might lead students to lose their greediness. This aspect was discussed in relation to Arendt's (1971) argument on looking at schools as “a place in between” where children can remain children and gradually, together with their teachers, be introduced into the world so they can create their own common world as well as Biesta's (2015a) idea on schools being places of refuge where people can practice other ways of being and being together. A conclusion that might be drawn from this finding is twofold. First, once again it is emphasized that it is of importance that teachers work on themselves and on their own motive and drive so they inspire their students to strive for new knowledge and skills, and invite them to do their best with their personal example.

Limitations of this study and recommendations for further research

The main limiting condition of this study is that the phenomenon I have seek to explore is the will, which, according to Steiner (1997) is one of the soul functions. Because it is always seen in connection to thinking and feeling, the main limitation has been that it is not possible to separate and measure the development of the will in a reliable way regarding curricular activities. Additionally, it is a complex concept that has no clear “final” definition and it has different characteristics and expressions (Dahlin, 2017).

My intention has not been to capture and define the will and it has been understood as a phenomenon based on the hermeneutic-phenomenological approach to the world. I have tried to remain as open as possible to whatever comes to the fore regarding the teachers’ perceptions and understanding of the will. The teachers I interviewed have all come across Steiner’s view of the will and how he uses *will* as a concept in his educational writings. This knowledge will undoubtable influence the way the teachers view and work with the concept of *will*, ad may in this way represent a limitation as teachers in Waldorf schools have a common understanding of will-development based on Steiner’s thoughts. This might result in a certain bias in that Waldorf teachers are just looking to confirm what they have read or heard as opposed to seeing the phenomenon of will- development without any prior knowledge or prejudice. On the other hand, this argument could be said of any teacher having gone through a teacher- training.

The present study has only investigated the experiences and reflections of experienced Waldorf class teachers, because the Waldorf curriculum considers the development of the will to be one of the most important aspects of education. Development of will is seen as part of the three-foldness that focus on developing – not just thinking, but a balancing of feeling, thinking and willing and that these three aspects of the student cannot be separated but must be worked on jointly as and interchangeably. This study has been carried out in a Waldorf educational context and builds on interviews with four experienced Waldorf class teachers as the overall data collection method.

I hope that my research will serve as a base for further future studies on the development of the will in children in educational settings. These findings suggest to approach the phenomenon of the will through observation in addition to interviews with teachers so an in – depth exploration of what will is and how it manifests can take place. I suggest it would also be interesting to do a further research on Waldorf graduates’ perception and understanding of

the will and their reflections on their experiences at school regarding the development of the will.

Personal reflection

I dare to conclude that it is in the hands of teachers to maintain schools as places where students take part in continuous experiences and acquire rhythms, habits and ethics that strengthen their will and enable them to take action that influences the surrounding social and material world in socially acceptable, grown-up and non-ego-logical ways. The findings of this study show that working with the will is an important aspect of being an educator, which also indicates that teachers work on themselves.

Biesta (2012a) and Sockett (1988) emphasize the importance of pupils encountering resistance and how it is the role of the educator to teach pupils to stay in this frustrating middle ground. The teachers I interviewed all refer to this same phenomenon, and although it is hard to grasp the concept of the will, it is important to, like Sockett (1988) explains, to take it seriously, as part of schooling is preparing the pupil to be a social person, and a person who can *act* – like Arendt emphasizes – and initiate a change in the world.

This study has changed the way I see myself as a teacher and even though I have found answers to my research questions, my interest in the phenomenon of the will has become greater than ever before and now I have plenty more questions that I strive to find answers to.

7. Sources

- Association of Waldorf Schools of North America. (2020). <https://www.waldorfeducation.org/>
- Arendt, H. (1961). *Between past and future: Six exercises in political thought*. Viking Press.
- Arendt, H. (1971). *The life of the mind: The groundbreaking investigation on how we think*. Houghton Mifflin Harcourt. <https://www.hmhbbooks.com/shop/books/The-Life-of-the-Mind/9780547541471>
- Arendt, H. (1998). *The human condition*. The University of Chicago Press.
- Biesta, G. J. (2012a). Giving teaching back to education: Responding to the disappearance of the teacher. *Phenomenology & Practice*, 6(2), 35-49.
- Biesta, G. J. (2012b). The educational significance of the experience of resistance: Schooling and the dialogue between child and world. *Other education*, 1(1), 92-103.
- Biesta, G. J. (2015a). The duty to resist: Redefining the basics for today's schools. *RoSE—Research on Steiner Education*, 6.
- Biesta, G. J. (2015b). What is education for? On good education, teacher judgement, and educational professionalism. *European Journal of Education*, 50(1), 75-87.
- Biesta, G. (2016). Reconciling ourselves to reality: Arendt, education and the challenge of being at home in the world. *Journal of Educational Administration and History*, 48(2), 183-192.
- Biesta, G., & Tedder, M. (2006). How is agency possible? Towards an ecological understanding of agency-as-achievement. *Learning lives: Learning, identity, and agency in the life course*.
- Bloomberg, L. D., & Volpe, M. (2018). *Completing your qualitative dissertation: A road map from beginning to end*. California: Sage Publications.
- Bryman, A. (2012). *Social Research Methods*. Oxford: University Press.
- Dahlin, B. (2017). *Rudolf Steiner: The relevance of Waldorf education*. Springer.
- Dewey, J. (2002). *Human nature and conduct*. The Project Gutenberg. <https://www.gutenberg.org/files/41386/41386-h/41386-h.htm#Pg303>
- Emirbayer, M., & Mische, A. (1998). What is agency? *American journal of sociology*, 103(4), 962-1023.
- Ensign, J. (1996). A conversation between John Dewey and Rudolf Steiner: A comparison of Waldorf and progressive education. *Educational Theory*, 46(2), 175-188.
- Eteläpelto, A., Vähäsantanen, K., Hökkä, P., & Paloniemi, S. (2013). What is agency? Conceptualizing professional agency at work. *Educational research review*, 10, 45-65.
- Freunde Waldorf. (2020). <https://www.freunde-waldorf.de/en/>
- Jacobitti, S. (1988). II. Hannah Arendt and the will. *Political Theory*, 16(1), 53-76.
- Larsson, J., & Dahlin, B. (2016). The teacher: the Other as the Self. On decentered subjectivity and the teacher-student relation. *RoSE—Research on Steiner Education*, 7(1).
- Mathisen, A. (2014). *Overview - ideas and practices in Waldorf education. A curriculum for Norwegian Waldorf Schools*. Steinerskoleforbundet.

- Mathisen, A. (2015). Rhythms as a pedagogy of becoming—Lefebvre, Whitehead and Steiner on the art of bringing rhythmical transformations into teaching and learning—part II. *RoSE—Research on Steiner Education*, 6(2).
- Merriam, S. B. (2009). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. Jossey-Bass.
- Pols, W., & Berding, J. (2018). “This is our world.” Hannah Arendt on education. In *International handbook of philosophy of education* (pp. 39-48). Springer.
- Rawson, M. (2020). The development of the person: Subjectification and possible links to non-formal learning situations and expansive learning in Waldorf (Steiner) education. *Other Education: The Journal of Education Alternative* 2(8), 02 – 25.
- Roh, C. P. (2009). Artistic activity – individual resonance – new paths. In D. Mitchell. *Educating the will* (pp. 29 – 32). AWSNA Publications.
- Savin-Baden, M., & Major, C. H. (2013). *Qualitative research: The essential guide to theory and practice*. Routledge.
- Schieren, J. (2012). The concept of learning in Waldorf education. *RoSE—Research on Steiner Education*, 3(1).
- Staley, B. (2009). Bringing the will into thinking in adolescence. In D. Mitchell. *Educating the will* (pp. 33 – 40). AWSNA Publications.
- Steiner, R. (1995). *Theosophy: An introduction to the spiritual processes in human life and the cosmos*. Anthroposophic Press.
- Steiner, R. (1996a). *The child's changing consciousness: As the basis of pedagogical practice*. Anthroposophic Press.
- Steiner, R. (1996b). *The foundations of human experience*. Anthroposophic Press.
- Steiner, R. (1997). *The roots of education*. Anthroposophic Press.
- Steiner, R. (2000). *Practical advice to teachers*. Anthroposophic Press.
- Tamboukou, M. (2016). Education as action/the adventure of education: thinking with Arendt and Whitehead. *Journal of educational administration and history*, 48(2), 136-147.
- Thomas, G. (2013). *Education: A very short introduction*. Open University Press.
- Van Manen, M. (2016). *Researching Lived Experience*. Routledge.
- Wember, V. (2015). *The five dimensions of Waldorf education in the work of Rudolf Steiner*. Stratosverlag.
- Wiechert, Ch. (2009). Awakening the spiritual powers of the head: Educating the will. In D. Mitchell. *Educating the will* (pp. 11 – 14). AWSNA Publications.