



SCELP

The South Carolina
Environmental Law Project
Lawyers for the *Wild Side* of South Carolina

WINTER 2015

Inside this Issue

1

Bays, Bears and Disappointment

2

Board Members, Bays, Bears and Disappointment (continued)

3

New Cases

4

Wild Side

5

8

9

Case Updates

6

7

Donors

10

11

Bays, Bears and Disappointment (continued)

12

Wild Side Thank You



BAYS, BEARS AND DISAPPOINTMENT

By Steve Bennett, retired Biologist, SCDNR

Photo Credit: Austen Smith

During the mid-1980's and early 1990's much of my professional life revolved around Carolina Bays, depression wetlands that are either elliptical or oval in shape and which align along a north-west-southeast axis. A fair amount of information was published on the formation and basic ecology of these features, which I contributed to while in graduate school working with Dr. Whit Gibbons at the Savannah River Ecology Lab and examining herptile communities associated with a Carolina Bay. However, there had never been a statewide survey and assessment of these features accomplished in S.C. Along with my colleague Dr. John Nelson, botanist for the S.C. Heritage Trust Program (HT), we initiated the first survey of these wetlands in our state.

When we began, the South Carolina Department of Natural Resources (SCDNR) where HT is housed was still the South Carolina Wildlife and Marine Resources Department. None of us had desktop computers, Geographic Information System (GIS) software or Global Positioning Systems (GPS), we accomplished our project the old fashioned way. Using black and white aerial photographs, transparent grid systems and county maps, we identified and mapped 2,651 Carolina Bays in SC.

We evaluated the bays using aerial photographs and found conditions ranging from completely dominated by row crops, roads, power-line and gas-line rights-of-way to seemingly undisturbed canopies of trees. From this analysis we chose approximately 600 bays for field visits, which we did beginning in March and ending in October for approximately 5 years. One of the first things we realized was that many bays that appeared to have intact canopies and presumably functioning systems were in fact dominated by very thick canopies of water oak, loblolly pine and sweet gum, all indicators of a drastically altered hydrology. We were also surprised to find that all of them had a ditch. At the end, we estimated that there might be 400-500 relatively intact Carolina Bays remaining in SC and that a little over 200 of those were in very good to excellent ecological condition.

The report that John and I authored in 1991, *The Distribution and Status of Carolina Bays in South Carolina*, remains the only comprehensive assessment of these features in SC to date. It was chosen as one of the Ten Outstanding Publications in SC for 1991 by the SC State Library and has

(continued to page 2)



**South Carolina
Environmental
Law Project, Inc.**

(a 501c3 tax-exempt
non-profit corporation)

Mission Statement

*To protect the natural
environment of South Carolina
by providing legal services
and advice to environmental
organizations and concerned
citizens and by improving
the state's system of
environmental regulation.*

Board of Directors

Frances Close, Chair

John Barton, Esquire
John Mark Dean, Ph.D.
Margaret D. Fabri, Esquire
Paula Feldman, Ph.D.
Gary W. Poliakoff, Esquire
Leon Rice, Esquire
Robert Schofield
Greg VanDerwerker, M.D.
Nancy Vinson
Wendy Zara

Staff

Amy E. Armstrong,
Executive Director
Amelia Thompson, *Staff Attorney*
Jessie A. White, *Staff Attorney*
Margaret O. Sands,
Project Manager

Office Address

430 Highmarket Street
Georgetown, SC 29440

Mailing Address

P. O. Box 1380
Pawleys Island, SC 29585
Telephone: (843) 527-0078
FAX: (843) 527-0540
Website: www.scelp.org

Printed on 100% recycled paper

been cited numerous times in the biological literature. While that is an honor, the primary reason for our work was to identify the best remaining examples of Carolina Bays in SC and try to protect and preserve them under the Heritage Trust Program. Thirty-six protection projects involving Carolina Bays have been approved for acquisition, or some other form of protection under the program. A number of bays have been protected by HT through outright acquisition, including Cathedral Bay in Bamberg County, Savage Bay in Kershaw County, Cartwheel Bay in Horry County and several others. Other Carolina Bays have been protected through cooperative agreements, easements and registration agreements. The goal of these protection projects is to ensure that South Carolinians continue to have some intact, ecologically functional bays to enjoy for many years to come.

The crown jewel of our Carolina Bay conservation effort, however, was the acquisition of Lewis Ocean Bay Heritage Preserve (LOB). This area had long been known for its bays, bears, venus' flytraps, pitcher plants, sugar white sand rims and pocosin wetlands. In the context of other Carolina Bays in the state, LOB came out on top. Certainly this is related to the list of rare and unusual plants and animals found there, but also the fact that LOB is not just a single bay but a complex of overlapping bays that may number as many as 30. So some form of conservation, preferably acquisition, was a huge goal for our program.

LaBruce (Brusi) Alexander, Director of the South Carolina Nature Conservancy at that time, made the first call to the front office of International Paper (IP), owners of the tract. It took some great negotiating skills on both sides, but after a few months we reached an agreed upon price and set out to determine the exact acreage.

I still remember the morning 27 years ago when we met at the future LOB preserve and decided on the extent of our acquisition. We parked along the Waterway



Pitcher Plant at Lewis Ocean Bay Heritage Preserve

at the intersection of what is now Carolina Bays Parkway and International Drive and waited for the folks from IP to arrive. The first IP representative was the area forester, a gentleman in his late 50's or early 60's who got out of his truck and introduced himself. Shortly after, another IP representative drove up in a new Mercedes. I'll never forget the words of the elder gentleman, who said, "I don't know about this new breed of forester that IP is hiring, they all have real estate licenses and drive Mercedes." The words of that "older generation" IP forester really made an impression on me.

The IP "real estate" forester told us to choose wisely for there would be no future acquisitions. This did not prove true however as there have been two subsequent additions to the preserve. One decision made that morning, was that we, SCDNR, could purchase to the center line of both Henry road, which has been "replaced" by the Carolina Bays Parkway, and International Drive. If you own half of the road you get some say in its future. After the meeting we all shook hands, went our separate ways and very shortly we had a brand new Heritage Preserve, Lewis Ocean Bay, which protected one of the largest, most pristine bay complexes in the world and numerous species of rare and unusual plants and animals. For a brief time I was actually the manager of the preserve, however without

(continued to page 10)

HOW YOU CAN HELP...

You help us continue our work with your contributions. Please log on to our website www.scelp.org to donate on-line or use the enclosed envelope to mail your gift.





NEW CASE

Seawall Challenge at Debidue Beach

ON AUGUST 28, SCELP filed a case in the Administrative Law Court on behalf of the Coastal Conservation League challenging DHEC's decision to permit the construction of an 1800-foot timber seawall 2 feet seaward of and 3 feet higher than an existing seawall on Debidue Beach in the private, gated Debordieu Colony Community in Georgetown County. The applicant is seeking to rebuild the seawall under a special proviso in the state budget that was passed after a failed attempt to amend the Coastal Zone Management Act.

New seawalls seaward of the setback line are illegal under the Act and have been since 1988 because they worsen beach erosion and degrade our beaches. The budget proviso gives Debordieu Colony an exemption from the prohibition on new seawalls.

Creating an exception for Debordieu undermines the law and is contrary to sound coastal science. When a hard structure is built along a shoreline with enduring, long-term erosion problems, wave action beating against the wall exacerbates erosion and decreases or eliminates the dry sand beach. While the houses that were built dangerously close to the coast will be temporarily protected, a seawall constructed even closer to the ocean is not a long term solution and will cause further loss of and degradation to the beach.

We are challenging DHEC's decision to rely on an unconstitutional budget proviso instead of state law in issuing the permit and certification to build a seawall. This case was assigned to Judge Durden and is moving through discovery, with a hearing set for February 29, 2016. We will continue to protect our beaches from harmful structures through this challenge.

International Drive

OUR COVER STORY, Bears, Bays and Disappointment gives the context for one of our new cases: a challenge to DHEC authorizations to fill 24 acres of wetlands and Carolina Bays to convert a dirt road into a 4-lane, paved highway. The road has misleadingly been called International Drive, not because it is a major thoroughfare, but because the property was once owned by International Paper Company. During acquisition of Lewis Ocean Bay Heritage Preserve (LOBHP) – which contains South Carolina's richest species diversity, including carnivorous pitcher plants and venus flytraps – the Department of Natural Resources received title to the centerline of International Drive in hopes that it could prevent paving of the road. LOBHP is surrounded by roads on three sides and paving International Drive would completely isolate the Preserve and further fragment habitat necessary for survival of species like the black bear.

SCELP filed an appeal in the Administrative Law Court on behalf of the Coastal Conservation League and the S.C. Wildlife Federation. We made efforts to resolve the dispute by asking Horry County to do what it originally promised to do: install three underground wildlife passages to mitigate the habitat fragmentation impacts. But the County refused to make any concessions on wildlife crossings. We are now preparing for trial which is scheduled for February 16-18.



CLOCKWISE FROM TOP LEFT: Jimmy's sister, Luci Chandler, leading the boat tour of Winyah Bay; Guest speaker, Ron Daise of Gullah Gullah Island; SCELP staff on the dock at sunset; View of Hobcaw House from the water; Overlooking Winyah Bay; Amy Armstrong discussing SCELP's work.



WILD SIDE

For the 6th year in a row, friends and supporters of SCELP gathered at Hobcaw Barony to celebrate the lawyers for the wild side of South Carolina and the memory of SCELP's founder, Jimmy Chandler. Our five year streak of idyllic weather was finally broken, but over 200 attendees were undeterred and joined us on October 3rd in the Kimbel Lodge where the rain held off for the duration of the event. Folks mingled as they enjoyed food by Bistro 217, drink from New South Brewery, and music by Prettier Than Matt. Guest speaker Ron Daise from *Gullah Gullah Island* spoke and sang about the history of the Gullah people in South Carolina, whose connection to the natural elements makes them some of the first stewards of our state's environment. That stewardship is critical in the face of climate change, Amy Armstrong pointed out in her remarks, as symptoms of climate change expose the vulnerabilities created by natural resources lost in the past and those remaining need our protection more than ever.

The floods that followed our October 3rd event reminded us of this fact and of our deep appreciation for the people who make it possible for SCELP to be on the front lines of natural resource preservation. In order to share that gratitude, we invited our Wild Side sponsors back to Hobcaw to celebrate with us once again on November 7th. It was a picture-perfect day and Rover Tours took our guests out for a natural history cruise to see the environment in action. Luci Chandler, sister of SCELP founder Jimmy Chandler, led the tour and shared with all of us the passion her family has for the uniquely beautiful setting of the Winyah Bay. We were so fortunate to be able to come together with so many of you for two such wonderful occasions. Thank you for sharing our concern for the environment of South Carolina and for supporting the lawyers for the *wild side*.



CASE UPDATES



Captain Sams Spit

Despite a ruling from the S.C. Supreme Court overturning Administrative Law Judge Trip Anderson's decision to authorize the construction of a half-mile long concrete bulkhead and revetment on Captain Sams Spit, Kiawah Development Partners (KDP) has sought a new series of permits for another hard erosion control structure, a road, and water and sewer lines in connection with its proposed development of these pristine 150 acres. And despite the Supreme Court's ruling, DHEC issued those permits. On behalf of the Coastal Conservation League, SCELPA challenged DHEC's decision and filed the fourth challenge to various permits associated with the development of the Spit. The case was again assigned to Judge Anderson.

KDP asked Judge Anderson to lift the "automatic stay," which prevents construction until a ruling on the validity of the DHEC permits. Because the proposal for an erosion control wall has already been rejected by the Supreme Court due to the public benefits associated with keeping the Spit in its natural condition, SCELPA urged the Judge to keep the stay, and thereby the protection of the Spit, in place. On November 4th, Judge Anderson granted KDP's request to allow immediate construction of a 2,380-foot steel sheet pile wall to be driven into the sand, without any regard for the habitat and damage to natural resources that would inevitably result from such a construction project. On November 5th, SCELPA filed a request for extraordinary relief in the Supreme Court, asking the state's highest court to prevent that immediate construction and to protect the Spit. We were encouraged by the Court's request that both sides submit written arguments by November 10th. As of the publication of this newsletter, we are anxiously awaiting a decision.

Chem Nuclear

This time last year we were thrilled to tell you about our success in securing better disposal practices for radioactive waste at Chem Nuclear's Barnwell County facility. The S.C. Court of Appeals agreed with our client, the Sierra Club, and overturned Administrative Law Judge Trip Anderson's decision that the facility complies with the regulatory requirements designed to minimize the contact between water and radioactive waste. Chem Nuclear's disposal practices have resulted in a tritium plume in the groundwater and tritium entering surface waters upstream of the Savannah River. Both DHEC and Chem Nuclear asked the Court of Appeals to "reconsider" its ruling.

On August 12th, the Court of Appeals reconsidered and issued a new opinion, but did not change the central ruling that the Chem Nuclear disposal license fails to meet regulatory requirements, instead remanding the case to DHEC to address the deficiencies. Shortly after that, Chem Nuclear filed a petition asking the Supreme Court to exercise its discretion to hear the case. On behalf of Sierra Club, SCELPA opposed the request and the Supreme Court will decide whether to hear the case in the upcoming months.

OUR HEARTFELT THANKS FOR THE COMMITMENT OF THIS YEAR'S SUPPORTERS

Foundations/Organizations

Butler Conservation Fund
Coastal Community Foundation
Coastal Conservation League
Frances P. Bunnelle Foundation
Foundation for the Carolinas
Gaylord and Dorothy Donnelley Foundation

GrowFood Carolina
Harriet & Herbert Keyserling Endowment
"Henry M. Blackmer Foundation, Inc."
Legatus Foundation
Sierra Club Robert Lunz Group
Sierra Club SC Chapter

The Springs Close Foundation
The Sunshine Foundation
The Tides Foundation-Bridging Peace Fund
Three Swallows Foundation
Upstate Forever
Waccamaw Audubon Society

Emily Abedon
Daniel C. & Mary W. Abel
Andrew L. & Karen K. Abrams
Melinda Ackerman
Michael C. Cameron and Darlene Adams
Advanced Dental Center
Carroll and Robin Agnew
Dennis & Wendy Allen
Eugenia & Marshall Allen
Lisa Allen
R. Linwood & Nancy S. Altman
William and Barbara Anderson
A. Frederick & Rhoda V. Anderson
William Anderson
Veronica Anderson
Guy Apicella
Tom Arconti
Raymond Armer
William R. & Gail G. Armstrong
Amy Armstrong
Reed Armstrong
Keith Aspray
Marguerite Assey
Robert & Jane Avinger
Emily Bailey
Frances Jo Baker
Sandra Ballington
David & Kathy Baptiste
Joan Barber
Paul & Alicia Barnes
Garland & Donna Barr
Penny Barrett
John & Barbara Barton
Susan Bateman
Peter Baumann
Dana & Virginia Beach
Robert J. & Janet Beattie
George and Marianne Beck
Frank & Ranlet Bell
Norman H. and Ledlie D. Bell
Joyce Bell
Larry And Nadia Bellamy
Wendy Belser
Shelia Bennet
Colin & Ann Bentley
Elizabeth Bergmann
Vicky Berity
Dean & Carolyn Berry
Charles Biddix
Dennis White & Donna C. Billings
Margaret Blackmer
James Blicke
Marilyn & William Blizard
Robert And Eileen Blivad
Robert Bockman
Bill & Fran Bollin
Tez & Kay Bonnoitt
Andrew Borgert
Emelie & Dirck Born
Len & Mary Bottone
Frances Boyd
James and Frances Boyd
William Boyd
William & Elizabeth Brabson
Eloise Bradham

James M. and Marian Brailsford
Carlyle Brandon
Emily Branscome
Howard Bridgman
Eric & Lynn W. Brown
Bob & Susan Brown
Eric Brown
Jonathan Buchan
Michael Buckingham
Frank & Mary Gale Budzisz
Sandra Bundy
Carol & Ross Burgess
R. Alan Burrell
Joe Burt
McBee & Anne C. Butcher
Kenneth & Linda Button
Kristan Button
Henry Byrd
Joseph Calandra
Calhoun Farms Partnership
Buddy Campbell
Diane And David Campbell
Elizabeth Campbell
J. Robert Cantey
David Canty
Paul Capron
Mike and Barbara Carakostas
Meg Cardinal
Cornelia Carrier
Gretchen and William Carroll
Lindy Carter
George Cartledge
Nancy & Billy Cave
Andrew & Catharine Chandler
Robert & Gratia Chase
Penny Christensen
Richard E. & Linda G. Clapp
Joy Clark
Stanley & Susan Clarke
Ron & Margaret Claypool
Thomas Waldrep Clements
Frances Close
Lawrence R. & Priscilla M. Coleman
Patsy Collin
Ted Wachter & Jan Collins
Lynn Collins
Daniel & Lorinda Collister
Marcia & Jamie Constance
Ron Converse
Edwin H. & Norris N. Cooper
Susan Coppin
Anne & Bruce Cottle
Bruce and Judith M. Coull
Glenn & Myra Cox
Martha Craft-Essig
Ann Craigmile
Nancy Cregg
Anthony J. & Debbie G. Criscitiello
Cathy Crocker
Malcolm Crosland
Richard L. & Barbara D. Cross
D.M. & M.B. Crutchfield
Pierce R. & Joanna Culliton
Bart Daniel
Jim Danigelis

Rebecca Davis
John Mark & Robin Dean
Nina DeCordova
Leigh and Andrew DeHoll
Craig Deihl
Moshe Dekel
Edwin C. (Ned) Hettinger
& Bev Diamond
Ann Dibble
Susan Dickey
Earl Dietz
Stephen & Rosanne Dixon
David Dolan
Rita Donato
Bruce Doneff
Paul Donnelly
Gloria Douglass
Ken Driggers
Gale Dubose
S. Kimble Duckworth
Charles H. Duell
William Dufford
Bill & Sheri Duncan
Maggie Dunlap
Susan Dunn
Michael & Ann Marie Dwyer
Sandra Elliott
Janelle Ellis
David Elmore
Mary Erickson
Carol Brittain Ervin
Forest Evans
Amy Fabri
Jon And Margaret Fabri
Renzo & Nancy M. Falcinelli
Pamela and Donald Farris
Anne and John Faul
Hartmut & Mary Joe Fege
Robert J. & Linda Feller
Polly Fenig
Marc Fisher
Madilyn Fletcher
Laura Floyd
Foolish Frog
Maggie & Chuck Ford
Walter E. and Mary R. Fortuna
Mary Ann Foutch
Sarah Fox
Jane Frederick
John P. & Nancy K. Freeman
Diane and Hal Freeman
A. S. Frierson
Sallie Fuerth
Sherri Fultz
Fielding Gallivan
Nafina Gardner
Rick Garza
Basil Garzia
Carroll Belser
& Dr. Sidney A. Gauthreaux
George R. & Elizabeth Geer
Perry Gesell
Marcia Gesser
Nancy Gibbes
Laney Gibbes

Steve & Joy Gibson
Elizabeth Joan Gilchrist
Thomas E. & Sarah M. Gillespie
Nancy Gilley
Steve Goggans
S. Annette Goings
Susan Gooding
Malcolm Goodridge
Rajan & Suman Govindan
Scott Graber
Robert Grant
Joe Griffin
William R. Griffin
Jo H. & Ron K. Griffin
Nancy Griffiths
T. Compton Groff
Kim Gundler
Michael & Claire Gwyn
David & Elizabeth Hagood
Madeleine Hahn
Paul & Carmela Haklisch
Michael Hannon
Merle Happe
Bill & Eleanor Hare
Gerald & Linda Harmon
David Harmon
Terrell & Elliot Harrigan
Deb Harris
Heather Hartung
Brantley Harvey
Janet & Bill Hassell
Nimet Hatcher
Daryl G. & Susanne Hawkins
Jim Hawkins
Lewis Hay
Jacqueline & Miles Hayes
Clarke L. & Virginia K. Hayes
John Haynes
Sally Heineman
Richard Hendry
W.J. Hennessy, Jr.
Fred Herrmann
Jennifer Hersch
Robert & Carla Higgins
Susan Hilfer
Sue and David Hodges
Lisa Hodieme
Brad Hodson
Stephen & Susan Hoffius
John And Lisa Holden
Linda Holsapple
Bill Howard
Margaret Howell
Allan Howell
Carl Hubbard
Brad Huber
Thomas B.
& Lily Grace M. Hudson
Dr. Leroy J. & Mary R. Huffman
Carey Huffman
F.E. Huggins
David Huguenin
Daniel & Laura Hunnicutt
Eric Hunter
Paul G. & Susan L. Huray

Brian & Edith Hussain
Michael Hyrowski
Harford Igleheart
Bill & Elizabeth Igleheart
Jill Ippel
Bo Ives
Ricky C. & Nancy R. James
Allen & Mary Jeffcoat
Michael & Denise John
Joy Johnson
Josh & Jane Johnson
Gordon Johnson
Deborah Johnson
George & Kathy Johnstn
Elizabeth Joiner
Margie Jones
Gwyn Jordan
Joan Jordan
Susan T. & John A. Joseph
Stan and Joan Karmilovich
Lee Jane Kaufman
Gene Kelenski
Ronald Sobczak & Kathleen Kempe
Paul & Maura Kenny
Lawrence Kerr
Linda & Larry Ketron
William Keyserling
Edward L. & Trees Killin
Jeff & Carol Kirby
Randolph & Patricia Kirkland
Donna Kirkpatrick
Alana Kitchen
Fred Klare
Harold A. Kline
Ronald & Denise Klizek
Frederick and Linda Klotz
John & Carol Kososki
John & Katherine Kotz
Hobart W. & Carol B. Kraner
David & Patricia Krauser
Kenneth & Joan Kreikemeier
Catherine Kuhl
William Kyne
Meagan Labriola
Montague T. Laffitte
Anne Lake
Jonathon Lamb
Charles G. & Virginia Lane
Erik & Caitlin Lang
Mary Langrall
Witt Langstaff
Kenneth Lantelme
David & Marilyn Larach
Jerrold Griggs & Deynise Lau
Larry Laughlin
Jim Laughnane
George Lawrence
Bobbie Lawson
Wood Lay
Elizabeth Layman
Julie Layne
Michael P. Bivona & Ruth Leal
Malcolm & Jeanette Leaphart
W. E. & Diane Z. Lehder
Jane Lemmon

Peggy Len
Paul Lentini
Richard Brice & Clara J. Leonard
Steve Leverton
Susan & Don Libes
Mary Mangum & Lanneau D. Lide
Chip Linton
Langdon D. & Jessie Long
Brian & Nancy Looney
Adrienne Lustig
Benton Lutz
Maxine Lutz
Dennis Lynch
Scott Maentz
John Magiera
John and Anita Mahoney
Thomas Maier
Eston Marchant
Henry Nechemias
& Valerie G. Marcil
Jim and Sally Marks
Elizabeth Marlow
Alex Marsh & Carla Marsh
Chris & Barbara Marsh
Alexander Marshall
Walter Martin
Pamela & Bill Martin
Terri Martin
Bob Maxwell
Charlie & Jo Mayer
Sarah Mayse
William & Jerry McAninch
Lee & Mary C. McBride
Francis McCann
Mitzi McClure
Claudia McCollough
Christe McCoy-Lawrence
Jordan McDonald
Sally McGarry
Jerry & Tammy McGee
Eileen McGuffie
William McKeever
Michael F. Kohl
& Jane A. McLamarrah
Ian & Goffinet McLaren
David & Joan McLean
Janet Swigler & Jim McMahan
Robert McMahan
Cecily McMillan
John McShane
Garland P. McWhirter
Joan Meacham
Gary Meader
Lisa Meares
Noel Mears
Barbara & Charles Measter
George & Mimi Meriwether
Colie M. & Joyce A. Metts
Sara Michelin
Terry Millar
Stone Miller
Don & Jo Miller
Jay & Jennifer Mills
David & Tina Mims
Jean Moody
Laura W. & Tyre H. Moore
Sam Moore
J.P. & Jane Lemmon Moore
Bob & Meribeth Moore
Robin Morris and Richard Moore
Kat Morgan
Alice Morrisey
Carol Morrissey
James & Susan Morton
Alan & Joanne Moses
Laura Moses
Paul & Jane Ann Mougey
Joseph Mueller

Paula Feldman
& Peter Mugglestone
Terry & Patricia Munson
Lori Murdaugh
Thomas M. & Sally R. Murphy
Sally Murphy
Stephen Murray
Gabe and Wendy Nagy
Richard Nalwasky
William H. Naylor
Deborah & David Neal
Phillis Newman
Rhonwen Newton
William Nichols
Michael & Rebecca Niemiec
Donald Nilles
Bob & Kim Noe
Hank Stallworth & Ann Nolte
Michael Norris
A. R. & Barbara Nourie
Rowena Nylund
Edward Oconnell
Lawrence & Illene Olanoff
Lucinda Olasov
Thomas Oliver
James O'Neal
Laura Blake Orr
Kay Overby
Joseph & Christie Owens
Coleman & Virginia Owens
Thomas & Betty Owens
David Oyster
Charles Keith & Ann Palmer
Earlene Parks
Debra & Ted Passig
Denise Patrick
Frazier & Katherine Patrick
Hayes Patterson
Beth Patterson
Marilyn Peck
Ralph Peebles
Johan Peers
Vernon Peers
Bill Pendergraft
Michael Perkins
Annette Perreault
William & Cynthia Perry
Lloyd & Linda Peterson
Margey Pfeiffer
Scott Phillips
Victoria Phillips
Linda Pierce
Dan And Ruthie Pierce
Joe & Joy Pinson
Joseph Pinson
T. Carroll Player
Patti Anne Poirier
Gary Poliakoff
Patricia & Harry Polychron
Dwayne Porter
Sara Lynn & Jan Postma
Cynthia Swanson Powell
Michael Powers
Michael & Virginia Prevost
Kevin & Mary Prince
William Prioleau
Ward & Karen Pritchett
Lisa Quadrini
David & Sandra Quick
Gary & Sheila Quigley
Robert E. & Sandra H. Quinn
Augusta Quirk
Charley Ralston
Deb Rasmussen
Lowell & Martha Dee Rausch
Arthur Ravenel
Allan and Joan Rayfield
Dool & Carol Reed

J. Michael Reh
Jan Reyes
Roberta Reynes
John Rhoden
Bill & Sheila Riat
Jan & Leon Rice
Frances J. & Arthur L. Rickenbaker
Henry F. Rivers
Vincent Robert
Bill Roberts
Frank Roberts
Mary Roberts
Frank H Roberts Sr
Deborah Robertson
Douglas Robinson
Jeanne Robinson
William and Ann Robinson
Dana Roll
Sue Rose
Laura Lee Rose
Samuel H. & Sara Beth Rosen
Gillian Roy
Jane Rucker
Anne Sinclair & Julian Ruffin
Woody Rutter
Anne Ryan
Alesia Saboeiro
Oscar Salas
Bill and Beth Samuels
Alex & Zoe Sanders
John O. and Geales Gavin Sands
James Saunders
Robert Sawdon
Ashleigh Sawdon
Frank M. & Elizabeth O. Sawyer
Kate Schaefer
Edward Schmunnes
Joann and Ronald Schneider
Robert Schofield
Robert W. & Anita N. Schuhmacher
Jerry Schulze
Charlotte Caldwell & Jeffrey Schutz
Anne and Stephen Sedlak
Kathryn W. Sharp
Norm & Linda Sharp
Paul and Deborah Shea
Heather Sherwin
Marilyn Shup
Sandra Simmons
Susan Simmons
Janice S. & T. Grange Simons, V
Wilson & Ann M. Sims
Starr Skotnicki
Robert & Randy Slovic
Gerald & Patricia Smith
Bennett Smith
Richard & Anne Smith
Dean L. & Rita G. Smith
Shannyn Smith
Karen Sundberg & Erik Smith
Ryan & Erin Smith
Amy Smith
Harry Smithson
George & Barbara Smyth
Caroline Smythe
James Snyder
Rebecca Sparrow
Elizabeth Spence
Paula Stallsmith
Fred & Alice Stanback, Jr.
Todd & Janet Stephenson
Gavin & Scott Stevens
June Stevenson
Deb Stirling
Debra Stokes
Marshall & Amanda Stone
Chris & Eric Strobel
Robert Struble

James Sullivan
Eugene Sullivan
Susan & Jim Sullivan
Hall Sumner
Swiss Miss Dairy
Michael Swomley
Paul Sykes
Edward & Laura Szweda
Jody & Anne Tamsberg
Edmund R. Taylor
Barry & Leslie Teague
George and Carol Tempel
The Clekis Law Firm
Melanie & Rich Thomas
Peg And John Thomas
Stephen & Barbara Thomas
Elisa Thompson
Thomas & Sarah Ann Thompson
Donald Thompson
Mickey And Sweet Pea Thompson
Edward & Suzanne Thoms
Paul & Judith Thorn
Clyde & Carlin Timmons
Paul Tinkler
Walter Todd, Jr.
Mary Townsend
Kathleen Trice
Dan & Cindy Tufford
Steven Tully
Ron Urban
Skip Van Bloem
John Van Dalen
James & Norma Vanas
Jack Vander Pol
Catherine VanDerwerker
Elizabeth VanDerwerker
Greg A. & Laura S. VanDerwerker
Kent & Diane Vannier
Gene & Betty Varn
Jon and Vicki Verity
John Vernberg
Nancy Vinson
William Waldron
Stephen & Mary Walker
Dr. Thomas & Kristina Walle
Jill Waring
Gene and Elizabeth Warner
Elizabeth Warr
Sheryn and Rick Waterman
Richard Watkins
Lolita Watson
Holly Watts
John And Michele Weaver
Susan Webb
Jay Weidner
Oscar & Amy Weinmeister
Gary & Jeanne Weinreich
Robert and Robin Elise Welch
Randy Wentzel
Michael & Fran Wermuth
Edward J. & Liesl Hughes Westbrook
Alan Wheeler
Janet Wedlock & Joe Whetstone
David & Betsy Whitaker
Jim & Linda White
Susan & Tom White
William Whitehead
Davis Whitfield-Cargile
Margaret and Warren Wilczewski
John & Amelia Wilkinson
Barbara Willhoft
Benjamin F. & Ann Williamson
Zane Wilson
D. Mark & Leslie F. Wilson
John W. Wilson
Jerry Winfield
Anne P. Withers
Don & Joan Withers

Patricia Giblin Wolman
John & Sue Womack
Keith Wood
Juli Woods
Marc Wrenn
Linda Yarnell
Yaupon Garden Club
Arthur Zackrisson
Susan Zankowski
Dean Moss & Wendy Zara
Michael Zara
Stacey Zelten
Barbara Zia
Rachael Zufall

R. Alan Burrell In memory of
Katy Burrell

Jordan McDonald In memory of
James Chandler

Mike and Barbara Carakostas
In memory of Alex Marsh

Marilyn & William Blizard
In memory of Pauline Ryba

Anne and John Faul In memory of
Helen Steigerwald

The following people donated
in honor of Amy Armstrong:
Elizabeth Marlow
Anne Sinclair & Julian Ruffin
Alex & Zoe Sanders

CASE UPDATES CONTINUED



Jelly Balls Fight in Flux

On behalf of an association of Beaufort County fishermen and the Dataw Island Owners' Association, SCELPA sought to participate in defending the integrity of a Beaufort County Ordinance which restricts jelly ball harvesting and processing activities. Last month the circuit court judge denied our motion to intervene, which we appealed to the Court of Appeals. More importantly, however, the facility owner and operator decided to drop their case against the County. A hearing on the dismissal of the case is scheduled for December 3, 2015. We intend to continue to take any action necessary to protect the County's waters from degradation resulting from discharges of jelly ball processing water.

On October 18, 2015, numerous members of the Beaufort community came to the Beaufort Bash, an oyster roast hosted by Frank Roberts of Lady's Island Oysters, to support our legal efforts to protect the County's waters from jelly ball harvesting and processing and to enjoy a lovely evening on McCauley Creek. Thank you to all our guests and event sponsors for joining us for this lovely evening of food, fun, and fellowship!

TOP LEFT CLOCKWISE: SCELPA Board Member Wendy Zara enjoying Lady Island oysters at Beaufort Bash; McCauley Creek in Beaufort; SCELPA Board Member John Mark Dean and wife Robin Dean at Beaufort Bash; Supporters gathering at Beaufort Bash.; SCELPA's Amy Armstrong and Board Member Margaret Fabri and family at Beaufort Bash.

Oakridge Landfill

After a long trial in the Administrative Law Court, Judge Ralph King Anderson, III, issued an order allowing the fill of fourteen acres of wetlands in Four Holes Swamp to expand a landfill. The landfill is adjacent to Francis Beidler Forest, a large forested wetland reserve, which has been recognized for numerous awards including a National Audubon Society wildlife sanctuary and Ramsar Wetland of International Significance. Beidler Forest is also home to 1800 acres of internationally recognized old growth swamp. On November 20th, SCELPA appealed Judge Anderson's decision for failing to recognize that the landfill expansion did not meet the stringent legal standard of "no alternative" and "overwhelming public need." In a state where so much landfill capacity is already in place and a significant natural resource is at stake, this decision is contrary to both public policy and the law.

CASE UPDATES CONTINUED



Seismic Blasting

Over the summer, SCELPA filed three separate challenges in the Administrative Law Court (ALC) on behalf of Mayor Billy Keyserling and the City of Beaufort, Mayor Joe Riley and the City of Charleston, Mayor Tim Goodwin and the City of Folly Beach, Mayor Pat O'Neil and the Town of Sullivan's Island, the Coastal Conservation League and the S.C. Wildlife Federation against state authorizations for seismic testing off South Carolina's coast. All three cases were assigned to Judge Ralph King Anderson, III. DHEC issued certifications to three different Texas companies in connection with their proposals to conduct this activity off our coastline. These seismic survey projects collect data by releasing intense impulses of compressed air into the water approximately every 10-12 seconds. South Carolina's waters and coastal zone face serious threat of ecological and economic damage as a result of the proposed seismic blasting. We asked the ALC to have these cases consolidated for trial and the seismic companies are seeking to have the cases dismissed. A hearing on these motions is likely to take place in December and the ALC will rule within the following months.

Surface Water Withdrawal Act

SCELPA is fighting to keep water in South Carolina's rivers and streams and to protect the rights of riparian property owners, as well as all citizens who use and enjoy our water resources. The case is a facial challenge to the constitutionality of the Surface Water Withdrawal Act, brought on September 4, 2014, and assigned to Judge Markley Dennis in Charleston. Judge Dennis has heard several motions in the case, with the latest being cross-motions for summary judgment at a hearing on November 17, 2015. Despite thorough and extensive briefing and oral argument by SCELPA attorneys, Judge Dennis indicated that he would issue an order against the plaintiffs, who are riparian property owners. SCELPA is prepared to appeal such a decision in the coming months.

On the legislative front, House bill H.3564, introduced last session, proposes to eliminate the Act's registration process, which exempts large agricultural users from the permitting requirements. The bill was pending in the House Agriculture Subcommittee, and it remains to be seen whether it will be picked back up in the next legislative session. Meanwhile, registered surface water withdrawals have reached to 231 registrants, entitling them to take 6.2 billion gallons of water per month and 68 billion gallons of water per year from the rivers and lakes in South Carolina, without any notice or hearing rights for riparian owners downstream or the public at large.

a budget, equipment or additional staff for management my role was to visit once every month or so and make sure the preserve was still there.

Over the next few years my career path turned back to my first love - amphibians and reptiles - as I took on the role of staff Herpetologist for SCDNR. I still maintained some responsibilities with the Heritage Trust Program, including the biological assessment of potential land acquisition projects. It was in this role that I visited a number of other properties in Horry County that were slated to become Heritage Preserves. Horry County, it turns out, is very rich with wildlife and natural resources and, in many ways, unlike much of the rest of coastal SC.

Part of the process of acquiring property for a Heritage Preserve requires the legislative delegation of that county to approve the acquisition. We generally encountered little difficulty obtaining this permission and many legislators were happy to have protected land, natural areas and cultural sites located in their county. But, that wasn't the case in Horry County. I'm sure the clout of IP helped in the initial LOB acquisition, however, as we looked at more land in Horry County we began to meet resistance. After completing acquisitions along the Little Pee Dee and Waccamaw Rivers, our program was told by the Horry County legislative delegation that they would not approve any more acquisitions for fear it would impede development. At that time every Horry County legislator had a real estate license and was involved in some sort of development in the county. So, as I moved away from Heritage Trust matters to Nongame and Endangered Species matters, I left knowing that the foxes were guarding the henhouse in Horry County.

Now, here we are some 27 years past the original acquisition date for LOB and the insecurity I felt about leaving "the foxes" in charge is coming home to roost. I was never naïve enough to believe that the area around LOB wouldn't be developed, but perhaps I was naïve to think that the preserve would be safe. Unfortunately I was wrong.

In 2006 Horry County passed a one cent tax increase that would be dedicated to road and highway projects. On the list of projects was the proposed paving of In-



ternational Drive where it defines the western boundary of Lewis Ocean Bay Heritage Preserve. With any project of this magnitude there are a number of "hoops" that must be jumped through before moving forward. One included a 401 Water Quality Certification issued by DHEC, another was the permission of SCDNR which owned to the center line of this road. The 401 permit application was reviewed by a number of state agencies including SCDNR and DHEC, federal agencies including National Marine Fisheries (NMF) and U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS), and private citizens and conservation organizations including the South Carolina Environmental Law Project (SCELP) and the Coastal Conservation League (CCL).

The issues raised by all of the reviewers are well documented in two presentations, which are online at the Horry County website. These concerns focused on general wildlife, endangered and rare species and the integrity of LOB. Another major concern was the potential for vehicle collisions with black bears. During negotiations, Horry County committed to build three bear underpasses along this stretch of road and fencing that would force the bears to these underpasses. This agreement was based on the original application requesting permission to pave two lanes at this stretch of highway.

In 2010 SCDNR agreed to convey an easement over the portion of International Road to Horry County for the sum of \$10 dollars. The contract by which this ease-

ment was conveyed requires Horry County to construct three bear underpasses and fencing along International Road. This contract is a matter of public record and also details a number of other conditions agreed to by both parties. Then, in 2013 SCDNR agreed to convey an easement to Horry County on the same portion of highway that it had already agreed to convey, but this time without the requirement for any bear underpasses, only fencing. There was no objection to the increase in number of paved lanes from two to four. The 2013 agreement also required Horry County to pay SCDNR \$122,210.

I am extremely disappointed that SCDNR, the agency I spent 31 years working for, would sell out to Horry County for \$122,210 dollars. It seems inappropriate for an agency dedicated to conserving and managing South Carolina's natural resources. I'm sure there was "outside" pressure, given the amount of money at stake in future development along this highway. Even though Horry County says they have no plans at this time for such development it will happen when this road is improved.

I have previously talked about my involvement with and knowledge of Carolina Bays in general and Lewis Ocean Bay in particular. I am an ecologist by education, training and experience. My primary focus has been amphibians and reptiles, but like most of my fellow biologists at SCDNR, I am interested in and somewhat knowledgeable about wildlife in general.

(continued to page 11)

I am passionate about conservation, wildlife, Carolina Bays and our environment. Fortunately there are many who share my view, but for those who may not be certainly they are concerned with the health and well-being of themselves and their families. White-tailed deer of both sexes can range between 100 to 200 pounds in the south on average. Male black bears can range from 100 to 350 pounds, females from 100 to 250 pounds, and occasionally in areas where food is plentiful, black bear can reach 400 to 500 pounds in size. Imagine hitting a 200 to 300 pound bear at 60 miles per hour, or worse imagine one of your children or your spouse in that collision.

This is a scary but not improbable occurrence. In 2003 twenty-five bears were killed by vehicle collision in Horry County, in 2004 nineteen bears were killed and in 2011 eighteen bears were killed. I could not find statistics for other years, but it's not too far-fetched to assume those numbers hold steady for the years from 2003 through 2015, in which case approximately 234 bears were killed by vehicle collisions during that period of time. That means that at least 234 people, maybe more depending on the number of passengers, were affected by these collisions. Some may have only suffered vehicle damage but some were likely injured. It goes without saying that a collision between a vehicle and a black bear seldom ends well for anyone or anything.

The only obstacle to a black bear attempting to cross the proposed four lane highway, under the current scenario, will be fencing. According to the U.S. Department of Transportation's Best Practices Manual: Wildlife Vehicle Collision Reduction Study, fencing alone or with gaps and crosswalks was approximately 40% effective in preventing collisions. Fencing in conjunction with either underpasses or overpasses was approximately 87% effective in reducing collisions. Other studies in western states have shown that electric fences are also effective deterrents for bears and other large mammals.

It's always important to have the science to back up any assertion, but some of this is just plain common sense. Black bears can climb trees, very easily and to significant heights. Surely they can climb even a

well-designed fence. While managing Lewis Ocean Bay I encountered several bears, always walking down a road or a right-of-way, and it wasn't until they saw me that they ran off into the thick pocosin vegetation. They prefer a path that was open and fairly easy to walk. The idea behind the fence and underpass combination is that a bear will come to a fence and instead of trying to climb it immediately he will turn and walk down the fence line until coming to an open, easy to traverse path to get where he was going. If however, after walking some distance with no passageway that bear is likely to decide to go over the fence because he can't go around it. Animals navigate their world everyday and some, like black bears, navigate very large tracts of land. They are not wandering aimlessly, they know where they are going and they are going to find the easiest, quickest line from point A to point B.

I must disclose that I have not talked to anyone at DHEC, SCDNR, USFWS or Horry County about this issue, and in particular the concern over black bears. It is obvious from the comments by all natural resource agencies and conservation organizations that this is a serious concern in Horry County, which has the largest coastal plain population of bears in SC. SCDNR estimates that there are between 200 and 250 black bears, in occupied bear habitat in Horry, Georgetown and Marion Counties. While that might not seem like a lot of bears, compared to white tailed deer for example, in this case the number of bears may not be as important as the home range of black bears. Home range, for any wildlife species, is simply a measure of the extent of their movements, typically given in acres or square kilometers. When I began working with SCDNR in 1980 I was told, by knowledgeable biologists, that the home range of an adult black bear could be 10,000 acres and this was not restricted to "wilderness" but also included backyards, parks and recreation areas. We know now that the home range of an adult male black bear in coastal SC might be as much as 19,000 acres during their "active foraging" season in spring, summer and fall.

Given that there may only be 200 to 250 black bears in that three county area we might think the likelihood of a colli-

sion is small. But, we've already looked at such data for three years with an average of about 20 collisions per year for that period of time. This may very well be related to home range size, which is also an indicator of how much these animals move - apparently quite a lot.

In conclusion I believe it is fair to say that turning International Drive into a paved four-lane highway, instead of a two-



Venus Flytraps at Lewis Ocean Bay Heritage Preserve

lane highway as originally agreed, and refusing to honor the previous commitment to build three bear underpasses with fencing will result in the slow degradation of the amazing natural resources protected at Lewis Ocean Bay Heritage Preserve. Despite what anyone with Horry County might say there will be no way to control the development which will surely take place on the west side of International Drive if the project goes forward under the current plan. This will also result in a greater likelihood of bear and vehicle collisions.

The question I think everyone, in Horry County and elsewhere should ask is "how does something like this happen?" How can we have objections from natural resource agencies overridden or bought off? How can Horry County change their plans mid-project to something that was not initially approved or voted on? I think the answer is simply they thought no one was paying attention and that they could buy their way into this "new deal." Fortunately they were wrong as lots of people including CCL, SCWF and SCELPA were watching and sounded the horn. As to the County's ability to buy their way to a permit I am not so hopeful. Given the current political climate in our state and the engine of commerce that is the Grand Strand they just might accomplish that.



The Board and staff of The South Carolina Environmental Law Project wish to thank our wonderful supporters for another terrific evening celebrating our founder Jimmy Chandler and the work that continues, thanks to his vision.

A very special thanks to our Presenting Sponsor, Founders Federal Credit Union



Thanks also to the individuals, businesses and corporations whose support helped make this a record setting year for Wild Side:

Edisto: Becca and Harry Dalton



Saluda:



Carmela and Paul Haklisch • Gary C. Cooper, Sr. • Robin and John Mark Dean

Congaree: Poliakoff & Associates • Georgetown Environmental Protection Society
Margaret D. Fabri, Attorney at Law • Hayes Law Firm • Laura and Greg VanDerwerker
Environmental Permitting Consultants, Inc. • Paula Feldman and Peter Mugglestone • Senior Helpers
M. Robin Morris and Richard H. Moore • Kent Vannier at Edward Jones • Cynthia Flynn and Guy Jones
Jan and Leon Rice • W. Shannon Linning • Jane and Bob Avinger • Tammy and Jerry McGee
SCIWAY.com - South Carolina's Front Door • Callison Tighe & Robinson, LLC • Giardino Law Firm LLC

PeeDee: Paula Feldman and Peter Mugglestone • Wendy Zara and Dean Moss
Law Offices of Daniel Hunnicutt • The John & Scott Adams Family • Joseph Calandra & Murrell Timmons
Gwen and Richard Heusel • Law Offices of Sherri Lydon • Pawleys Island Outdoors
Drs. Gayle and Bill Richmond • Nancy Bracken • Sierra Club, Robert Lutz Group, Inc.
Pawleys Island Pharmacy • Coastal Conservation League • Donald Withers • Barton Law Firm, P.A.

Waccamaw: JoAnn Turnquist and Ernie Csiszar • Liz and Bill Igleheart • Alicia and Paul Barnes
Nancy and Billy Cave • Gail and Will Armstrong • Geales and John Sands • Keith LaDeaux and Amy Fabri
Brenda and Herb Lawson • Walsh Krowka & Associates • Sarah and David M. Michaux, III
Surf the Earth • Claudia and Harold Stowe • Carol and Jeff Kirby • Patty and Steve Johnson • Bill Kadlowec
Hilliard Law Firm, LLC • Kathleen and David Baptiste • Kay and Tez Bonnoitt • Jill and Barry Lieberman
Carol and Tom Anderson • Sierra Club, Robert Lutz Group, Inc. • Karen Yaniga • Joy and Dan Hitchcock
Nancy Vinson • Sharon and John Hodge

In-Kind Sponsors:

