

# The South Carolina Environmental Law Project

Lawyers for the Wild Side of South Carolina

# **WINTER 2017**

Inside this Issue

## ٦

Policy of Retreat from Beach at Critical Juncture

### 2

SCELP Expands, A Note from Michael

# 3

Policy of Retreat (continued)

4, 8, 9 Case Updates

**)** Wild Side

6,7 Donors

10 New Issue

# Solid Waste Reform, A Final Note from the Director

# POLICY OF RETREAT FROM THE BEACH AT CRITICAL JUNCTURE

**S** OUTH CAROLINA'S policy of retreat has been on the law books since 1988. The policy discourages building too close to the beach/dune system and encourages those who have built too close to it to move back. At that time our legislature recognized that rising sea levels have serious ramifications for humans and wildlife. Now we are experiencing those ramifications first hand, and the policy of retreat is being put to the test as more and more homeowners find their properties beset by high tides.

Two recent issues have arisen exemplifying this dilemma. One case involves erosion control structure on our beaches and the other involves the construction of a house seaward of the state's jurisdictional setback building lines.

In the first case, beachwalkers on Isle of Palms and Harbor Island observed that experimental plastic seawalls were obstructing the beach and interfering with sea turtle nesting. Mother sea turtles were crawling up to the seawalls, known as Wave Dissipation Systems, and then retreating back to the ocean, unable to reach nesting habitat. It should go without saying, but if houses were not built too close to the ocean, the walls would not be necessary and the sea turtles would not be impeded.

In response to this nesting interference, SCELP sent out a notice letter to federal and state agencies alerting them that these walls are a violation of the Endangered Species Act ("ESA") on behalf of the Sierra Club and the S.C. Wildlife Federation ("SCWF"). The ESA prohibits interfering with nesting and reproduction of protected species, including endangered sea turtles that return every year to lay eggs on South Carolina's beaches. In response, the South Carolina Department of Health and Environmental Regulation ("DHEC") consulted with experts and determined that the experimental seawalls should be removed because



South Carolina Environmental Law Project, Inc.

(a 501c3 tax-exempt non-profit corporation)

### **Mission Statement**

To protect the natural environment of South Carolina by providing legal services and advice to environmental organizations and concerned citizens and by improving the state's system of environmental regulation.

### **Board of Directors**

Frances Close, Chair

John M. Barton, Esquire John Mark Dean, PhD. Margaret D. Fabri, Esquire Paula Feldman, PhD. Susan Hilfer Gary W. Poliakoff, Esquire Leon Rice, Esquire Greg VanDerwerker, M.D. Nancy Vinson Wendy Zara

### Staff

Amy E. Armstrong, Executive Director Michael Corley, Upstate Coordinator & Staff Attorney Amelia Thompson, Staff Attorney Jessie A. White, Staff Attorney Filippo Ravalico, Program Manager Shannon Marcum, Office Manager

### **Main Address**

430 Highmarket Street Georgetown, SC 29440

#### **Mailing Address**

P. O. Box 1380 Pawleys Island, SC 29585 Telephone: (843) 527-0078 P. O. Box 5761, Greenville, SC 29606 Telephone: (864) 412-7921 Website: <u>www.scelp.org</u>

Printed on 100% recycled paper

### **SCELP Expands with an Upstate Office**



or the first time in our nearly thirty years of operation, SCELP has expanded beyond its home office in Georgetown. We take much pride in informing you that SCELP's Upstate Office opened on October 6, 2016 in Greenville and that it is off to a roaring start. The Upstate Office will be led by Michael Corley, who has rejoined the organization as Upstate Coordinator and

Staff Attorney. Michael served as staff attorney in the Georgetown office from 2010-2014. During his previous tenure, Michael played a key role in many significant SCELP cases, and we are thrilled to have him back as a member of the team. This move signifies an exciting new chapter in the history of SCELP.

The need for a second SCELP office is something we have contemplated as an organization for some time. While we've certainly striven to be the *South Carolina* Environmental Law Project, logistics and organizational constraints have limited our ability to fully serve the westernmost part of our state. The dire need for SCELP's services in the Upstate was reaffirmed by Michael's observations during his last two years practicing at a law firm in Greenville. The Upstate is home to the same development pressure, political shortsightedness, and general environmental disregard as in other parts of the state, but it has never been home to a public interest environmental law firm until now. Through this expansion, we will make ourselves more readily available to serve individuals, organizations and partners working to protect this area's valuable natural resources. We look forward to building the same network of partners and supporters in the Upstate as we enjoy in other parts of the state, and we welcome your assistance in spreading the word about this exciting development.



### **A Note From Michael**

could not imagine a more gratifying opportunity than the one I have now as SCELP's Upstate Coordinator. I was born and raised in the Upstate, and my passion for environmental protection originates from my enjoyment of the outdoors during those formative years. It was the Upstate landscape that stoked a passion which has shaped me personally and professionally, and I now get to work for the direct benefit of that landscape where

it all started. This is nothing short of a dream realized for me.

Since reluctantly stepping away from SCELP in order to move back to the Upstate in 2014, I've done my best to stay involved in environmental advocacy in a personal capacity. I teach as an adjunct at Furman's Shi Center for Sustainability, and I'm on the board of a couple of great Upstate environmental non-profits. However, I've continued to long for the opportunity to use my legal skills and knowledge for public environmental protection, as I had been doing at SCELP. I have to say that I always had in the back of my mind that I could one day work for SCELP in the Upstate, but I am ecstatic that the opportunity has come to fruition this soon.

### SAVE THE DATE: FEBRUARY 12, 2017 OYSTER ROAST AT BOWEN'S ISLAND RESTAURANT, CHARLESTON

### HOW YOU CAN HELP...

Your ongoing support is what keeps us going. On our website **www.scelp.org** you can learn more about our work and ways to be involved. You can donate on-line or use the enclosed envelope to mail your gift. Share your enthusiasm for SCELP with your friends and family. Thank you!

### POLICY OF RETREAT FROM BEACH AT CRITICAL JUNCTURE (continued from page 1)





PLASTIC SEAWALL RESULTS IN FALSE SEA TURTLE CRAWL

of their harmful effect on nesting sea turtles. However, the proponents of these experimental seawalls asked the DHEC Board to review this removal order, arguing that the walls should remain in place. SCELP filed a motion to intervene on behalf of Sierra Club and SCWF, which was denied by the DHEC Board. Then the Board overturned its own staff's removal order. These plastic walls may still be standing, but we are committed to fighting for their removal well before next year's nesting season. On behalf of Sierra Club and SCWF, we filed an appeal of the DHEC Board decision before the Administrative Law Court on November 9th. We are also preparing to file a federal ESA case, seeking to have these harmful walls permanently removed.

The second case involves a permit to relocate a home seaward of the state's jurisdictional setback line. A number of homes on Harbor Island now sit on the active beach, and homeowners have attempted several temporary, ineffective measures to fight back against this enduring problem, including the plastic seawalls. One homeowner on Harbor Island has proposed the step of outright moving his Harbor Island home in order to get it off of the active beach, a move which would be consistent with our state's policy of retreat. Unfortunately, though, he proposes to move it to another property where it would also be located seaward of the legally designated ocean setback line-in other words, out of the frying pan and into the fire. SCELP has challenged his proposed construction on the new lot, which required a special permit from DHEC because of its proximity to the ocean. Certainly the problem of what to do with houses that were built too close to the ocean is a difficult one to which there is no easy solution. The solution, though, is not to be found in more shortsightedness, and SCELP is to committed to involvement in cases like these so that sound policy and precedent is established in relation to this emerging problem precipitated by sea level rise.

**SIDE NOTE on the Automatic Stay:** The filing of that request for board review triggered the automatic stay, which is a due process protection in place during South Carolina administrative proceedings that preserves the status quo. In this case, the stay kept those walls up, but it also has helped us in other cases to prevent construction. The automatic stay is an important due process right for anyone impacted by agency decisions. The automatic stay has helped us to protect Captain Sams Spit, even under new and continuing tactics by developers to authorize construction. Ultimately, the automatic stay is more than a useful tool for SCELP and others in challenging permits, it is a constitutional due process right for all of the people of South Carolina.

# **CASE UPDATES**

## **Oral Arguments in PI Church**

**AST WINTER** we submitted our final briefs to the Court of Appeals in connection with our case in which we are seeking to enforce the terms of a settlement agreement. Our clients are Pawleys Island residents and parties to that agreement, which expressly preserves wetlands remaining onsite at a local church stating the protected wetland "shall remain in its natural state." Despite this contractual agreement, DHEC issued authorization to the church to impact those protected wetlands. The Administrative Law Court upheld the DHEC authorization after concluding that our clients could not enforce the agreement, even though they gave up important rights in order to obtain permanent protection for those wetlands as part of the settlement agreement. Oral arguments before the Court of Appeals took place on November 9, 2016.

# Hurricane Matthew Evidences Folly of Building on Captain Sams Spit

**E ARE CONTINUING** through the discovery process in our challenge to the permits issued by DHEC to KDP to build a steel sheetpile wall, road and associated infrastructure for 26 residential lots on Captain Sams Spit. Volumes of documents have been exchanged and numerous witness depositions taken. We have also gone on multiple site visits with our experts, Dr. Richard Porcher and Dr. Rob Young. The trial has not yet been scheduled but we anticipate it will be in early 2017. In our enduring challenge to the 2,783-ft bulkhead and 40-ft wide revetment authorized by Administrative Law Judge Tripp Anderson on remand, we submitted initial legal briefs to the Supreme Court on November 16th, who will hear the arguments on this project for a fourth time.

Meanwhile, Hurricane Matthew delivered a powerful message highlighting the unsuitability of the dynamic spit for development. Kiawah Island experienced significant erosion on its beaches with the area between Beachwalker Park and Captain Sams Inlet experiencing between 70 and 120 feet of erosion – much greater than the middle parts of the island. With historic erosion from the Kiawah River on the one side and the loss of beach and dune system on the other (as shown in the small pictures), the risks associated with development on the Spit are even more apparent and the ability to construct the needed infrastructure even more questionable.







# THE 7TH ANNUAL WILD SIDE AT HOBCAW HOUSE

OR THE SECOND YEAR in a row, a catastrophic weather event interfered with our annual celebration of the legacy of SCELP's founder, Jimmy Chandler. Unlike last year, though, we had plenty of warning about the path of Hurricane Matthew and thanks to the flexibility of the many partners involved, we managed to reschedule without any change to our program and sponsor activities. Not everyone could adjust their schedule, including a few Board members, but those who could make it to Hobcaw Barony on November 5th for our 7th Annual Wild Side were rewarded by a sunny and crisp autumn day.

Old and new friends gathered to listen to our guest speaker Jim Elliott of the Center for Birds of Prey while taking in the glorious sunset over Winyah Bay in the background. Jim spoke about the important work of the conservation community in South Carolina including the respective roles we each play in the development of solutions to critical environmental issues in the state, and further celebrated the occasion by releasing a rehabilitated red-tailed hawk. The evening proceeded under a large and carefully decorated tent, featuring a rich silent auction and a selection of food and drink offerings, including local brews from New South Brewery and dessert from Kudzu and Pawleys Island Bakery. The perfectly pitched music by the Green Levels helped bring it all together for a great experience.

As Amy reminded us during her brief remarks, next year SCELP will celebrate our 30th year of public interest legal work in defense of South Carolina's natural resources and it looks like we are going to be as busy as ever. We hope to see you and many of your friends at next year's planned events and celebration.

Thank you for sharing our concern for the natural environment of South Carolina and for supporting the Lawyers for the Wild Side.

### **OUR HEARTFELT THANKS FOR THE COMMITMENT OF THIS YEAR'S SUPPORTERS**

Foundations/Organizations

Bakker Family Fund of CCF Beaufort Fund of CCF Burden's End Fund of CCF Butler Conservation Fund Coastal Conservation League Coastal Community Foundation of SC (CCF)

Emily & Todd Abedon . Melinda Ackerman Johnny & Scott Adams Dennis & Wendy Allen Michael Allen Eugenia & Marshall Allen Lisa Allen Paul Amann A. Frederick & Rhoda Anderson William Anderson Thomas & Carol Anderson William & Barbara Anderson Sandra Anderson Arlene Bowers & Stuart Andrews Mitchell Sadoff & Nancy Appel Doc Ardrey Susan & Al Arentsen Alicia Armstrong William & Melanie Armstrong William & Gail Armstrong **Reed Armstrong** Amy Armstrong Marguerite Assey Robert & Jane Avinger, Jr. **Emily Bailey** Frances Jo Baker Chuck & Betsy Baker Sandra Ballington Kathy Bancroft Kathy & David Baptiste Paul & Alicia Barnes Garland & Donna Barr Brent Barron John & Barbara Barton Susan Bateman Peter Baumann Rick Baumann Franklin & Rae Jean Beattie Marianne Beaver Frank & Ranlet Bell Joyce Bell Colin & Ann Bentley Stephen Berman Charles Biddix Ruth Leal & Michael Bivona Laurie Bixler Renee Black Margaret Blackmer Kay & Tez Bonnoitt Dirck & Emelie Born J. Hartley & Dorothy Bowen Frances Boyd William Boyd James & Frances Boyd Emma Boyer William & Elizabeth Brabson Nancy Bracken James M. & Marian Brailsford Carlysle Brandon Emily Branscome Norie Bregman William Shehan & Lee Brockington Eric & Lynn W. Brown Nancy & Wesley Brown

Rob Brown Bob & Susan Brown Bill & Mary Bryan Sandra Bundy Sara Buraess Barbara Buraess Ross & Carol Burgess R. Alan Burrell Kenneth & Linda Button Robert Cain Joseph Calandra Sheri Calandra Darlene Adams & Michael Cameron Paul Capron Cornelia Carrier Lindy Carter Phillip J. & Courtney M. Cavatoni Nancy & Billy Cave William & Anne Chandler Penny Christensen Julie Christopher John Claggett Richard E. & Linda G. Clapp Malcolm Clay Ron & Margaret Claypool Thomas Waldrep Clements Frances Close John & Denise Collins Gary Cooper Anne & Bruce Cottle Janice Coward Glenn Cox Nancy Cregg James & Alice Cromartie Theodore & Alice Crook Malcolm Crosland Richard L. & Barbara D. Cross William Crosswell Pierce R. & Joanna Culliton James H. & Marianne D. Currie Colin & Sally Cuskley Harry Dalton J. Howard & Kay M. Daniel **Beverly Daniel** Harry & Luanne Davakos Reggie & Sudie Daves Jonathan Davidson Danny Davis Rebecca Davis John Mark & Robin Dean Amelia Dias Stephen & Roseanne Dixon Paul & Mary Donnelly Gloria Douglass S. Kimble Duckworth William Dufford Walter & Irene Duhaime Maggie Dunlap Ann Marie & Michael Dwyer Sherod Eadon Walter & Nela Edgar Judith Edwards Carter Elliott Sandra Elliott

Frances P. Bunnelle Foundation Funds for the Arts of CCF Gaylord and Dorothy Donnelley Foundation Harriet and Herbert Keyserling Endowment Henry M. Blackmer Foundation, Inc. Hilton Head Audubon Society

> Ann Elliott Jim Elliott Carol Brittain Ervin Phyllis Ewing Jon & Maraaret Fabri Amy Fabri Mary Fairbanks Renzo & Nancy M. Falcinelli Jean Marie Neal & Greg Farmer John & Anne Faul Hartmut & Mary Jo Fege Peter Mugglestone & Paula Feldman Robert & Mary Feller Gerich Fellermann Sally Field George Finly Maggie & Chuck Ford Dottie Forester Walter E. & Mary R. Fortuna John P. & Nancy K. Freeman A.S. & G.E. Frierson **Beverly Frost** Stephen & Sallie Fuerth Zackery Furr Derek & Inger Fyfe **Fielding Gallivan** Cheryl Garnant Elva Stinson & Basil Garzia Gary Gates George R. & Elizabeth Geer Laney Gibbes Nancy Gibbes Steve & Joy Gibson Steve Gilbert Craig & Sharon Gilman Ben & Jerry Gimarc S. Annette Goings Max Gore Rajan & Suman Govindan Fllen Gower Susan & Scott Graber Robert Grant Jonathan Green John M. & Rhonda C. Grego William R. Griffin T. Compton Groff Nancy Barton & Bob Guild Michael & Claire Gwyn Paul R. & Nancy Hadley David & Elizabeth Hagood Paul & Carmela Haklisch Martha Hamel Michael & Terry Hannon Michael Hannon Anne Hardee Robin Hardin Bill & Eleanor Hare Elizabeth Hargrave Betty & John Haring Zenobia Harper Karen Harper Richard & Jamie Harpootlian Suzanne Harris John & Mildred Hart

The Joanna Foundation Legatus Foundation Sierra Club - Robert Lunz Group Sierra Club - SC Chapter Sierra Club - William Bartram Group Three Swallows Foundation

Heather Hartung Janet & Bill Hassell Daryl G. & Susanne Hawkins Bernie Hawkins Lewis Hay Jean & Boo Hayes Clarke & Virginia Hayes John Havnes Robert Hendricks Richard Hendry W.J. Hennessy, Jr. Fred Herrmann Beverly Diamond & Edwin Hettinger Gwen & Richard Heusel Robert & Carla Higgins Susan Hilfer Joy Clark & Daniel Hitchcock Stephen & Susan Hoffius Fred Holland Robin & Lawrence Holliday Linda Holsapple John & Wendy Holschuh Norm Shea & Amy Horwitz Linda & Woody House John Thomas & Peg Margaret Howell Meg Hoyle Thomas & Lily Grace Hudson David Huguenin Daniel & Laura Hunnicutt Joseph & Katherine Hunter **Charles Hunter** Avis Hutchinson John & Paulette Hynes Bill & Elizabeth Igleheart Joseph & Cheryl Issac Bo lves Suzanne Jackman Ricky C. & Nancy R. James Susan James Allen & Mary Jeffcoat Diane & Bill Jelinek Mark Tompkins & Trish Jerman Gordon Johnson Steve & Patty Johnson Joy Johnson Elizabeth Joiner Margie Jones Cynthia Flynn & Guy Jones Susan T. & John A. Joseph William Kadlowec Stan Karmilovich David Whiteman & Natalie Kaufman Virginia Kelly Ronald Sobczak & Kathleen Kempe Bailey Kendrick Paul & Maura Kenny Linda & Larry Ketron Billy Keyserling Adam Kirby Carol & Jefferson Kirby Fred Klare Harold A. Kline Ronald & Denise Klizek Frederick & Linda Klotz

Tom & Mary Kohlsaat Trisha & Russ Kometer John & Carol Kososki John & Katherine Kotz Jane Kramer Hobart W. & Carol B. Kraner Bill & Nancy Kreml G. Theodore Davis & Kristin Kron Tom & Susan Krowka Thomas & Wendy Kulick Montague & Ann Laffitte Anne Lake Charles G. & Virginia Lane Erik & Caitlin Lang Kenneth & Peggy Anne Lantelme David & Marilyn Larach Brenda & Herb Lawson Wood Lay Malcolm & Jeanette Leaphart W. E. & Diane Z. Lehder Jane Lemmon Ross & Katherine Lenhart Richard Brice & Clara J. Leonard Robin Leverton Mary Mangum & Lanneau D. Lide Sandy Linning Rose & Chip Linton Langdon & Jessie Long Justin Lucey Adrienne Lustig Bonnie Luthy Robert & Evelyn Manetta Michael & Joanne Marcell Aldo and Susy Marchioni Henry Nechemias & Valerie G. Marcil Shannon Marcum Jimmy & Terri Martin Susan Martin Pamela & Bill Martin Katherine Matthews Melanie & Thomas Mauldin Bob Maxwell Ronald Maxwell Charlie & Jo Mayer Sarah Mayse Lee & Mary C. McBride Mitzi & Arnie McClure Claudia McCollough Christe McCoy-Lawrence Judith McElynn Sally McGarry Jerry & Tammy McGee John McGue Eileen McGuffie L. Henry McKellar Michael F. Kohl & Jane A. McLamarrah Ian & Goffinet McClaren Janet Swigler & Jim McMahan Garland P. McWhirter Barbara & Charles Measter Jerry Meyer Jr David & Sarah Michaux Miles Hayes & Jacqueline Michel Sara Michelin

Susan Middaugh Stone Miller Don & Jo Miller Tee Miller Jay & Jennifer Mills David & Tina Mims Ann Mithoefer Elizabeth Jayne Moffatt Boulton & Peggy Mohr Perry & Marlene Molinoff Valerie Moliterno Jean Moody Laura W. & Tyre H. Moore Stephen Moore Robin Morris & Richard Moore Suzanne & David Moorhead Robert Moran Kat Morgan Alice Morrisey James & Susan Morton Paul & Jane Ann Mougey Joseph Mueller Mary Katherine Muller Charles & Patricia Munson Thomas M. & Sally R. Murphy Richard & Suzanne Myers William Naylor Phillis Newman Rebecca Niemiec Bob & Kim Noe Franklin Nutter Larry & Illene Olanoff Lucinda Olasov James & Lynn ONeal Coleman & Virginia Owens Thomas & Betty Owens Joseph & Christie Owens David Oyster Bill Paddock Charles Keith & Ann Palmer Justin Park Sarah Parker Kathy and Steve Parks Debra & Ted Passia Erin Hardwick Pate Denise Patrick Frazier & Katherine Patrick Hayes Patterson Dawn Patton Annette Perreault Lloyd & Linda Peterson Pamela Peterson Victoria Phillips Scott Phillips Sean Phelan Linda Pierce Joe & Joy Pinson Todd & Barbara Plaxco T. Carroll Player Gary Poliakoff Harry & Patricia Polychron Jennifer Pope **Richard Porcher** Dwayne Porter Kathleen Post Sara Lynn & Jan Postma Cynthia Swanson Powell Dave Power Michael Powers Susan Pretty Michael & Virginia Prevost Norris & Lucy Preyer Mary & Kevin Prince William Prioleau Ward & Karen Pritchett John & Judy Purcell David Quick Gary & Sheila Quigley

Robert E. & Sandra H. Quinn Augusta Quirk Joey & Stacy Rabon Sarah Rand-McDaniel Lowell & Martha Dee Rausch Filippo & Lauren Ravalico Arthur Ravenel Robert P. & Ann L. Rebhan J. Michael Reh Russell Reinhardt Bill & Sheila Riat Leon & Jan Rice Pete & Elizabeth Richards Frances J. & Arthur L. Rickenbaker Fred Riesen, Jr. Henry F. Rivers Douglas Robinson Samuel H. & Sara Beth Rosen Leila Ross Gillian Roy William Rozo Anne Sinclair & Julian Ruffin Captain E Russell Henry Sanders Margaret Sands Ardis Savory Paige Sawyer Frank M. & Elizabeth O. Sawyer Hal Currey & Margaret Schachte Jerry Schulze Charlotte Caldwell & Jeffrey Schutz Kathryn Schwartz **Geoffrey Scott** Al & Mary Segars Kathryn W Sharp Norm & Linda Sharp Lee Shelton Albert Mack & Marilyn Shup Janice S. & T. Grange Simons, V Wilson & Ann M. Sims Robert & Lillian Slovic Roy & Carol Smith Dean L. & Rita G. Smith Ryan & Erin Smith Karen Sundberg & Erik Smith Charles Smith Harry Smithson George & Barbara Smyth Philip Snead James Snyder Elizabeth Spence Lisa Wagner & Tim Spira John Springs Fred & Alice Stanback, Jr. **Bill Stanfield** Ann & Walter Stanton Gene & Elaine Starr Sandy Stephan Todd & Janet Stephenson Faye Steuer Terry Stone Harold & Claudia Stowe Chris & Eric Strobel Kristina & Bill Strosnider Robert Struble **Richard Stuhr** James & Susan Sullivan Charles Summerall Justin C Sutton Reed Swearingen Charles & Squeaky Swenson Michael Swomley Joe Sykes Edward & Laura Szweda Jody & Anne Tamsberg Ronny Tanner David Teems Bo Terry

Stephen & Barbara Thomas William & Jacqueline Thomas Rich & Melanie Thomas Thomas & Sarah Ann Thompson Amelia Thompson Elisa Thompson Paul & Judith Thorn John Baynes & Suzanne Thorpe John Tiencken Michael Tighe June Todd Walter Todd, Jr. Mary Townsend Sheila Trayte Dan & Cindy Tufford Jerry Tupacz Sharon Turner Gary Uhlemeyer Ron Urban Skip Van Bloem John Van Dalen James & Norma Vanas Stacy & Jack Vander Pol Greg & Laura VanDerwerker Kent & Diane Vannier Gene & Betty Varn Frank John Vernberg James & Susan Vinson Nancy Vinson Laurie Baker Walden Stephen & Mary Walker Thomas & Kristing Walle Jill Waring E Warner Richard Watkins Mary & Jim Watkins Lolita Watson Holly Watts Susan Webb Richard & Amy Webb Gary & Jeanne Weinreich Robert & Anne Weir Robert & Robin Welch Otto & Elvira Wemmer Randy Wentsel Janet Wedlock & Joe Whetstone Elizabeth Betsy & David Whitaker Susan & Tom White Jim & Linda White Jessie White Evander Whitehead Elizabeth Wiley John & Amelia Wilkinson Amy Willbanks Alan & Sandra Williams Bo Wilson Zane Wilson Jeff & Sarah Wilson Leslie Wilson Jerry Winfield D. Reid Wiseman Joan Withers John & Sue Womack Keith Wood Randy & Amelia K. Wood Susan Felder & Marc Wrenn Karen Yaniga Linda Yarnell Frank & Lorraine Yelinko Arthur Zackrison John & Sue Zankowski Dean Moss & Wendy Zara Barbara Zia Patricia Zincke Rachael Zufall

Scott & Laura Kinsey in Memory of Nan Campbell

Marguerite Assey, Erik & Caitlin Lang, and Jordan McDonald in Memory of James Chandler

Rowena Nylund in Memory of Tolly Courson

Dottie D'Ambrosio in Memory of Chip D'Ambrosio

Barbara & Mike Carakostas in Memory of Alex Marsh

Dean L. & Rita G. Smith in Memory of Ed Morgan

Marilyn & William Blizard in Memory of Pauline Ryba

Gene & Elaine Starr in Memory of Luckey Sanders

W. E. & Diane Z. Lehder, Joe Dillard, Jim & Jo Eisenhauer, David & Marilyn Larach, Craig Livingston, Howard & Jane Mooney, Greg & Laura VanDerwerker in Memory of Michael Wermuth

Bruce & Judith M. Coull in Honor of Dennis Allen

Jonathan Buchan, Gerald & Linda Harmon, William & Jerry McAninch in Honor of Amy Armstrong

Paul & Deborah Shea in Honor of William Armstrong

John Baynes & Suzanne Thorpe in Honor of John Barton

Jon & Margaret Fabri in Honor of Henry Fabri

Emily Johnston in Honor of Margaret Fabri

Patricia Doyle in Honor of Gary Gates

Charles & Patricia Munson in Honor of Peg Margaret Howell

Ann Dibble in Honor of Catherine Inabnit

J.P. & Jane Lemmon Moore in Honor of William Lemmon

Bill & Nancy Kreml in Honor of Betty Mandell

Gordon Fleming in Honor of Isabel Rozo

Walter E. & Mary R. Fortuna in Honor of John O. & Geales Gavin Sands

John Mark & Robin Dean and Clyde & Carlin Timmons in Honor of Robert Schofield

Debra Stokes in Honor of Grace & Isabelle Stokes

The Tilden and Huffines Families in Honor of Michael Murphy

# UPDATES Bays and Bears

UR EFFORTS TO PROTECT the world's largest complex of Carolina Bays, along with core habitat for our beleaguered coastal black bear population, have been a rollercoaster ride. The habitat is encompassed in Lewis Ocean Bay Heritage Preserve, which is given the state's highest designation for valuable and unique habitat under the Heritage Trust Act. When the Act was passed, heritage trust property could not be transferred or given to the government for a road project. The Act was amended in 2009 to allow DNR to give away heritage trust property for infrastructure projects, no doubt at the behest of those who want to build roads through those properties like Horry County.

When it came to paving International Drive, Horry County knew it had an even more difficult obstacle due to the nature and designation of Lewis Ocean Bay Heritage Preserve. DNR initially refused to allow the County to build a road through the Preserve at all, but eventually relented on the condition that Horry County implement measures to maintain habitat continuity for the coastal black bear population in 2010. The primary measure was installation of wildlife passages. Wildlife passages have been used throughout the U.S. and the world to allow animals to safely cross roads, and their effectiveness is well-documented. Google wildlife passages or crossings, you will be amazed by their prolific use for a variety of species, including for the Florida Panther, deer, bears, and even penguins!

But as the rest of the world advances, Horry County insists on maintaining an outdated and short-sighted approach to road projects. The County enlisted former Representative Nelson Hardwick (who pled guilty to assault and battery earlier this year) to pressure DNR to relent from the requirement for wildlife underpasses. Why you may ask. During discovery the only reason we found was because DOT Chairman Mike Wooten, whose engineering firm was hired to design the road, "in his mind" did not think they were necessary. Of course, that mindset contradicts all of the scientific literature on the topic.

DNR's attorney who handled the negotiations testified that Hardwick "browbeat" DNR into releasing the County from the single measure that made the idea of sealing off LOB with a fourth road bearable. The County reneged on the passages, and DNR succumbed to political influence.

There can be no doubt that the 5-lane highway will fragment high quality habitat, disrupt movement patterns of black bears, and convert 22 acres of heritage trust property into road. Cumulatively, the road would be the nail in the coffin for LOBHP, leaving it as an isolated island of habitat, surrounded on all sides by major highways and development.

Despite this evidence, on July 23, 2016, Administrative Law Judge Ralph K. Anderson, III upheld the DHEC authorizations of the paving project. Judge Anderson also reached a troubling legal conclusion that essentially renders meaningless DHEC's involvement in this Clean Water Act (CWA) permit process. We have appealed the ALC's ruling to the S.C. Court of Appeals and are in the process of preparing our legal briefs.

Shortly after receiving the ALC's Order, on August 22, 2016, Horry County issued a press release announcing that it had begun construction. On behalf of the Coastal Conservation League and the S.C. Wildlife Federation, the SCELP team quickly jumped into action and filed a federal lawsuit challenging the Army Corps of Engineers' decisions authorizing the project. We also filed a motion to immediately halt Horry County's construction work, which led to a restraining order. The order enjoined Horry County from filling wetlands and doing any work on the LOB side of the road for nearly two months. On November 17, the Judge reversed course and denied our motion for a preliminary injunction, allowing the filling and destruction activities to resume. We have also asked the state Court of Appeals to prevent further construction and are assessing options; however this case has reinforced that we must continue to shine a light on the actions of those who seek to destroy our state's natural resources.

# CASE UPDATES (continued)

### Surface Water Withdrawal Act

**Solution CELP'S LAWYERS** are preparing for oral arguments before the state's highest court on December 1st in our challenge to the constitutionality of the Surface Water Withdrawal Act. Upon completion of our appellate briefing on September 27th, the Supreme Court scheduled arguments quickly. We are pleased that this case is receiving the swift and serious consideration that it deserves.

As you may recall from our previous updates, the Surface Water Withdrawal Act has a registration process that allows



large agricultural users who take over three million gallons of water per month from our rivers and streams to bypass any permitting requirements. The Act does not cap the amount of water that can be taken on a monthly or annual basis, and protects those agricultural users from having any limits enforced upon them by the state agency. Instead, the Act leaves the state, and downstream users, powerless to protect our precious rivers, which are held in trust for public use. We are asking the Court to overturn the unconstitutional registration process so that the state of South Carolina can regain control of these public trust waterways and downstream users can protect their interests in maintaining water flow past their properties.

# **QUESTIONS & ANSWERS**



**Melanie Ruhlman** is one of SCELP's clients in our challenge to the Surface Water Withdrawal Act. She is a water resources specialist by trade, and she also serves as president of Save Our Saluda, a nonprofit watershed organization.

**SCELP:**Tell us about your personal connection to the effects of unchecked surface water withdrawal.

**Melanie**: Living along the North Saluda River in upper Greenville County and kayaking other rivers in our region gives me firsthand exposure to the effects of competing water uses and their impacts. This is very apparent in drought times like we are currently experiencing.

SCELP: What sort of impacts are you referring to?

**Melanie:** From June through August, there were eight days in which I counted dead fish in our river. Upstream from us there are withdrawals for drinking water and agricultural irrigation that have altered natural river flows and contribute to stressful conditions for aquatic life during dry periods when water demand is high. And when it stops raining, we can only paddle dam-controlled rivers with recreational releases. SCELP: How bad is the problem, in your experience?

**Melanie**: Hydrologic alteration due to the effects of water withdrawals, dams, and land use change is extensive here and elsewhere across the U.S. and may be a primary cause of impairment in river and stream ecosystems. For example, in the upper Reedy River, urbanization has led to a declining trend in river baseflow levels, which are the normal flows between storm events. The Reedy is now so low that during summer months, over half of the river below Greenville is composed of treated wastewater. The proportion is even higher during drought.

**SCELP:** Why do we hear so much more about water quality problems stemming from pollutants, than about water quantity?

**Melanie**: Many people don't give a thought to water quantity, as long as they can turn on the faucet. There is a common misconception that we have a seemingly endless supply of water here in South Carolina and that it will always be there. Water quality problems stemming from spills or pollutant discharges from the end of a pipe are more tangible and more easily attract public attention. We are learning that water quantity and quality issues often cannot be separated.

**SCELP:** Thanks for your input and for your personal contribution to this very important case!



### **Bucksport Marina Authorized Amidst Flooding**

HILE THE RURAL COMMUNITY of Bucksport in Horry County was being evacuated due to flooding of the Waccamaw and Pee Dee Rivers following Hurricane Matthew, DHEC issued a permit to Grand Strand Water and Sewer Authority (GSWSA) to construct an industrial marine commerce park at the site of the existing marina in Bucksport. The industrial park would support boat building and related services, threatening water quality, air quality and quality of life of the residents of the area who raised serious concerns with and objections to the project. The project will also directly impact the livelihoods and operations of local businesses in the outdoor recreation and tourism industry. The site is located immediately west of the Waccamaw National Wildlife Refuge on the banks of the Waccamaw River. We have filed two requests with the DHEC Board to review staff's decision authorizing this dubious proposal, one on behalf of the Coastal Conservation League, Waccamaw Riverkeeper/Winyah Rivers Foundation and Pastor Don Gause, a Bucksport resident, and the other on behalf of Gator Bait Adventure Tours, which leads guided kayak tours on the river and within the Refuge year-round.





### Throw it Away: The Need for Solid Waste Reform in South Carolina

### **THE SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT ACT** has not been reformed since 1991. Its passage was contentious, but even so, DHEC is brave enough to revisit the Act because change is needed, badly. The main issue is one of enforcement. Unfortunately, South Carolina is home to businesses who take in recyclable materials, ranging from plastic bottles to concrete, and let those materials pile up without processing them in a timely manner. These businesses then dissolve, leaving what is essentially an unpermitted open air landfill.

Under the current law, DHEC has little enforcement power to make these businesses process the recyclables. While true recycling facilities need not go through the permitting process for landfills, bad actors who are not actually recycling these materials must be held accountable. Thus, SCELP and a coalition of stakeholders have formed a workgroup to provide legal and technical expertise and advice on drafting effective legislative language. The proposed amendments to the Solid Waste Management Act will also include establishing a solid waste emergency fund, and clarifying confusing or inapplicable language throughout the Act. Keep an eye out for the bill, which DHEC hopes to introduce in the next legislative session.

### A FINAL NOTE FROM THE DIRECTOR



2016 is not over yet and has already been a historic and incredibly busy year for SCELP. As we brace for major changes on federal climate change and environmental policies, I want to share a passage on "respecting failure" by Duke Law Professor Jedediah Purdy, in the chapter aptly named Environmental Law in the Anthropocene from his 2015 book After Nature.

One might imagine, then, learning to see the global atmospheric system, the interwoven patterns of currents and winds, seasons and climatic regions, as something beautiful. It makes a world suited for human life, a world in which we have learned to live. It is the condition of all our homelands and home landscapes: the seasons we knew as children, the crops that show up in local markets, the wild animals glimpsed at

the edge of the yard or during a hike. The question to ask about greenhouse gases, in this light, would be not whether they move the planet off a natural baseline, let alone whether they pollute, but whether they tend to mar the beauty of a system that, for all its inherent perturbations, describes a set of rough balances that we have come to find beautiful. Alternatively, but not incompatibly, the global atmosphere might come to seem sublime: a brooding, powerful source of threat, beyond our complete understanding, out of the scale of our control, able to disrupt our familiar worlds and make us aware of human smallness and fragility ... Both treasuring beauty and feeling awe at sublimity are ways of respecting an order of things, and of valuing motives to act so as to uphold it, to recognize the limits it might enforce.

Our conservation endeavors and public interest advocacy are inspired by this vision. We also believe that the rule of law is key to fostering this kind of imagination that will ultimately prevail over any deviation toward the ugliest and basest realities of fossil fuel profiteering and natural resources exploitation.

In wishing you and your families good health, peace and much love during the holidays season, I thank you for standing with a beautiful and sublime South Carolina.



### **Thanks to our Corporate and Friends and Family Sponsors:**

Golden Eagle:



Harry Dalton Gary C. Cooper Sr. LIVE

South Carolina

**Barred Owl:** 

Swallow-tailed Kite:



Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP



Georgetown County Environmental Protection Society, Tammy and Jerry McGee

**Red-tailed Hawk:** Callison Tighe • Margaret Fabri Law • Jan and Leon Rice • Cynthia Flynn and Guy Jones Jon and Margaret Fabri • Diane and Kent Vannier • M. Robin Morris and Richard H. Moore • Senior Helpers Poliakoff & Associates • Laurie Walden • Barbara and John Barton • SCIWAY.com • New South Brewery Law Offices of Daniel Hunnicutt • Research Planning, Inc. • Pawleys Island Pharmacy • Pawleys Island Beach Service

 Black Vulture: Coastal Conservation League • John and Scott Adams • Lily Grace and Tom Hudson Wendy Zara and Dean Moss • Coastal Staffing Services, LLC • Nancy Bracken • Polymer Ventures Cynthia Swanson • Laura and Greg VanDerwerker • Alicia and Paul Barnes • Nancy Vinson Carol and Tom Anderson • Martha L. Hamel Attorney • Joseph Calandra and Murrell Timmons
Bill Kadlowec • Sierra Club - Robert Lunz Group • The Tilden and Huffines Families in Honor of Michael Murphy

Peregrine Falcon: Gwen and Richard Heusel • Amy Fabri • Billy and Nancy Cave • Carol Kirby Bill and Liz Igleheart • Tez and Kay Bonnoit • Karen D. Yaniga • Patty and Steve Johnson Nancy Appel and Mitchell Sadoff • Kris and Bill Strosnider • Gail and Will Armstrong Claudia and Harold Stowe • Anne Sinclair and Julian Ruffin • Sarah and David M. Michaux III Susan Hilfer • Mary Prince • Sandy Linning • Suzanne Thorpe • Rob and Cari Grant • Bruce and Holly Watts Peg Howell and John Thomas • Ted and Alice Crook • Tupacz Fine Wine & Liquors • Zachary Furr Dan and Joy Hitchcock • David and Kathleen Baptiste • Jane and Bob Avinger • Charles and Squeaky Swenson John and Susan Joseph • Sheri Calandra

In-Kind Sponsors:

